



## Comparative Study and 'Outcome and Impact' Analysis of Six Vocational Training Projects in West Africa

Synthesis report based on six case studies: LOIC, MTS, OICG,  
SLOIC, VTF, YOWDAST

## Impressum

### Herausgeber:

Evangelischer Entwicklungsdienst e.V.

Ulrich-von-Hassell-Str. 76

53123 Bonn

Telefon: +49 (0)228 8101-0

E-Mail: eed@eed.de

[www.eed.de](http://www.eed.de)

**Autor:** Ralf Lange (in Zusammenarbeit mit Dr. Gisela Burckhardt, Rehab David und James Yarsiah)

**Übersetzungen:** textdesign Heidelberg

**Redaktion:** Hedwig Schlags, Sven Brieger

**Druck:** Grafische Werkstatt Druckerei und Verlag

Gebrüder Kopp GmbH & Co.KG, Köln

**Bildnachweis:** Ralf Lange

Gedruckt auf Recycling-Papier

Bonn, November 2010



---

**Comparative Study and 'Outcome and Impact'  
Analysis of Six Vocational Training Projects  
in West Africa**

# Zum Geleit

Liebe Leserinnen und Leser,

ich freue mich, dass Sie den Bericht der Querschnittsevaluation von Berufsbildungsprojekten in Westafrika zur Hand nehmen. Vielleicht arbeiten Sie selbst im Bereich Berufsbildung oder Sie unterstützen Partnerorganisationen, die dieses tun. Wir wünschen uns, dass die Ergebnisse dieser Studie möglichst vielen Menschen der Praxis zu Gute kommen!

Der Evangelische Entwicklungsdienst gibt neben jährlich 60 – 70 Evaluationen, die in den geförderten Projekten verantwortet und durchgeführt werden, regelmäßig projektübergreifende Evaluationen in Auftrag, die Auskunft über die Wirkungen seiner Fördertätigkeit geben. Ziel dieser Studien ist es auch, Erkenntnisse über einen Förderbereich zu gewinnen, die übertragbar auf andere regionale und soziale Kontexte sind. Wo dies nicht möglich ist, können die Art der Fragestellungen und die Herangehensweisen an ihrer Beantwortung inspirierend und handlungsweisend wirken.

Lassen Sie mich dafür zwei Beispiele nennen: Als sehr bedeutend für den Erfolg der Berufsbildungsprojekte wurde in der Studie das Instrument der Beratung herausgestellt. Junge Menschen brauchen neben guter Ausbildung Beratung bei der Auswahl ihres Berufs, Bewerbungstraining und Hilfe bei der Suche nach einem Praktikum. Ebenso wichtig ist die begleitende soziale Beratung in sog. life skills vor und nach Aufnahme einer beruflichen Tätigkeit. Hier muss besonders auf die spezifische Situation der jungen Frauen eingegangen werden, die mehr Schwierigkeiten haben, im Berufsleben Fuß zu fassen als junge Männer.

Des Weiteren hat die Studie herausgearbeitet, dass bei der Abwägung aller Vor- und Nachteile der unterschiedlichen Ansätze zur Berufsbildung eine Kombination aus Berufsbildungszentrum mit praxisnahem Unterricht einerseits und persönlichem Lehrverhältnis in der realen Arbeitswelt andererseits ein sehr Erfolg versprechendes Modell ist, dessen Gelingen aber von vielen Kontextfaktoren abhängt.

Der Evangelische Entwicklungsdienst möchte mit der Veröffentlichung dieses Berichts in englischer Sprache zur Diskussion unter Partnern und Akteurinnen anregen, die Berufsbildung junger Menschen zu ihrer Aufgabe gemacht haben. Mein besonderer Dank gilt den an der Studie beteiligten Partnerorganisationen in Westafrika: LOIC, MTS, OICG, SLOIC, VTF und YOWDAST, die durch ihre Mitarbeit und ihre Bereitschaft zur Transparenz die Veröffentlichung ermöglicht haben.

Bonn, im September 2010

Dr. Claudia Warning

EED-Vorstand Internationale Programme

## A few words to our readers

Dear Readers,

I am very pleased that you are interested in this report on the crosscutting evaluation of vocational training projects in West Africa. Perhaps you yourself work in the area of vocational training or support partner organisations that are active in this field? We would like the findings of this study to be of practical value to as many people as possible.

In addition to 60 to 70 evaluations every year, which are carried out within the framework and within the responsibility of the supported projects, EED regularly commissions crosscutting evaluations that provide information on the effects of EED's funding activities in a special field. The aim of these studies is also to gain information about one support area that can be applied to other regional and social contexts. Where this is not possible, the kind of questions and the approaches taken to answer them can have the effect of inspiring change or action elsewhere.

Allow me to illustrate this with two examples. The study indicated that counselling was a very important instrument for the success of vocational training projects. As well as good training, young people require counselling in choosing their profession, training in applying for jobs and assistance in looking for work placements. Of equal importance on a social level are the life skills that have to be trained before and after beginning professional life. Here, particular attention must be given to the specific situation experienced by young women, who have more difficulty gaining a foothold in professional life than their male counterparts.

Furthermore, the study indicates that, when all advantages and disadvantages of the various approaches to vocational training are weighed up, a combination of "hands-on" lessons at a vocational training centre and an on-the-job apprenticeship in the real world appears to be a very promising model, although its ultimate success does depend on many contextual factors.

By publishing this report in English, EED would like to instigate a discussion among partners and players who consider vocational training for young people their mission. In particular, I would like to thank the partner organisations in West Africa who were involved in the study: LOIC, MTS, OICG, SLOIC, VTF and YOWDAST, whose cooperation and will to full transparency made this publication possible.

Bonn, September 2010

Dr. Claudia Warning

EED Director International Programmes

# Table of Content

Zum Geleit	6
A few words to our readers	7
Table of Content	8
List of Tables	6
List of Acronyms	7
Vorwort	9
Foreword	11
Zusammenfassung	13
Executive Summary	19
1. Introduction	23
1.1 Background, objectives and focus of the study	23
1.2 Scope of the study	23
1.3 Methodological approach and overview of activities	24
1.3.1 Methodology and scope of the tracer study	25
1.3.2 Compilation of tracer data and analysis of results	27
1.3.3 Main study	27
1.4 Limitations and validity of the data collected	29
1.5 Team of consultants and coordination of the study	30
2 Context	32
2.1 Background of partners and VT projects/ programmes	32
2.1.1 Overview	32
2.1.2 Liberia Opportunity Industrialisation Centres (LOIC)	33
2.1.3 Sierra Leone Opportunities Industrialization Centres (SLOIC)	33
2.1.4 Vocational Training for Females Programme (VTF), Ghana	34
2.1.5 Masons Technical School, Garkida, North East Nigeria	35
2.1.6 Opportunities Industrialization Centres Ghana (OICG), Livelihood Enhancement Project for Youth in the Kumasi Metropolis	35
2.1.7 Women Development Association for Social Transformation (YOWDAST), Ganye Nigeria	36
2.2 Labour market context	37
2.3 Labour market challenges for TVET	38
2.4 TVET systems and actors in West Africa	39
2.5 Social demand for Vocational Training	40

