

Terms of Reference

Cross-project evaluation: Community Development in Georgia

1. Introduction

Brot für die Welt (Bread for the World, part of *Evangelisches Werk für Diakonie und Entwicklung e.V.* - Protestant Agency for Diakonie and Development) is a globally active development organization that enables disadvantaged and marginalized people in more than 90 countries to improve their living conditions through their own efforts. The specific support is usually provided by church and civil society partner organizations and focuses on food security, the promotion of education and health, respect for human rights and the integrity of creation. The focus of Bread for the World's work is the promotion of projects in the Global South. If necessary, Bread for the World also supports the partner organizations by facilitating the placement of experts and volunteers. In Georgia, *Brot für die Welt* currently cooperates with 10 partner organizations on such diverse topics as peace, human rights, strengthening of democracy and creating favorable conditions for CSO, participation, community and rural development, small-scale agriculture, environment, climate change, education and social justice.

At a partner workshop for the development of the regional strategy 2016-2020 for the South Caucasus, Community Development has become a (new) thematic focus for the region. In this context, *Brot für die Welt* can draw on a long-standing experience with almost a dozen partner organizations from Georgia, including a coalition of Georgian organizations working on community development (CoDeCo). The coalition exists since beginning of the 2010s and consists currently of 8 coalition member organizations (6 partner organizations of *Brot für die Welt*). These coalition partners meet more or less regularly and exchange information about their project work on the topic of community development. Partner organizations in Georgia working in community development address rural development, promotion of smallholder farmers and cooperatives, participation and community budget control, promotion of federalism, social entrepreneurship, support for people with disabilities, and environmental issues, among others. The work of the CoDeCo coalition and other partner organizations of *Brot für die Welt* is based on regional needs and is currently promoted by political processes such as Georgia's rapprochement with the EU through the EU-Georgia Association Agreement or international obligations and treaties.

The Georgian partner organizations of *Brot für die Welt* repeatedly expressed the idea of initiating a collaborative project on community development in a selected region of Georgia, possibly within the framework of the CoDeCo coalition. The partners' desire led to the idea of developing a "lighthouse project" for the region, both to exploit thematic synergies and to test new formats of support. Therefore, one purpose of this evaluation is to examine the feasibility of such a project.

2. Scope of the evaluation

The scope of the evaluation is the work of *Brot für die Welt* partners on community development in Georgia. This is a cross-project evaluation and joint reflection that should cover both, approaches and successes of the partner projects as well as complementarity and synergy effects through cooperation, e.g. within the framework of the CoDeCo Coalition or other networks. Another point of interest is the feasibility of the above-mentioned lighthouse project, including the feasibility of such a cooperation within the existing cooperation regulations of *Brot für die Welt*.

In particular, the period 2016 to date will be looked at by the evaluation.

3. Purpose and objective of the evaluation

The purpose of this cross-project evaluation and reflection is to assess the approaches and effects of the community development activities of the *Brot für die Welt* partners in Georgia, including the work of the CoDeCo coalition. Accordingly, the OECD-DAC criteria of relevance, coherence and effectiveness will be the main focus of this evaluation. Another objective is to further develop the idea of a regional lighthouse project and the identification of recommendations and possible obstacles in the implementation of such a project.

The findings and recommendations of this evaluation will be used by *Brot für die Welt's* Unit for Europe, Central Asia and 'Churches helping Churches', and its partner organisations in Georgia. Furthermore, if transferable, *Brot für die Welt* would like to use the evaluation findings generally (also in other contexts) when promoting community development projects.

Specific objectives of this evaluation are to:

- Evaluate the context in which community development activities take place in Georgia, in terms of challenges and conducive factors, resources available, cooperation among civil society and with state actors, as well as best practices.
- Evaluate the community development projects funded by *Brot für die Welt* in Georgia, in particular the complementarity, coordination and synergy effects among the partner organizations of *Brot für die Welt* involved in community development and their respective activities, as well as the work and added value of CoDeCo in this respect..
- Provide action-oriented recommendations resulting from the findings. Recommendations should address the following questions, among others: What capacities should be developed within communities? What types of interventions and actions should be taken to ensure sustainable development of communities? How to enhance cooperation between relevant organizations and with local authorities?
- Reflect together with the involved partner organization the idea of a regional lighthouse project and provide recommendations in this regard

4. Key questions

It is expected that the evaluation report entails a comprehensive analysis of the coalition CoDeCo and the community development activities of its members as well as of other partner organization in the period from 2016 to date. The performance and the cooperation of the partners as well as effects on beneficiaries and on various stakeholders should be given special consideration.

