



Cluster evaluation of projects in the area of technical and vocational education and training in Ghana, Liberia and Sierra Leone

Terms of Reference

1. Introduction

This evaluation is designed as a cluster evaluation and will assess four projects that are active in the field of technical and vocational education and training (TVET) run by three partner organisations of Bread for the World. Cluster evaluations are an evaluation format promoted by Bread for the World to encourage cross-project learning and exchange among partner organisations and to promote a culture of evaluation within the organisation while also deepening discussions about different project approaches at Bread for the World.

The projects to be evaluated focus on providing skills training to selected youth and facilitating their transition into employment to an income in Liberia, Sierra Leone and Ghana.

The projects are implemented by the affiliate organisations Liberia Opportunities Industrialization Center, Inc. (**LOIC**), the Sierra Leone Opportunities Industrialization Center (**SLOIC**) and by the Opportunities Industrializations Centres, Ghana (**OICG**).

The first project is implemented by the Liberia Opportunities Industrialization Center, Inc. (**LOIC**). The Liberia Opportunities Industrialization Center Inc, is an affiliate of the Opportunities Industrialization Center Inc. in Philadelphia USA. Liberia-OIC is the largest indigenous Nongovernmental Skills training organization in Liberia and has operated for over 40 consecutive years providing basic skills training and support services to disadvantaged youths of the Liberian society.

Since the inception of LOIC in September 1977, over 50,000 individuals have been trained in Agriculture science, Vocational & Technical skills and Small enterprise development in addition to Trauma counseling, Peace building activities, Job placement, Resettlement/ Reintegration and Follow-up services.

The second project is implemented by the Sierra Leone Opportunities Industrialization Center (**SLOIC**). SLOIC was established in 1976 through grant support from the United States Agency for International Development (USAID). It is a non-profit community-based, legally constituted, non-governmental, human resource development organization with focus on TVET to poor and marginalized youths particularly women and girls.

The third and fourth projects are implemented by the Opportunities Industrializations Centres, Ghana (**OICG**). OICG was established in April 1970 as an affiliate of Opportunities Industrialization Centres International, USA, as a Non-Governmental Organization (NGO), a

company limited by guarantee under the Companies Code of Ghana, 1963 (Act 179). OICG became fully operational in Accra in July 1971, serving as the first Vocational Skills Training and Job Placement Centre for the Youth in Africa. From its first training centre established in 1971 in Accra, OICG now has extended its vocational and technical training programmes to the Ashanti and Western regions (i.e. Kumasi and Sekondi Takoradi Training Centres). Depending on the target group, OICG adopts two main strategies in providing skills training to the youth. OICG Centre Based program mainly earmarks literate youth. The OICG improved apprenticeship was developed to provide access for the non-literate and semi-literate youth into OICG training programs. Trainings under this approach are delivered at the workshop sites of selected master crafts persons. Business Development and Graduates Follow up Services is a well thought out strategy which is focused-business counseling to graduates. The objectives are to: facilitate the process for trainees' transition from skills acquisition to starting their businesses or entering into wage employment and, assist project graduates to be competitive on the market and to grow their businesses.

Bread for the World is the globally active development agency of the Protestant churches in Germany. Bread for the World supports partner organisations to work with poor and marginalised people around the world in an effort to improve their living standards. The focus of the work is on food security, provision of education and health, respect for human rights and the integrity of creation. Through lobbying, advocacy and educational work in Germany and Europe, it seeks to influence political decisions in favour of the poor and raise awareness of the need for sustainable living standards and economic activities. Bread for the World is a supporting partner in this cluster evaluation, providing technical knowhow and guidance to the evaluation process.

2. Subject of the evaluation: Four projects active in the field of technical and vocational education and training

The four projects to be assessed in this evaluation are linked through related objectives, indicators and target groups.

The LOIC Project “Non-Formal Vocational Skills Training, Psychosocial Rehabilitation and Job Creation Program” has been implemented since March 2019 and will run until April 2022.

Objective 1: Young people earn sufficient income from self-employment as salaried employees after completing their vocational training.

Indicators for objective 1

1. At least 70% of the trainees have successfully completed their vocational training.
2. At least 60% of them have opened their own small businesses or are employed within one year after their training.
3. Employed former trainees earn at least 80% of their necessary incomes through their employment.