3	Results of case studies	42
3.1	Relevance of VT projects and programmes	42
3.2	Relevance of teaching methods, trade selection and certification to labour market demand and interests of the target group	43
3.3	Selection and reaching of target groups	45
3.4	Quality of VT programmes	48
3.5	Effectiveness	61
3.5.1	Quantitative analysis	62
3.5.2	Qualitative analysis of employment and income	67
3.5.3	Effectiveness of the measures provided and assessment of hindering factors	71
3.5.4	Overall achievement of project objectives	74
3.6	Impact	74
3.6.1	Impact on social status of individuals	75
3.6.2	Sustainability of employment	75
3.6.3	Direct impact on families and communities	76
3.6.4	Indirect impact on gender roles and relations	78
3.6.5	Unexpected and unintended impacts	79
3.7	Efficiency	81
4	Summary of conclusions	84
4.1	Comparative analysis of the three VT approaches	84
4.2	Further conclusions	86
4.3	Lessons learned	90
5	Recommendations	92
5.1	Strategic recommendations	92
5.2	Specific recommendations	92
	Annex 1	98
	Annex 2	104
	Annex 3	105

## List of Tables

- Table 1: Number of graduates traced and sample size
- Table 2: Overview of partners
- Table 3: Number of youth (age 15-24) between 1980 and 2010
- Table 4: Percentage of youth (age 15-24) relative to total population
- Table 5: Assessment of expectations met
- Table 6: Assessment of the choice of training
- Table 7: Total employment rate of graduates
- Table 8: Status of employed graduates
- Table 9: Number and percentage of employed graduates working in the field of trade
- Table 10: Estimated number and percentage of interviewed graduates working in the field of training
- Table 11: Employment status of female graduates 2003-2008
- Table 12: Employment status of male graduates 2003-2008
- Table 13: Status of employed female graduates
- Table 14: Status of employed male graduates
- Table 15: Working place of graduates in case of self-employment
- Table 16: Coverage of basic needs by graduates' income
- Table 17: Income increase since graduation
- Table 18: Income increase per gender
- Table 19: Factors that helped graduates to generate an income
- Table 20: Factors that hindered graduates to generate an income
- Table 21: Estimated percentage of graduates employing others
- Table 22: Percentage of graduates living at the same place/ sending money
- Table 23: Total number trained
- Table 24: The costs of training per person (average 2005 – 2007) according to pre-study information and case study reports
- Table 25: Employment rate and unit costs



## List of Acronyms

BDO	Business Development Officer
BftW	Brot für die Welt (Bread for the World)
BVTC	Bo Vocational Training Centre
CAPA	Centre d'Apprentissage Professionnel et Artisanal
CBO	Community based Organisation
COTVET	Council for Technical and Vocational Education and Training
DDR	Demobilisation, Disarmament and Reintegration programmes
ECWA	Evangelical Church of West Africa
EED	Evangelischer Entwicklungsdienst (Church Development Service)
EST	Educational Skills Training
EYN	Ekklesiar Yan' uwa Nigeria
EZE	Evangelische Zentralstelle für Entwicklung
FAKT	Consult for Management, Training and Technologies
FGD	Focus Group Discussions
FVTC	Freetown/Lungi Vocational Training Centre
GDP	Gross domestic product
GoG	Government of Ghana
GTZ	Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (German Society for Technical Cooperation)
ICT	Information and Communication Technologies
IDP	Internally Displaced People
ITF	Industrial Training Fund
LCCN	Lutheran Church of Christ Nigeria
LOIC	Liberian Opportunities Industrialisation Centres
MFI	Micro Finance Institutions
MJTC	Mattru Jong Training Centre
MTS	Masons Technical School
MVTC	Makeni Vocational Training Centre
NABTEB	National Business and Technical Examination Board

NBTE	National Board of Technical Education
NGO	Non Governmental Organization
NQF	National Qualification Frameworks
NVTI	National Vocational Training Institute
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
OIC	Opportunity Industrialisation Centre
OICG	Opportunity Industrialisation Centre Ghana
OJT	On the job training
OWP	Operational Work Plan
PPT	Project Performance Tracking
PS	Private Sector
SLOIC	Sierra Leone Opportunities Industrialisation Centres
SME	Small and Medium Enterprises
SSS	Senior Secondary School
ToR	Terms of Reference
TOT	Training of Trainers
TVET	Technical and Vocational Educational and Training
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
VT	Vocational Training
VTI	Vocational Skills Training Initiatives
VTF	Vocational Training Programme for Females
WFP	World Food Programme
YMCA	Young Men's Christian Association
YOWDAST	Youth and Women Development Association for Social Transformation
YOWSAP	Youth and Women Skill Acquisition Project

# Vorwort

Das Referat Afrika 1 im Evangelischen Entwicklungsdienst unterstützt Projekte und Programme kirchlicher und nicht-kirchlicher Partner zur beruflichen Bildung junger Menschen in Westafrika mit unterschiedlichen Ansätzen. Ziel der Studie war es, die Güte und Relevanz dieser Ansätze in den jeweiligen Kontexten zu bewerten und daraus Schlüsse zu ziehen, die der zukünftigen Zusammenarbeit mit den Partnerorganisationen im Bereich Berufsbildung nutzen können. Des Weiteren stand die Frage nach den direkten Wirkungen der Maßnahmen im Vordergrund: Inwieweit ist es durch die Arbeit der Partnerorganisationen gelungen, die Absolventinnen und Absolventen in eine berufliche Tätigkeit – sei es ein Anstellungsverhältnis oder eine selbständige Tätigkeit – zu vermitteln? In welchem Ausmaß deckt das erzielte Einkommen dieser jungen Menschen ihren tatsächlichen Bedarf zum Lebensunterhalt ab? Darüber hinaus ging die Studie auch den indirekten Wirkungen der Ausbildungsmaßnahmen nach und prüfte deren Beiträge zu übergeordneten entwicklungspolitischen Zielen.

Die Studie, die im Oktober 2008 begonnen hatte, bestand aus drei Phasen:

## **1. Phase: Datenerhebung vor Ort über den Verbleib der Absolventen und Absolventinnen von Berufsbildungskursen einschließlich von Aspekten der Selbstevaluation der Partner (Oktober 2008 – Januar 2009)**

Die Notwendigkeit eine Vorstudie durchzuführen ergab sich aus der Tatsache, dass bei den Partnerorganisationen nur sehr begrenzt Unterlagen über den Verbleib der Absolventinnen und Absolventen vorlagen. Diese wurden aber benötigt, um Hypothesen für die Hauptstudie bilden zu können. Die Erhebung quantitativer Daten im Rahmen von vom EED beauftragten Studien sind bis dato eine Seltenheit. Der personelle, zeitliche und finanzielle Aufwand ist gemessen am erwarteten Nutzen sehr hoch. Methodische Begrenzungen mussten auch im vorliegenden Fall in Kauf genommen werden. So wurden z.B. nur 27 % der insgesamt 8000 jungen Leute, die zwischen 2003 und 2008 eine Ausbildung absolviert hatten, interviewt. Diese konnten nicht nach dem Stichproben- und Repräsentativitätsprinzip ausgewählt werden, sondern es musste auf die Jugendlichen zurückgegriffen werden, die zeitlich und örtlich verfügbar waren. Eine weitere Begrenzung bestand darin, dass neben den Absolventen und Absolventinnen keine weiteren Personenkreise als Informationsquellen genutzt werden konnten, womit eine Triangulation der Daten nicht möglich war. Dennoch war der Aufwand, der für die Datenerhebung betrieben werden musste, lohnend. Sie lieferte das Grundmaterial, um die Fragen zu präzisieren, die in der Hauptstudie zu beantworten waren.