Cross-cutting issues such as gender equality and inclusion shall be considered in all of the questions if possible and reasonable. In this respect, it is of particular interest to know to what extent the community development measures have raised the level of inclusion and participation of community members.

The key questions of this evaluation - based on the OECD-DAC Evaluation Criteria - are:

⇒ **Relevance**

1. To what extent were the community development activities suited to the particular needs and priorities of the target groups in Georgia (incl. what are the current needs of the target group?)? Have women and men, as well as young people, benefited equally from these activities?
2. How were the partners' community development approaches developed? On which analyses or theories are these approaches based and are the intervention logics still relevant from today's perspective?

⇒ **Coherence**

Internal coherence of the coalition partners' activities

3. To what extent are the community development activities of the partners complementary to each other?
4. To what extent is it possible to initiate a collaborative project in community development in Georgia to exploit thematic synergies and try out new support formats ("lighthouse project")

External coherence with other actors

5. How well are the community development activities of *Brot für die Welt* partners aligned with other national or international strategies?
6. How well the partners collaborate with other key players in community development in Georgia (incl. local authorities, private actors, CSOs)?

⇒ **Effectiveness**

7. To what extent have the community development activities been successfully implemented by *Brot für die Welt* partners? To what extent were the objectives of these measures achieved? What were the enabling or disabling key factors? Were there any non-intended effects? If so, why?
8. Did the interventions strengthen community cohesion and conflict prevention/resolution (incl. the inclusion of particularly disadvantaged or vulnerable persons or groups such as minority groups), and if so, how?

⇒ **Efficiency**

9. To what extent are synergies being created among *Brot für die Welt* partners and by the CoDeCo coalition? What other synergy potentials and cooperation opportunities can be identified for the partners in the future (also interdisciplinary cooperation opportunities)?
10. Was the support provided by *Brot für die Welt* to the coalition partners adequate (in terms of resources provided and expertise)?

⇒ **Impact**

11. To what extent have the community development activities of the coalition partners contributed to developmental goals in Georgia (incl. social equality and social inclusion)?
12. What effect/impact did community development activities have on the well-being of community members (including the well-being of minorities)?
13. To what extent were the measures of the partners exemplary, had a scaling-up effect in Georgia or in the region and / or contributed to inter-community exchange and cooperation?

⇒ **Sustainability**

14. To what extent are the *Brot für die Welt* partners institutionally, personnel-wise and financially able and willing (ownership) to maintain the positive effects of the community development activities?
15. To what extent are the community development activities more sustainable because of the coalition?

5. Evaluation design/methods

The evaluation is to be conducted in line with the OECD-DAC Quality Standards for Development Evaluation to ensure the quality of the evaluation processes and its products¹. A gender-sensitive approach to the evaluation process is expected. Methodologically, the evaluation shall be a combination of a desk review, i.e. document-based analysis of existing reports, and an on-site study on the ground in Georgia, including interviews and group discussion. However, short-term adjustment of methods in the evaluation process may be necessary in consultation with *Bread for the World* due to COVID-19.

The evaluators are expected to develop an evaluation design, using a diverse set of methods. Where possible, each evaluation question is to be examined from different perspectives and with different methods (triangulation).

The evaluation is divided into four parts:

1) Inception phase:

The inception phase will include a kick-off meeting (either virtual by Zoom or in Berlin, depending on the COVID-19 situation), a desk review of key documents and exploratory interviews (face-to-face, online or by telephone).