Objective 2: The training programs provide trainees with the best possible preparation for their chosen occupational fields.

Indicators for objective 2:

1. The teaching staff regularly takes part in further training courses and workshops to deepen their knowledge.
2. The eight (8) curriculums are optimized and in line with current developments in the respective occupational sectors.

The project targets 1,950 trainees (50% female) from diverse backgrounds who are being trained in various crafts. The project is being implemented in three different training centres. The training centre in Monrovia targets 1,200 youths, the center in Gbarnga targets 750 youths. The training center in Buchanan equally targets 750 young people.

The SLOIC Project “Vocational Training and other support measures for young people in the phase of consolidation of peace” has been implemented since February 2019 and will run until January 2022.

Objective: To build the capacity of 2,000 vulnerable and less privileged youths at least 1,200 females through entrepreneurial skills and Job placement activities.

Indicators:

1. At the end of the project, 2,000 youths (projected beneficiaries) are trained in entrepreneurial and job skills and at least 90% of the project beneficiaries should have successfully completed their vocational training.
2. One year after graduation, at least 60% of the graduates have opened their own business or are gainfully employed of which 50% of them are women and girls. Also, the capacities of some Vocational trainers are built and strengthened in line with job market trends.
3. The trained project beneficiaries that are job placed are able to generate at least 80% of their needed income to support themselves and their families.

The project targets 2000 disadvantaged youths and young adults (1200 of them female) in 12 different occupations.

The OICG Project in Takoradi “Livelihood Enhancement for Youth in the Takoradi Metropolis through Improved Apprenticeship (OICG/BfdW Project Phase III)” has been implemented since July 2018 and will run until June 2021.

Project Objective 1: Disadvantaged youth manage to start their professional career.

Indicators for Objective 1:

1. 250 unskilled youth (including 60% females) have successfully completed their apprenticeship.
2. Self-esteem of graduates has been strengthened considerably (compared to the beginning of their apprenticeship)
3. 200 project graduates (including 60% females) are either self-employed or wage-employed in their vocational field six months after their graduation and remain in employment until the end of the project period.

Project Objective 2: The socio-economic situation of former and present graduates of the apprenticeship programme has improved

Indicators for Objective 2:

1. 100 graduates (self- and wage-employed, including 60% females) are able to meet at least 50% cost of basic needs by generating income in their vocational field.
2. 75 self-employed graduates are able to reinvest part of their profit in business and save part with Micro Finance Institution.
3. 40 wage-employed graduates are able to meet 100% cost of basic needs in their vocational field and further save part of their income with Micro Finance Institution.

Project Objective 3: Additional youth receive a better quality of apprenticeship through the upscaling of essential elements of OICG's improved apprenticeship.

Indicators for Objective 3:

1. 40 former project graduates in own business transfer trade skills to a further 80 apprentices.
2. 10 traditional master crafts persons who are not involved in the regular improved apprenticeship programme adopt essential elements of OICG's improved apprenticeship at their workshop sites.

The project targets

- 70 graduates who completed apprenticeship in the phase II of the project
- 50 self-employed graduates with a minimum net monthly income of GH¢500.00
- 300 unskilled youth (40% males and 60% females) to be trained in various trades (18-35 yrs, Takoradi or adjoining urban community, priority given to females, single mothers, HIV/ AIDS orphans and vulnerable children, disabled persons)
- 60 master crafts persons (50 regular MCP to be trained plus 10 additional MCP to adopt essential elements of OICG's improved apprenticeship at their workshops).

The OICG project in Kumasi "Improving Income Generating Capacity of Selected OICG/ BfdW Graduates Project (IIGC)" has been implemented only since October 2020 and will run, like the other OICG project, until June 2021.

Objective: Professional competencies of project graduates are enhanced by the further training measures

Indicators:

1. 60% of 260 self-employed graduates earn additional income due to their further training provided with additional and emerging skills
2. 20 electrical engineering graduates are certified by the Ghanaian Energy Commission (Domestic wiring)

The project targets

475 youth (males = 30%, females = 70%)

- 400 project graduates (260 self-employed graduates, thereof 58 males and 202 females; 20 self-employed graduates of Electricals; 120 additional project beneficiaries: 13 unemployed, 37 mobilizing resources, 24 furthering training, 46 beneficiaries of the current phase who will be completing training in September 2020)

- 75 centre-based trainees (males = 40%, females = 60% mainly of dressmaking, catering, and electricals; aged between 18 and 27 years)

3. Objectives of the cluster evaluation

The general idea of a cluster evaluation is that two or more projects are assessed with one set of ToR that contain project specific as well as overarching questions. One evaluation report will be written by the evaluator(s) that provides project specific assessments but also answers the overarching evaluation questions.