## **2. Phase: Konsolidierung der Ergebnisse der Vorstudien, Hypothesenbildung und Planung der Feldphase (Februar – März 2009)**

Die Ergebnisse der Vorstudie wurden dem EED im März 2009 vorgestellt. Danach fanden zwei Partnerworkshops in Ghana statt, auf denen die Ergebnisse reflektiert und noch offene Fragen diskutiert wurden. Im Falle der Partner aus Liberia, Nigeria und Sierra Leone geschah dies wegen zeitlicher und logistischer Beschränkungen innerhalb der Feldphase. Die Ergebnisse der Vorstudie bildeten eine hinreichend gute Grundlage, um die Hypothesen und Fragen für die Feldphase zu formulieren.

### 3. Phase: Hauptstudie vor Ort in den Projekten (April – Mai 2009)

In allen Fällen konnten die Ergebnisse der Vorstudie durch Fokusgruppendifkussionen mit Auszubildenden und Absolventen verifiziert oder falsifiziert werden. In drei von sechs Fällen lagen bei den Partnerorganisationen Verbleibsdaten vor, die durch Interviews lediglich ergänzt wurden. In den Einzel- und Gruppeninterviews war es möglich, die Sichtweisen unterschiedlicher Akteurinnen und Interessensgruppen einzuholen. Feldbesuche und ein Abschlussworkshop mit Vertreterinnen und Vertretern der jeweiligen Organisation rundeten die Einzelevaluationen ab.

Mit der Koordination der Gesamtstudie wurde FAKT beauftragt. Der Synthesebericht lag im Herbst 2009 vor. Dr. Gisela Burckhardt und Ralf Lange, unterstützt von Matija Maturanec, bildeten das Evaluationsteam auf deutscher Seite. Adom Ghartey (TVET Ghana), James Yarsiah (Ghana) und Rehab David (Nigeria) führten die Vorstudien vor Ort aus und lieferten wesentliche Beiträge zu den sechs Einzelberichten, die dem Synthesebericht zugrunde liegen. Ihnen allen sei an dieser Stelle herzlich gedankt. Für den Inhalt des Berichts ist das Gutachterteam verantwortlich. Die Schlussfolgerungen und Empfehlungen spiegeln nicht zwangsläufig die Einschätzung des EED wider.

Die Federführung für die Studie lag im EED bei der Evaluationsstelle im Team Programmqualifizierung. Dieses dankt den Regionalverantwortlichen im Referat Afrika I Udo Bertrand, Katja Hansen und Christine Klusmann für ihre jeweiligen Beiträge zum Zustandekommen und zur Umsetzung des Vorhabens.

Bonn, im September 2010

Hedwig Schlags

Team Programmqualifizierung im EED

# Foreword

EED's Africa 1 Desk provides support to vocational training projects and programmes run by church and non-church partners in West Africa using a number of different approaches in their work. The aim of the study was to evaluate the effectiveness and relevance of these approaches in the respective contexts and, on this basis, to draw conclusions that might benefit the future cooperation with the partner organisations in the area of vocational training. The focus was also on the outcomes of measures: to what extent did the work of the partner organisations result in employment or self-employment for graduates? To what degree did the income received by these young people cover their actual living requirements? The study also looked at the impacts of training measures and how these contributed to overriding development goals.

The study, which began in October 2008, consisted of three stages:

**Stage 1: On-location collection of data regarding the whereabouts of those who successfully completed vocational training courses, including elements from the partners' self-evaluation (October 2008 – January 2009).**

Since the partner organisations had very limited information as to the whereabouts of the course graduates, it was necessary to conduct a preliminary study. This was required to form hypotheses for the main study. To date, quantitative data collection has rarely been a feature of EED-commissioned studies. The resources required for this – personnel, time and money – are very great in relation to the expected benefits. Accordingly, methodological limitations also had to be accepted in this case. For instance, interviews were conducted with only 27% of the 8,000 young people who successfully completed a vocational training course between 2003 and 2008. These could not be selected according to the random sampling and representation principle. Instead, interviews were conducted with the young people who were present at the time. Another limitation was that, apart from the course graduates themselves, no other group of people could be used as a source of information, meaning that the data could not be triangulated. After all it was worth the effort to go for this data collection. It provided the basis for putting the right questions for the main study.

**Stage 2: Consolidation of the preliminary study findings, hypothesis formation and fieldwork planning (February – March 2009)**

The findings of the preliminary study were presented to EED in March 2009. After this, two partner workshops were held in Ghana for the purpose of discussing the findings and any questions still in need of clarification. In the case of partners from Liberia, Nigeria and Sierra Leone, this took place during the fieldwork stage for reasons relating to time and logistical limitations. The findings of the preliminary study proved to be a sufficiently sound basis for formulating hypotheses and questions for the fieldwork stage.

**Stage 3: The main study at the project locations (April – May 2009)**

In all cases, it was possible to verify or falsify the findings from the preliminary study by means of focus group discussions with trainees and graduates. In three out of six cases, the partner organisations had data as to the whereabouts of graduates which was merely supplemented through interviews. In the one-to-one and group interviews, it was possible to record the viewpoints of different players and interest groups. The individual evaluations were rounded out by field visits and a final workshop with representatives from the respective organisation.

FAKT was commissioned with the task of coordinating the entire study. The synthesis report was available in autumn 2009. The German evaluation team consisted of Dr. Gisela Burckhardt and Ralf Lange, assisted by Matija Maturanec. Adom Ghartey (TVET Ghana), James Yarsiah (Ghana) and Rehab David (Nigeria) conducted the preliminary studies on location and made substantial contributions to the six individual reports upon which the synthesis report was based. This is the time to say thank you to all of them. The evaluation team is responsible for the contents of the report. The conclusions and recommendations made do not necessarily reflect EED's opinion.

Overall responsibility for the study lay with the evaluation unit of EED's Programme Qualification Team. The latter would like to thank the regional managers in the Africa I Desk – Udo Bertrand, Katja Hansen and Christine Klusmann – for their various contributions to the realization of the study.

Bonn, September 2010

Hedwig Schlags

Programme Qualification Team

## Zusammenfassung

### Hintergrund

Ziel der im Oktober 2008 vom EED in Auftrag gegebenen vergleichenden Studie ist es, die Wirkungen von sechs Berufsbildungsprogrammen von Partnerorganisationen in Westafrika zu erfassen sowie das Lernen aus guten Praxisbeispielen zu befördern. Die Studie besteht aus zwei Teilen, einer Verbleibsuntersuchung und einer Hauptstudie. Im Zuge der Verbleibsuntersuchung wurden etwa 27 % der insgesamt 8.000 Personen befragt, die zwischen 2003 und 2007 eine berufsbildende Maßnahme in einem der sechs untersuchten Projekte abgeschlossen hatten. Die Verbleibsuntersuchung wurde von FAKT koordiniert. Sie wurde von den Partnerorganisationen, zum Teil selbständig zum Teil mit Unterstützung von externen Beratern, durchgeführt. Die sechs Fallstudien wurden von zwei Teams durchgeführt, die sich aus in- und ausländischen Beratern und Beraterinnen, darunter auch Berater aus anderen Ländern Westafrikas, zusammensetzten. Neben einer zusammenfassenden Darstellung der Ergebnisse der sechs Fallstudien bietet der vorliegende Bericht eine vertiefende Betrachtung der Relevanz der verschiedenen Berufsbildungsansätze, der direkten wie indirekten Wirkungen sowie der Lernerfahrungen. Der Bericht schließt mit Empfehlungen auf strategischer, konzeptioneller und Projektleitungsebene. Er soll die Diskussion mit dem EED und den beteiligten Partnerorganisationen anregen.