2) Desk and on-site study:

Based on the evaluation questions the desk study contains an analysis of relevant documents of *Brot für die Welt* and those of the partner organizations (proposals, log frames, project reports, final reports, evaluations, strategies, etc.). Where appropriate, further documents should be reviewed and analysed (e.g. relevant government or other national or international strategy papers for community development).

Based on the findings of the desk study, the design for the on-site study in Georgia shall be finalised. If possible, 6-8 coalition partners in Georgia should be visited within two weeks. Moreover, all coalition partners and other partner organizations working in Community Development in Georgia should be involved in the form of an online survey. In particular interviews and group discussions should be held with staff of partner organizations, beneficiaries of the community development activities, external actors (e.g. other organisations working in the field of community development) as well as with relevant staff at *Brot für die Welt*.

A debriefing or discussions of preliminary findings with coalition partners and other partner organizations is expected at the end of the on-site phase. It is up to the evaluators how they would like to organize the meeting(s) (e.g., online with all partners or as a face-to-face event at the end of each visit of a partner organization). Suggestions for this are welcome in the proposal.

3) Workshop to discuss the idea of a regional lighthouse project

A joint workshop with partner organizations should be held to further explore the feasibility of a lighthouse project. In this context, potentials and opportunities as well as obstacles and barriers for such a lighthouse project are to be examined in more detail. Recommendations for the implementation of such a project are expected to be laid out in the evaluation report

4) Synthesis Phase and Final Evaluation Report:

The final evaluation report shall be based on the synthesis of the findings from the Desk Study, the on-site study, and the workshop about the regional lighthouse project. It is critical that the data is triangulated in order to increase the validity of findings. Where possible and appropriate,

¹ See: https://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/development/dac-quality-standards-for-development-evaluation_9789264083905-en?_ga=2.191824554.1420447138.1635760415-1412077071.1635760414

disaggregated data is expected (e.g., on age, gender, type of community development activity, etc.).

Prior to the finalization of the evaluation report, the evaluators will present and discuss the findings and recommendations with relevant staff from *Brot für die Welt* and partner organizations. In addition, the final evaluation findings shall be presented at the head office of *Brot für die Welt* in Berlin.

6. Evaluation process (timetable)

The following is a rough timeline and milestones for this evaluation. The evaluators may propose an adapted timetable.

Deadline	Milestones
30.05.2022	Questions on the ToR can be submitted until 30.05.2022. Written answers until 06.06.2022. All questions and answers will be compiled in one document and published on the website where the ToRs are posted.
19.06.2022	Deadline for submitting technical and financial proposals
End of June 2022	Selection of and contracting evaluation team
Week of 11.-17.07.2022	Kick-off meeting
31.07.2022	Submission of draft Inception Report by the evaluators
15.08.2022	Submission of feedback on the draft Inception Report by <i>Brot für die Welt</i>
22.08.2022	Submission of final Inception Report by the evaluators
End of August/ September 2022	Desk, on-site study and workshop (2 weeks for the on-site study) (incl. a short online meeting to discuss the procedure for the field study with the evaluators and staff of Bread for the World)
16.10.2022	Submission of draft Evaluation Report by the evaluators
Week of 24.-28.10.2022	Online presentation of findings and recommendations of the Evaluation Report
18.11.2022	Submission of feedback on the draft Evaluation Report by <i>Brot für die Welt</i>
27.11.2022	Submission of the 1st. version of the final Evaluation Report by the evaluators
16.12.2022	Submission of feedback on the 1 st version of the final Evaluation Report by <i>Brot für die Welt</i>
02.01.2023	Submission of the final Evaluation Report by the evaluators
By the end of January 2022 at the latest	Presentation of the final evaluation findings and recommendations at <i>Brot für die Welt's</i> head office, either online by Zoom or in Berlin, depending on the COVID-19 situation

We estimate a total number of 40 working days for each evaluator (international and local evaluator).

7. Expected products

Inception Report

After the kick-off meeting, and the handover of the core documents in digital form, the evaluators should prepare an inception report that describes how the required results will be achieved, which methods will be applied and which data will be collected and documented. The inception report should also identify which of the specific community development activities implemented by the partner organizations will be examined in more detail and the criteria used for selecting these activities. In addition, the Inception Report shall include a detailed schedule of activities and timelines as well as a preliminary table of contents for the final report.