The cluster evaluation should provide insights into the impact logics of the project conceptions, the achieved impacts and areas for improvement and recommended new innovations in order to further strengthen project and organisational strategies in the future.

Specific objectives are:

1. The underlying impact logic of the projects is assessed and reconstructed.
2. The goals and indicators of the projects have been assessed in accordance with OECD DAC criteria. Within this assessment:
 - a. Hindering and helpful factors concerning the project impact, unintended positive and/ or negative impacts and external have been captured.
 - b. Good practices and lessons learned from the projects are highlighted.
3. The appropriateness of the project strategies and the implementation design have been reflected upon and recommendations for the organisations' future strategies have been made.

4. Key questions in accordance with OECD DAC criteria

The following questions are listed according to the evaluation criteria of OECD DAC. They should be understood against the background of an evaluation of every project and include overarching questions.

Relevance

1. In how far did the concepts employed in the projects meet the needs of the female and male project beneficiaries?
2. Are there targeted interventions that did not meet the needs of the target group?
3. Are the trainings under the projects able to meet the needs of the markets of the respective project area?
4. Do the selected skill areas meet the interest of the targeted beneficiaries of the projects?
5. Are the apprenticeship durations appropriate to offer the needed competencies of the respective skill areas or occupations?
6. Which lessons can be learnt from the projects that could apply to the relevance of the projects?
7. Are the project concepts still valid today? Which goals do the partners and other stakeholders see as reasonable and promising for the next years and next project phase?

Coherence

8. To which extent do the projects fit to other interventions implemented by other actors and to relevant strategic reference frameworks in the respective geographical areas?

9. Are the projects in sync with local government strategies of the projects' implementation areas for reducing unemployment among the youth?
10. Are any of the project models adoptable by traditional master crafts persons?

Effectiveness

11. To what extent have project objectives and indicators been achieved /are likely to be achieved?
12. Which interventions provided under the projects have propelled the attainment of results?
13. How appropriate are the technologies applied for achieving the projects objectives?
14. Are project graduates able to compete with traditional apprenticeship graduates in the job market?
15. Were the project mobilization approaches and targeting processes appropriate to reach the intended beneficiaries?

Efficiency

16. Have activities been implemented cost-efficiently?
17. Have the activities and interventions been executed in a sequential and coordinated manner?
18. Have the projects achieved their objectives within the specified implementation period?

Impact

19. To what extent have the projects contributed to reduction of poverty among the youth in the project areas?
20. How have the projects affected (young) women and men respectively?
21. Do the vocational education institutions supported through the projects have an effect on social coherence? Do they contribute to conflict prevention and/ or peace promotion in the area of intervention?
22. Which other intended and/or unintended positive and/or negative changes have occurred as a result of the projects at impact level?

Sustainability

23. How can activities of the projects be sustained in the future?
24. Are alternative financing strategies to donor funding possible?
25. Can the gains achieved by the projects be sustained in the medium to long term without further interventions from the projects?
26. Have other TVET institutions incorporated or started to incorporate the projects' concepts and systems?
27. How can partnerships that have been established be sustained after the projects end?

Overarching questions

1. What are **good practices** in the projects?
2. What are **central lessons learned** from the projects?
3. What are the differences and similarities of the project approaches chosen? What can the organisations learn from each other?
4. What are the **central recommendations** for future organisational strategies, project designs and innovations in the field of TVET in the area?

5. Methods and Standards

It is a requirement that the principles and standards of OECD DAC for a participatory, credible, gender-sensitive and fair evaluation will be observed. Both **quantitative** and **qualitative** methods shall be used. Data collection shall promote self-reflection amongst the target groups. The chosen methods shall be inclusive and respect the social and cultural context of the target groups. In the development of the evaluation design and the choice of methods, correct research ethics need to be applied. The evaluation should be guided by the “do-no-harm” principle.

Due to the current restrictions imposed by the Covid 19 pandemic, it is currently not predictable to what extent physical encounters with interviewees will be possible. We therefore ask for an **evaluation design that allows for the use of digital methods**.