### Wesentliche Ergebnisse und Schlussfolgerungen

Auch wenn Ansätze und Zielgruppen der sechs Berufsbildungsprojekte in Teilen übereinstimmen, bietet sich folgende Typologie an:

1. formelle berufliche Ausbildung in Berufsbildungszentren,
2. nicht formelle berufliche Ausbildung,
3. verbesserte traditionelle Lehre.

Einige Partnerorganisationen bieten Nachberatung für Absolventinnen und Absolventen an mit dem Ziel, deren Aussichten auf eine bezahlte Anstellung zu verbessern oder ihnen Wege in die Selbständigkeit aufzuzeigen. Zwei der sechs Partnerorganisationen arbeiten in Post-Konfliktregionen, zwei andere in Regionen mit Konfliktpotential, wo es gelegentlich zu Gewaltausbrüchen kommt.

Die Ziele der sechs Projekte/Programme sind relevant in Bezug auf die Armutsbekämpfungsstrategien der betreffenden Länder. Der dringende Bedarf der jungen Frauen und Männer, eine Beschäftigung und ein Einkommen zu erhalten, ist ein zentrales Anliegen der Projekte. Positiv zu bewerten ist, dass die Partnerorganisationen mehrheitlich ärmere Gemeinwesen erreichen. Drei der sechs Partner legen einen Schwerpunkt auf die Beschäftigungsförderung von Mädchen und Frauen, die in den vier untersuchten Ländern nur erschwert Zugang zu Arbeitsmarkt und beruflicher Bildung finden. In Staaten mit erhöhtem Konfliktpotenzial sind auch gewaltbereite männliche Jugendliche eine wichtige Zielgruppe in den untersuchten Berufsbildungsprogrammen.



In den vier Ländern ist die Nachfrage nach berufsbildenden Maßnahmen trotz des steigenden Anteils von Jugendlichen an der Gesamtgesellschaft nicht gestiegen. Unüberwindliche Hindernisse für die ärmere Bevölkerung sind die mangelnde schulische Vorbildung und die Kosten der Berufsausbildung. Die Angebote der Berufsbildungszentren sind oft nicht ausgelastet. Der Erwerb von beruflichen Fertigkeiten in Form eines Lehrverhältnisses ist in verschiedenen Regionen Afrikas für viele arme Jugendliche eine kostengünstige Alternative.

Die Berufsbildungszentren verfügen mehrheitlich über ein standardisiertes Kursangebot. Die dabei angebotenen Lern- und Ausbildungsfelder sind, außer bei den zusätzlich vorhandenen Lehrlingsangeboten, nicht vielseitig genug. Vor allem auf dem Land können Berufsbildungszentren zu einer Marktsättigung beitragen. Anreize wie die Bereitstellung von Werkzeug oder die Förderung der Anschaffung von Maschinen verzerren gar die Nachfrage nach berufsbildenden Maßnahmen.

Die Bildungsanbieter orientieren sich bei der Auswahl der Berufe an der gesellschaftlichen Nachfrage. Die Nachfrage des Arbeitsmarkts wird zweitrangig behandelt. Das führt zu einer Wiederholung des immer gleichen Kursangebots, das zu eng ausgelegt ist und das vor allem Mädchen und Frauen benachteiligt. Viele Jugendliche und ihre Eltern kennen die Chancen auf dem Arbeitsmarkt nicht; die Angebote zur beruflichen Orientierung sind in allen Berufsbildungsprojekten unzureichend. Auch wenn die Berufsausbildung im Rahmen einer Lehre mehr Möglichkeiten eröffnet, werden die Chancen des Arbeitsmarktes auch mit ihr nicht vollumfänglich genutzt.

Die Absolventen und Absolventinnen selbst zeigen sich mit der Qualität der gebotenen Ausbildung mehrheitlich zufrieden. Von außen betrachtet leidet die Qualität der Bildungsangebote an der unangemessenen Ausstattung zur Vermittlung praktischer Lerninhalte, an unzureichenden methodisch-didaktischen Kenntnissen der Ausbilder und Ausbilderinnen, an veralteten Lehrplänen und nicht angemessener Dauer der Kurse (manche Kurse sind zu kurz, andere zu allgemein gehalten). Die Berufsausbildung im Rahmen einer Lehre erfolgt am Arbeitsplatz selbst und orientiert sich weitestgehend am Arbeitsmarkt. Die Qualität dieser Art der Berufsausbildung steht und fällt mit der Wahl der richtigen Lehrperson und einer intensiven Begleitung.

Die meisten Bildungsprogramme beinhalten Beratung (oft informell) und die Förderung der Lebenskompetenz (*life skills*). Unternehmerische Fähigkeiten werden in allen Programmen vermittelt. Im vergangenen Jahrzehnt hat sich die Situation damit verbessert. Die Verankerung von betriebswirtschaftlichen und *life skill* - Themen in der praktischen Ausbildung lässt in den meisten Fällen jedoch noch zu wünschen übrig. Angesichts der Probleme, die vor allem Frauen auf dem Arbeitsmarkt haben, sollten größere Anstrengungen gemacht werden, konkrete Einkommensmöglichkeiten für Frauen zu erkennen und die Persönlichkeitsentwicklung von Frauen und Mädchen unter Gender- Gesichtspunkten in den Mittelpunkt zu stellen. Die spezifischen Herausforderungen für Frauen auf dem Arbeitsmarkt sollten durch Advocacyarbeit stärker thematisiert werden.

Zu den **direkten Wirkungen** stellt die Verbleibsstudie fest, dass 70 % der Absolventen und Absolventinnen entweder abhängig beschäftigt oder selbstständig tätig sind. 19 % sind beschäftigungslos, 7 % besuchen eine Weiterbildung, 4 % befinden sich in einem Lehrverhältnis. Von den 70 % Erwerbstätigen sind die Mehrheit (69 %) selbständig und 31 % abhängig beschäftigt. Dabei ist zu berücksichtigen, dass die Mehrzahl der Absolventen und Absolventinnen, die aus ihrer Region abgewandert sind, nicht erfasst werden konnten, da ihr Aufenthaltsort nicht auszumachen war. Positiv festzuhalten ist, dass schätzungsweise 60 % der Erwerbstätigen in dem von ihnen erlernten Berufsfeld tätig sind. Eine Mehrheit von ca. 64 % kann mit ihrem Einkommen 50 % oder weniger ihres tatsächlichen Bedarfs zum



Lebensunterhalt abdecken. *Jedoch geben nur 35 % an, dass sie mit ihrem Einkommen 75 % und mehr ihres benötigten Lebensunterhalts abdecken können.* Bei der Gruppe derjenigen, die mit ihrem Einkommen nur 25 % ihres Bedarfs oder weniger abdecken kann, handelt es sich um sehr junge Menschen, die sich entweder in einer Anlernphase oder noch auf Arbeitssuche befinden.

Die meisten Mitglieder der Fokusgruppendifkussionen sind weiterhin von der Unterstützung ihrer Familien abhängig. Das geringe Einkommen der Absolventen und Absolventinnen dürfte u.a. auf die Marktsättigung in einigen traditionellen Berufen und den harten Wettbewerb auf dem Arbeitsmarkt zurückzuführen sein. Weitere Gründe sind ausbeuterische Praktiken der Arbeitgeber im informellen Sektor und die große Zahl von Unternehmen, die dauernd um ihr Überleben kämpfen. Hinzu kommt, dass die Landbevölkerung ihr Einkommen üblicherweise sowohl aus handwerklichen und landwirtschaftlichen Tätigkeiten bezieht.