The inception report has to be written in English and should not exceed 15 pages (plus annexes). It must be accepted by the commissioning party.

Workshop Report on the regional lighthouse project

A short workshop report (max. 5 pages) in English language should be prepared reflecting the main results of this event.

Final Report and Presentation

The final report shall be written in English and should not exceed 50 pages including an executive summary and a description of the relevant contextual conditions (plus annexes). It must be accepted by the commissioning party.

After presenting and discussing the draft evaluation report with key stakeholders, the evaluation findings and recommendations shall be presented and discussed with representatives of *Brot für die Welt* either virtually by Zoom or in Berlin, depending on the COVID-19 situation.

Summary of the evaluation report

The evaluators shall prepare an anonymized summary of the evaluation report (as a separate document (Word.doc and pdf) in English (and Georgian language, if possible).

This summary is limited to a maximum size of 4,000 and 5,000 characters (with spaces) and needs to include: (1) A short description of the goals of the evaluation, (2) key findings according to the OECD/DAC criteria and (3) recommendations.

2-pager of key findings and recommendations

A graphically appealing 2-pager with the key findings and recommendations is also expected.

The summary of the evaluation report and the 2-pager must be accepted by the commissioning party.

8. Key qualifications of the evaluators

The evaluation team should consist of one international evaluator and at least one evaluation expert from the project region. At least one of the evaluators should be female. Preferably, evaluators should apply as teams of 2, but applications from individual evaluators will also be considered.

Qualifications and expertise required:

- Expertise and experience in the field of community development
- Expertise and experience with network projects (e.g.: experience in management incl. financial management, democratic forms of communication and decision-making procedures in such projects)
- Proven experience in conducting complex programme evaluations, preferably in Georgia or the region as well as profound expertise in quantitative and qualitative empirical data collection and analysis methods

- Regional knowledge in the post-Soviet area and experience in Do No Harm approach is an advantage
- English language skills; Russian or Georgian language skills are an advantage

9. Content of the evaluator's offer

Interested parties can send questions regarding the ToR in writing to the email address mentioned below by 30.05.2022. Please kindly refrain from enquiries via telephone.

Answers to all questions submitted will subsequently be published in a document on the homepage of *Brot für die Welt* <https://www.brot-fuer-die-welt.de/material/ausschreibungen-evaluation/> .

Complete offers must be submitted to the email address mentioned below by **19.06.2022, 23:59 h CET**.

A complete offer consists of the following:

- A **technical proposal**, which lays out the evaluation design, specifying methods and instruments to be used to answer the evaluation questions and a timetable (max. 8 pages)
- A **financial proposal** stating precisely the fees for each evaluator (disclosing taxes), estimated travel and ancillary costs (reimbursable). Please note that no lump sums can be paid. All costs including VAT for each budget line must be set out in the financial proposal (max. 3 pages). Please also consult appendix "terms and condition for payment" when preparing the offer.
- **Sound CVs of all participating evaluator(s)** with career details and experience relevant to the offer. For data protection reasons, we kindly ask you to **hand in CVs as a separate file** (max. 4 pages each CV),

We reserve the right to conduct interviews in order to reach a decision. Furthermore, we reserve the right to award the contract only on the basis of bids. Only complete offers will be considered. The evaluation award will be granted to the most economical offer, based on the following award criteria and weighting:

Award criteria	Weight of award criteria in %
Quality of the technical proposal, with a special focus on understanding the ToR and proposed methodology	35 %
Qualifications of the evaluators	35 %
Price	30 %

Please send any questions as well as **your complete offer (1. CVs in a separate pdf and 2. all other documents)** by e-mail to:

Evangelisches Werk für Diakonie und Entwicklung e. V.
 Results Management Unit/ EMVS
 c/o Susanne Neymeyer
 Caroline-Michaelis-Straße 1
 D-10115 Berlin
 Germany

evaluation_ausschreibung@ewde.de