The methodical design is to be suggested and described in the technical proposal and refined in the inception report by the evaluator(s). The documentation of the methodical approach is a fundamental component of the evaluation report.

6. Evaluation timeline and expected products

The foreseen deadlines for core steps and products of the evaluation are as follows:

Deadline	Steps/ product
03 Jan 2021	Submission of questions regarding ToR
08 Jan 2021	Circulation of responses to questions raised
13 Jan 2021	Submission of offers
Between 28 Jan – 03 Feb 2021	(Virtual) kick off meeting
17 Feb 2021	Draft Inception report
01 Mar 2021	Final Inception report
Mar/ Apr 2021	Data collection and analysis
Mar/ Apr 2021	Individual debriefings with partner organisations
25 Apr 2021	Draft final evaluation report
Between 26 Apr – 30 Apr 2021	Virtual Presentation of evaluation results with partner organisations and Bread for the World
16 May 2021	Final evaluation report

Inception report

After the contract clarification meeting and the provision of the core documents in digital form, the evaluators should prepare an inception report, which describes how the required results are achieved and which data will be collected with which methods. The Inception Report shall contain an evaluation matrix. The Inception Report should also contain a detailed activity and time schedule and a preliminary table of contents for the final report.

Evaluation Report

The evaluation report should not exceed 60 pages (without appendix). It is expected that the report presents results of the analysis of and recommendations for each project as well as the overarching discussion. It shall formulate recommendations that are as precise, feasible and clearly addressed as possible. The description of the methodology and procedure as well as an executive summary are integral parts of the evaluation report. Additionally, a short anonymous summary of the evaluation (between 7,000 and 10,000 characters) for the homepage of Bread for the World is to be written.

The results and recommendations will be presented virtually to the partner organisations and Bread for the World.

Estimation of working days for partner organisation 1: LOIC	09
Estimation of working days for partner organisation 2: SLOIC	10
Estimation of working days for partner organisation 3: OICG	08
Estimation of working days for overarching analysis and overall process	10
Total estimated working days	37

7. Roles and responsibilities

The three organisations LOIC, SLOIC and OICG are direct counterparts for the evaluator(s). Each organisation will conclude a contract with a certain number of working days with the evaluator for the working days and travel relevant to their project(s) and a share of the days foreseen for the overarching analysis.

One report is expected as a final product that covers all projects. Next to the three partner organisations, the Project Officers from Bread for the World responsible for the projects and the Evaluation Team in the Results Management Unit will review and input into the reports.

8. Qualification of evaluators

The evaluator(s) should fulfil the following requirements:

- thematic skills and experience in the area of technical and vocational education and training
- very good knowledge of qualitative and quantitative data collection and ICT applications
- expertise in gender sensitive data collection and analysis
- sound evaluation experience
- experience working in Liberia, Sierra Leone, Ghana
- experience working with civil society organisations
- excellent command of English, knowledge of relevant local languages is considered an asset

9. Submission of offers

The submission of offers for this evaluation is based on a two-stage process. In the first step interested evaluators who intend to hand in an offer can submit **questions** until **03 Jan 2021** using the email address below. Answers to all questions asked will be sent to all evaluators who submitted questions by **08 Jan 2021**.

In a second step, **complete offers** must be submitted by **13 Jan 2021**. A complete offer consists of:

- a **technical proposal**, which states by what methods the objectives of the evaluation are to be achieved, how the evaluator(s) will handle the tasks and sets out the timeframe;
- a **financial proposal** stating the fees for the evaluator(s), the estimated travel and ancillary costs and subsistence. All costs including VAT must be set out in the financial proposals.
- **CVs or profiles of the submitting evaluator(s)** with career details relevant to the offer. For data protection reasons, we kindly ask you to **hand in CVs and/ or profiles as separate files/ attachments**.

The contracting organisations reserve the right to conduct telephone or personal interviews in order to reach a decision. Furthermore, they reserve the right to award the contracts at the time of the submission of the offer.

Please send questions and the complete offer by email to

evaluation_ausschreibung@ewde.de

Evangelisches Werk für Diakonie und Entwicklung e.V.

Results Management Unit

Judith Stegemann

Caroline-Michaelis-Strasse 1

10115 Berlin

Germany