Im Durchschnitt liegt die Erwerbsrate der Männer 7 % über derjenigen der Frauen. Bei Frauen ist die Erwerbslosenquote 40 % höher als bei Männern. Insgesamt sind 30 % mehr Männer als Frauen abhängig beschäftigt. Etwa 65 % der Männer sind in dem von ihnen erlernten Berufsfeld tätig, bei den Frauen sind es nur 56 %. Im Durchschnitt verdienen Männer mehr und können mit dem erzielten Einkommen einen größeren Teil ihrer Lebenshaltungskosten decken. Aus diesen Zahlen folgt, dass Frauen auf dem Arbeitsmarkt noch immer benachteiligt sind.

Untersucht wurden auch die **indirekten Wirkungen** auf Einzelne (Verbesserung des individuellen Status) und auf das Gemeinwesen. Es gibt Anzeichen dafür, dass der Status junger Menschen in ihren Gemeinwesen durch eine Verbesserung der beruflichen Fähigkeiten ansteigt. Junge Männer wie Frauen geben an, dass ihr Ansehen bei Eltern und Altersgenossen nach Abschluss berufsbildender Maßnahmen zugenommen hat, auch wenn sie noch kein hohes Einkommen erzielen. Frauen betonen, dass eine Ausbildung ihren gesellschaftlichen Stand und die Chance auf eine Eheschließung erhöht. Obwohl dazu keine belastbaren Daten vorliegen, ist davon auszugehen, dass Berufsbildung und Entwicklung der Lebenskompetenz u.a. in Liberia und Sierra Leone zur Reintegration von Konflikten betroffener Gruppen in ihre Gemeinwesen beigetragen haben. Mehrere Beispiele zeigen, dass erfolgreiche Absolventen und Absolventinnen innerhalb ihrer Gemeinwesen zu Vorbildern werden können. Auch wenn sich diese indirekte Wirkung nur schwer quantifizieren lässt, leisten weibliche Absolventinnen mit ihrem Einkommen einen entscheidenden Beitrag zur Armutsreduzierung in den Familien. In Fällen, wo eine signifikante Anzahl von Personen eines Gemeinwesens berufsbildende Maßnahmen besucht und ihr Einkommen steigern kann, steigt die Wahrscheinlichkeit, dass die Armut auf Ebene des Gemeinwesens abnimmt. Da die befragten Absolventen und Absolventinnen auch ein bis fünf Jahre nach Abschluss der berufsbildenden Maßnahmen finanziell noch von ihren Familien abhängig sind, ist in den meisten Fällen von einer nur marginalen Wirkung auf die Armutsminderung auszugehen. Die indirekte Wirkung berufsbildender Maßnahmen auf die Linderung der Armut hängt wesentlich von externen Faktoren wie der gesamtwirtschaftlichen Lage ab. 24 % der selbständig tätigen Absolventen und Absolventinnen haben bereits andere angestellt und tragen so zur Weiterentwicklung der beruflichen Fertigkeiten in ihren Gemeinden bei. Legt man jedoch die Gesamtheit der befragten Personen zu Grunde, kommt man zu der Einschätzung, dass nur eine kleine Minderheit von 2 % anderen Arbeit geben.

Fragt man danach, ob und inwieweit die **Projektziele erreicht** wurden, kommt man zu dem Schluss, dass die beruflichen Fähigkeiten die Lebenssituation der meisten Begünstigten verbessert haben. Da die meisten von ihnen in den ersten Jahren noch von ihren Familien

abhängig sind, ist das Ziel, die Jugend auf eigene Beine zu stellen, wahrscheinlich nur zur Hälfte erreicht.

Ein Vergleich der drei Ansätze kommt zu folgenden Schlussfolgerungen:

- In Sachen Effizienz unterscheiden sich die Ansätze nicht wesentlich voneinander; entscheidend sind die Arbeitsmarktorientierung und die Qualität der berufsbildenden Maßnahmen.
- In Sachen Kosteneffizienz und kurzfristiger Kostennutzungsrechnung sind *non-formale* berufsbildende Maßnahmen und die Berufsausbildung im Rahmen einer Lehre den *formalen* Maßnahmen überlegen.
- Der formale Ansatz der Berufsbildungszentren bietet bessere Möglichkeiten zur Fortsetzung der fachlichen Ausbildung. Der Vorteil gegenüber anderen Anbietern ist aber nicht mehr existent, wenn die Absolventen und Absolventinnen in den vorwiegend informellen Arbeitsmarkt eintreten. Bei einer Weiterentwicklung des Arbeitsmarktes (z. B. in Schwellenländern) könnte eine formale Berufsbildung eine Voraussetzung von Beschäftigung werden. Dies ist in den untersuchten Ländern aber noch nicht der Fall; die überwältigende Mehrheit der arbeitenden Bevölkerung ist in der Landwirtschaft und im informellen Sektor tätig. Ein formaler Schulabschluss als Zugangsvoraussetzung, die lange Kursdauer und die Kosten der Ausbildung schließen arme Jugendliche von dieser Form der beruflichen Bildung aus. Formale Berufsbildung (TVET) ist das teuerste Modell.
- Für Ärmere, für Jugendliche ohne bzw. mit unzureichendem Zugang zum formellen Bildungswesen und für verheiratete Frauen, die ihr Einkommen durch eine zusätzliche berufliche Fertigkeit steigern wollen, ist es leichter, Zugang zu non-formalen Berufsbildungsangeboten zu erhalten. Oft mangelt es diesen jedoch an Qualität, da weder externe Kontrollmechanismen noch Qualitätsstandards vorhanden sind. Die neuen „kompetenzorientierten“ berufsbildenden Maßnahmen, die in der Region langfristig umgesetzt werden dürften, könnten non-formal und informell erworbene Fertigkeiten anerkennen und eine Verbindung zwischen formaler und non-formaler Berufsbildung schaffen.
- Die Berufsausbildung im Rahmen einer „verbesserten Lehre“ ist flexibel angelegt und nutzt die Ressourcen der Gemeinwesen vor Ort. Gut durchgeführt kann sie eine effektive und kostengünstige Alternative zur Ausbildung in Berufsbildungszentren sein. Besonders geeignet ist diese Form der Ausbildung, um marginalisierten Gruppen Zugang zu kostengünstigen Bildungsmaßnahmen zu ermöglichen und um Bildungsmaßnahmen im ländlichen Raum durchzuführen. Weniger geeignet ist dieses Modell für moderne Berufe, die systematischere Lehr- und Lernprozesse voraussetzen. Es kommt Männern mehr zugute als Frauen, solange die Projekte nicht mehr Betonung auf die Entwicklung der Persönlichkeit und Lebenskompetenz weiblicher Auszubildender legen.

Wie aus anderen Zusammenhängen bekannt, eröffnet eine kombinierte Ausbildung (Berufsbildungszentrum und Lehre) die besten Beschäftigungschancen. Voraussetzung ist jedoch, dass die Ausbildungsträger verstärkt und in eigener Initiative die Zusammenarbeit mit der Privatwirtschaft suchen. Noch wird dies von keinem der untersuchten Programme geleistet.

## Empfehlungen

Vor der Ableitung strategischer Empfehlungen sind die Ergebnisse der Evaluierung mit den Partnerorganisationen zu diskutieren.

Die Partner sollten darüber entscheiden, welche Zielgruppen in welchem Umfeld vorrangig erreicht werden sollen. Zielt die berufliche Bildung vor allem auf Armutsreduzierung ab, dürften *non-formale* Maßnahmen und die verbesserte Ausbildung im Rahmen einer Lehre zu empfehlen sein. Formale berufliche Bildung und Ausbildung sollte die Aufgabe von Regierungsinstitutionen bleiben, selbst wenn der Staat nicht über die erforderlichen Ressourcen verfügt, sollte dies tendenziell so bleiben. Kirchliche Bildungsträger und NRO, die von ausländischen Gebern finanziert werden, sollten sich vorrangig auf Gruppen konzentrieren, die keinen Zugang zum allgemeinen Bildungsangebot haben.

Für die oft vernachlässigte Landbevölkerung sind kostengünstige gemeinwesenorientierte Bildungsmaßnahmen vonnöten. In den ländlichen Gemeinden können Ansätze wie das Lernen im Rahmen eines Lehrverhältnisses und *non-formale* Kurse den örtlich vorhandenen Möglichkeiten angepasst und auch in integrierte ländliche Entwicklungsprogramme integriert werden.

Die Förderung der Beschäftigung von Frauen setzt mehr als nur eine qualitativ gute Ausbildung voraus. Die Partnerorganisationen sollten die Märkte beobachten und Beschäftigungs- und Verdienstmöglichkeiten für Frauen eruieren, die über die stereotypen Frauenberufe hinausgehen. Mehr Gewicht ist auf die Lebenskompetenz- und Persönlichkeitsentwicklung zu legen. Die Qualität dieser Unterrichtseinheiten ist zu verbessern, u.a. durch partizipative Methoden. Bei der sozialen Beratung sollte genderspezifisch verfahren werden. Der Zugang zum Arbeitsmarkt und die nicht vorhandene Chancengleichheit sind zum Gegenstand von *Advocacy*-Arbeit zu machen.

Die Effektivität und die darüber hinaus gehende Wirkung von Berufsbildungsprogrammen sind zu verbessern, und zwar durch:

- verstärkte Marktorientierung: Das Personal muss darin ausgebildet werden, wie man den Arbeitsmarkt beobachtet und Lehrpläne überarbeitet und anpasst;
- Berufsberatung;
- Verbesserung der praktischen Ausrichtung der Berufsbildungszentren: Praktika in kleinen und mittleren Unternehmen über mindestens drei Monate pro Ausbildungsjahr sollten die Regel werden.
- Schwerpunktverlagerung auf die Entwicklung der Persönlichkeit, d.h. genderspezifische Lerneinheiten in den Bereichen Lebenskompetenz und Unternehmensgründung müssen integriert werden.
- intensivere Unterstützung der Absolventinnen und Absolventen, damit diese ihre Aussichten auf eine Beschäftigung oder eine selbständige berufliche Tätigkeit verbessern. Dabei sollte besonderes Augenmerk auf die Frauen gelegt werden, die auf dem Arbeitsmarkt benachteiligt sind, aber auch, abhängig vom jeweiligen Kontext, auf besonders gefährdete junge Männer.

- Steigerung des Frauenanteils und der Qualifikationen der Frauen in Lehrkörper und Verwaltung.

Die Partnerorganisationen müssen ihr Qualitätsmanagement verbessern und sollten Instrumente der Wirkungsbeobachtung ausbauen bzw. einführen. Damit die Projekte die erwünschten Wirkungen entfalten können, sollten Verbleibstudien als Mittel der Projektsteuerung genutzt werden.

Berufsbildungsträger und Projekte sollten intensiver mit Gemeindeeinrichtungen und mit anderen Organisationen zusammenarbeiten, die ergänzende Dienstleistungen anbieten.

## Executive Summary

### Background

This comparative study, commissioned by EED in October 2008, has the aim to assess the outcomes and impacts of six vocational training programmes of EED partners in West Africa, and to learn from best practices. The study consisted of two parts, a tracer study and a main study. The tracer study covered a sample of approx. 27% of the 8000 graduates of the six projects between 2003 and 2007. The tracer study was coordinated by FAKT and independently conducted by the partner organisations with and without assistance of external consultants. The six case studies were conducted by two teams consisting of international, regional and national consultants. This report summarises the results of the six cases and elaborates in more detail on the relevance of the different VT approaches, the overall outcomes, the impacts as well as the lessons learned. It provides recommendations on strategic, conceptual and project management levels. This draft report is meant to initiate further discussion with EED and with the EED partners involved in this study process.

### Main findings and conclusions

The six VT projects can be sub-divided into the following clusters, although overlaps with regard to approaches and target groups exist: (1) centre based formal vocational education and training, (2) non-formal vocational training and (3) improved apprenticeship schemes. Some partners offer post training services so as to improve graduate's chances to wage and self employment. Two of the six partners operate in post conflict environments, two other partners are situated in a region with conflict potential and occasional outbreaks of violence.

The objectives of the six projects/ programmes are largely relevant to the national poverty reduction strategies and the needs of young men and women, for whom employment and income is a primary concern. The majority of the partners reach out to poor communities, which is a positive finding. Three of the six partners see employment promotion of females as their priority. Females in all the four countries face larger obstacles in the labour market than men and have less training options. In countries with greater conflict potential male youth prone to violence are another important target group of the VT programmes studied.

While the youth population has been growing in all the four countries, the demand for training has not in most cases. Costs of training and education requirements are access barriers of the poor. Most centre based programmes are operating below capacity. Skill acquisition through apprenticeship has become a low cost alternative for many poor youth in different parts of Africa.

Most training centres offer a standard set of conventional courses. The variety of training fields offered, with the exception of the apprenticeship schemes, is not sufficient. In some cases, especially in rural areas, centre based training can contribute to market saturation. The supply of incentives (tool kits or subsidised equipment) is influencing demand for training.

Social demand for training is the main criterion for training providers to select a trade, labour market demand comes second. This practice led to stereotype training programmes which do not offer a sufficient variety of training options, especially for females. Youth and their parents

are often not informed about labour market opportunities, vocational orientation and guidance is insufficient in all training programmes. Apprenticeship schemes offer a wider variety of options but in both cases they do not fully exploit all opportunities offered by the market.

The majority of graduates interviewed have been satisfied with the quality of training provided. From an external point of view the quality of training often suffers from inadequate facilities for practical training, lacking methodological skills of instructors, outdated curricula and inappropriate time allocation (some courses being too short or not enough specific). In the case of apprenticeship programmes the training takes place on the job and is largely market relevant. Decisive for the quality of these schemes is the appropriate selection of master trainers and close supervision.

Most training programmes entail elements of counselling, often provided in informal ways, and life skill training. All programmes offer entrepreneurship training. This is a positive achievement, considering the situation 10 years ago, but both, life skill and entrepreneurship topics are in most cases not sufficiently integrated in practical training. Considering the obstacles females face in the labour market, more emphasis must be given to identify income opportunities feasible for females, to stress gender specific personality development and to add advocacy so as to address the specific labour market challenges of females.

As to outcomes according to the tracer study results 70% of the graduates are either wage or self employed, 19% are unemployed, 7% pursue further education and 4% are in apprenticeship. Of the 70% employed a clear majority (69%) are self employed, 31% are wage employed. It is assumed that these figures do not include the majority of graduates who migrated, as they are more difficult to trace. It is estimated that approx. 60% of the persons employed work and earn income in their field of training. This is a positive achievement. The majority of graduates (approx. 64%) have an income that covers 50% and less of the basic needs. The majority of those earning 25% and less (approx. 35%) are young graduates who are possibly still in the process of learning on-the-job or searching for opportunities. The majority of graduates participating in focus groups are still depending on support from their families. The market saturation of some conventional trades and the high competition in the labour market are thought to be strong contributing factors for low incomes of graduates. Another reason is exploitive practices practiced by employers in the informal sector and the “survival mode” at which many enterprises operate. Furthermore, in rural areas it is common practice to have two sources of income: trade and agriculture.

The average employment rate of males is about 1.07 times higher than the rate for females. The average unemployment rate of females is 1.4 times higher than for males. The overall rate for wage employment is 1.3 times higher for males. An estimated 65% of males are working in the field of training compared to 56% of the females. On average males earn more and can cover their basic needs better with the income they get. These figures and trends confirm the finding that females face more obstacles than males in the labour market.

Impacts have been assessed at the level of individuals (improved status) and on communities. There are indications that vocational skills development is helping young people to improve their status in the communities. Young men and women alike reported about being more respected in their families and among peers after having learned a skill, even if the income earned is still low. Females stressed that having learned a skill improves their social standing and their chances to marry. Vocational training and life skill development has assisted integrating conflict affected groups back into their communities (Liberia, Sierra Leone) although concrete figures are not available. There are several cases of successful graduates who have become positive role models in their communities. Female graduates have become bread



winners in their families, which has an impact on poverty reduction at the family level, although these impacts are difficult to quantify. In cases where a substantial number of persons from one community has been trained and earn income poverty reduction at community level becomes feasible. In most cases it is assumed that the indirect impact of VT on poverty reduction is marginal, considering that the majority of graduates traced 1-5 years after graduation is still financially depending on their families. The indirect impact of VT on poverty alleviation is strongly influenced by external factors such as the overall economic situation. 24% of the self employed graduates are employing others, thus contributing to skills development in their communities. Taking the total sample of all graduates interviewed it is estimated that on average approx. 2% are employing others, which is a small minority.

With regard to achievement of project objectives it is concluded that the skills learned improve the livelihood perspectives of the majority of project beneficiaries. The aim of making youth self-reliant is possibly “half-way” achieved, as the majority of graduates are depending on family support in the first years after graduation.

As for the comparison of the three approaches it is concluded that:

- With regard to effectiveness none of the three approaches has a clear advantage over others; the most decisive is the labour market orientation and the quality of the training provided.
- The cost efficiency and the short-term cost benefit are higher for non-formal and apprenticeship training compared to formal vocational education and training.
- Formal centre based VT offers graduates more prospects for continuous technical education but graduates have no real advantage over other competitors once they directly enter the largely informal labour market. If labour markets develop (e.g. in emerging economies) formal VT may become a condition for employment, but this is not yet the case in the countries studied, where the vast majority of the working population works in agriculture and the informal sector. Education as an entry criterion, the long duration of courses and the costs of training are excluding factors for the poor. Formal TVET is the most costly training model.
- Non-formal VT is better accessible for the poor, for youth who has no or inadequate access to formal education and for married women who want to learn a new skill for income generation. It often lacks quality as there are no external control mechanisms and no benchmarks set for quality standards. New “competency based” TVET systems, as possibly implemented in the region in the long term, may certify skills acquired non-formally and informally and may create a link between non-formal and formal vocational training.
- Improved apprenticeship schemes use community resources and are flexible by nature. If well managed they can be an effective and low cost alternative to centre based training. They are especially suitable for: (1) providing marginalised groups with access to low cost skills development, and (2) for skills development in rural areas. They are less suitable for modern trades which require a more systematic process of teaching and learning and may be more beneficial for men than for women, unless projects place more emphasis on personality and life skill development of female trainees.

Cooperative training models which combine elements of centre based training with apprenticeship schemes may have the highest potential for employment, as cases from other

contexts show. This requires from the training providers to proactively seek collaboration with the private sector, which is lacking in all programmes observed.

### Key recommendations

Before making strategic recommendations the results of this study need to be discussed with partners first.

Partners should decide on which target groups in which contexts to focus. If VT is to emphasise on poverty reduction non-formal VT and improved apprenticeship schemes may be more appropriate. Formal technical and vocational education should probably remain a domain of government funded institutions, unless government institutions do not have the capacities to provide adequate service. NGO and church based training providers depending on foreign donors should primarily target groups who have no access to mainstream training offers.

Low cost- community based training solutions are needed to increase outreach of VT to neglected rural communities. Training models such as apprenticeship training and non-formal courses organised in communities using existing facilities can also be applied by integrated rural development programmes.

Promotion of employment of females needs more than good quality training. Partners need to survey markets and identify employment and income opportunities beyond the stereotype set of trades offered to females at the moment. More emphasis is required for life skill and personality development, the quality of these sessions (e.g. use of participatory methods) needs to be improved. Social counselling should be gender specific. Advocacy is needed to address labour access and inequality issues.

To increase effectiveness and impact VT programmes need improvement in:

- The labour market orientation of training programmes: staff need to be trained in conducting labour market surveys and in curriculum revision/ modification
- Vocational counselling and guidance
- Improvement of practical orientation of centre based training: attachments to small and medium enterprise of at least 3 months per training year should become a standard
- Focus on self-employment: i.e. by better integrating gender specific life skill and entrepreneurship training
- Intensifying post training support with the aim to enhance graduate's prospects for wage and self employment, priority should be given to female graduates as they face greater entry barriers into the labour market and possibly to vulnerable male youth depending on context
- Increasing the number and capacity of female staff in teaching and management

Partners need to improve quality management of training and should intensify (or implement) measures of regular outcome monitoring. Tracer studies should become a management tool for steering projects towards the desired outcomes.

VT institutions and projects should take measures to better cooperate with community structures and other organisations providing complementary services.



# 1 Introduction

## 1.1 Background, objectives and focus of the study

The EED evaluation unit, in cooperation with the regional desks, regularly commissions studies on cross cutting issues which are of strategic importance. The topics may refer to a certain region (group of countries) as well as to certain sectors. The aim of those studies is to find answers to key questions that have come up in these projects in the passed years of cooperation and to give orientation for the coming cooperation – for EED as well as for the partner organisations. In some of the studies – like in this one – there is a special focus on finding out about the ‘outcome and impact’ with the purpose of learning about best practices.

Vocational training and employment promotion of youth is one of the programme priorities of EED in West Africa. EED has been funding vocational skills training initiatives (in short called “VT”) in the region for several decades. Although VT projects have been evaluated and consulted on an individual basis from time to time, there has not been a comprehensive study which, in a broader sense, assessed the effectiveness, impact and relevance of the different VT approaches in their specific contexts. This study is meant to fill the gap.

Main purpose of this study is to assess the effectiveness of different approaches of vocational training in their respective contexts. The study gives special attention to assessing the employment and income situation of VT graduates and the impacts on families and communities. It further analyses quality and the efficiency of the programmes/ projects. Special attention is given to analysing the relevance of the VT approaches and methods in each context and to drawing lessons learned for improvement and good practice.

*(for TOR see Annex 1)*

## 1.2 Scope of the study

The comparative study covered four countries: Sierra Leone, Liberia, Ghana and Nigeria, and six EED partners. For each partner, a detailed case study report was produced by the consultants.

The VT approaches studied can be broadly categorised as follows:

- Formal, school-based vocational education with courses of rather long duration
- Non-formal centre based vocational skills training
- Improved traditional apprenticeship schemes

This report summarises the key results of the six case studies and elaborates in more detail on the following guiding questions:

1. What happened to the graduates (males/ females) of the vocational training courses? Are there any recognisable trends on how many of them (males/ females) find jobs or regular income through self employment?

2. What are the factors that have a key influence on the results of vocational training? Which approaches are adequate for which context and circumstances?
3. What can be learned from the indirect effects – intended or unintended - of the vocational training measures and how can the lessons learnt become guiding for future projects?

It further elaborates on the relevance of the approaches, the key criteria for success and provides recommendations for improvement and good practice.

### 1.3 Methodological approach and overview of activities

In a first step, partners were asked to provide essential “**pre-study information**” on:

- criteria partners use to select trades and courses
- demand for VT
- the project/ programme outputs (number and field of people trained)
- the costs of training, and
- tracer data (employment status of graduates 6-12 months after graduation)

A questionnaire was developed with inputs of the team of consultants and distributed to each partner. The review of the data received, of narrative reports and project evaluations showed that most of the six EED partners did not have valid information on the employment status of their graduates. The partners that were engaged in regular post training follow up did not collect information in a systematic manner, e.g. analysis was lacking to what extent a person employed works in the field of training or not. Thus it was decided to organise the study in three sequences:

1. **Tracer studies**, to be conducted by each EED partner
2. **Compilation of tracer data**, formulation of hypothesis and discussion of arising issues
3. **Main study**, conducted by a team of international and regional/ local consultants together with the respective partner organisations.

Purpose of the tracer study was to establish a resource base for the main study on programme quality, effectiveness and impact. The main study was meant to verify the tracer study results with partners and target groups and to elaborate more in detail on project/ programme quality, impacts and relevance, using the expertise of international and regional/ local consultants.

### 1.3.1 Methodology and scope of the tracer study

The tracer studies were supposed to broadly cover three key areas:

- the **quality** of VT measures: the degree of satisfaction with the training provided
- the **effectiveness** or direct outcomes: the utilisation of skills learned by graduates for income generation, the employment situation of graduates, change in the income situation and the quality of employment
- elements of **impact**, e.g. the creation of jobs by graduates

The tracer studies were conducted from November to December 2008 (Liberia and Ghana) and January to February 2009 (Nigeria and Sierra Leone). Coordination was the task of FAKT; the entire process took place over the distance (follow up largely by using mobile phones).

Table 1: number of graduates traced and sample size per partner

	Number of Graduates as per pre study information	Number of Graduates Interviewed	Percentage
<b>LOIC</b>	885/952 <sup>1</sup>	213	24%/22%
<b>MTS</b>	290	110	38%
<b>OICG</b>	659	202	31%
<b>SLOIC</b>	3031	470	16%
<b>VTF</b>	2129	1043	49%
<b>YOWDAST</b>	944	158	17%
<b>Total</b>	<b>7938/8005</b>	<b>2196</b>	<b>27%-28%</b>

#### Tools for data collection and documentation

A sample interview guide, a matrix for data compilation and a guide for conducting the tracer study was designed by FAKT together with other consultants. The draft was shared with one of the partners (VTF). The idea of conducting a pilot phase for testing and reviewing the tools was dropped because of the tight schedule for the tracer study. Initially, it was envisaged to finalise data collection and analysis till the end of December 2008. Delays, especially because of the security situation in Nigeria, and delays in communication with partners resulted in the postponement of the entire study.

It was planned to use Microsoft Excel or internet based IT systems for data compilation and IT based analysis. Because of the limited know how of some partners in using IT software it was decided to use simple WORD formats which could be filled even by hand, with the limitation

<sup>1</sup> According to the pre-study information there are 885 graduates; the case study report says 952 graduates.

that cross-analysis of the raw data after the initial compilation by partners/ local consultants was no longer possible.

### Selection of respondents

The method for selection of respondents was supposed to be a combination of random sampling and purposive sampling using three categories: year of graduation, gender and trades. The study was supposed to cover graduates from 2003 to 2007.

In practice, systematic random sampling was hardly possible. The main challenge was the tracing itself. Vocational training graduates, especially males, are mobile in their search for job and income opportunities. The other challenge was the lack of a reliable information base in most projects. Only those partners who carry out regular tracing studies and follow ups (two out of six) did have a data base with names and contacts of graduates, the others did not. Even for those who did, contacts had changed in many cases. Thus, respondents were finally chosen according to their availability.

### Data collection

The main method for data collection was structured personal interviewing using the interview guide provided by FAKT. The interview guide was used without any modification. One partner (OICG) used phone interviews for about 10% of the sample. In addition partners and consultants documented case studies.

Especially in rural areas the tracing of graduates was a time- and energy consuming process, which involved in some cases extensive travelling. In other cases, when contact data was available and up-to-date, respondents were called to a centre for individual interviewing.

Three organisations conducted the tracer study without assistance of external consultants: VTF, SLOIC and OICG

- VTF is not a training provider but an organisation that is engaged in networking and capacity building of training providers (VTI). VTF has initiated a process and trained staff of the VTIs and other training providers to regularly carry out tracer studies. In this case a local consultant introduced the VTF personnel and staff appointed by VTF partners in the methods for data collection and data compilation. The actual data collection was done by staff of the VTI, in some cases the task was executed by persons who were not trained.
- SLOIC conducted the tracer study with the teaching staff in Bo and Mattru Jong. The staff had not received training in carrying out surveys of this kind.
- In the case of OICG, the tracer study was conducted by project personnel who are responsible for post training follow up. OICG has experiences in conducting tracer studies.

In the cases of LOIC, MTS and YOWDAST, the tracer study was coordinated by local consultants. In the case of LOIC, all the data collection was done by an external team. In Nigeria, both partners were supported by the consultant in preparing the study, in identification of graduates and in data collection. About 50% of the interviews were done by the consultant, the others by staff.

### 1.3.2 Compilation of tracer data and analysis of results

Compilation of the raw data per trade was done by the EED partners or by the local consultant on behalf of the partner. The raw data (questionnaires) remained with the partners. Final compilation and pre-analysis of data per partner was done by FAKT.

A review of the preliminary tracer study findings took place in the beginning of March 2009 at EED. Afterwards, two workshop sessions were organised by VTF and OICG in Ghana for discussion of tracer study results and clarification of open issues. In Liberia, Sierra Leone and Nigeria, the review of the tracer study data was part of the main study. In Nigeria, the review included a post-screening of the raw data for in-depth analysis of findings per trade and identification of additional case studies. Prior to the field studies consultants formulated hypothesis and open questions on the basis of the tracer study results.

### 1.3.3 Main study

The main study consisted of the six case studies carried out by different teams of consultants. For the results of each study see the case study reports. Each case study took about 3-4 days exclusive travelling. In total it lasted 42 days.

#### Sequencing

The six case studies (here called “main study”) were organised in the following sequence:

No.	Activity	Objective
1	Introductory meeting with management team and staff	Clarification of study objectives consultants get an overview of project activities and VT methods applied planning of activities
2	Discussion of tracer study results	linking tracer study to main study identifying open issues for further clarification
3	Interviews with management and key staff involved in VT	consultants to gain more insights in the programme assessing quality of project/ programme
4	Focus group discussions with trainees and graduates	verification of tracer study results gaining more insights into project quality, effectiveness and impact

No.	Activity	Objective
5	Group interviews and individual interviews with stakeholders	learning about stakeholders' perspectives for triangulation of results
6	Site visits, observation of activities	collecting additional case studies, triangulation of tracer and FGD results
7	Feedback session with partner	sharing and verification of findings elaboration of recommendations and additional ideas with partner

### Methodologies used

The consultants applied a range of methodologies in order to collect additional information on impact, cross check with results of the tracer study and verify information:

- Use of pre-study information of each centre visited and quantitative results of tracer study
- Semi-structured interviews with management staff and trainers/ teachers and/ or field workers of partner organisations
- Semi-structured and open interviews with resource persons (government, collaborating institutions)
- Intensive focus group discussions with graduates and present trainees, including methods such as:
  1. Most significant change
  2. Story telling
  3. Scoring and ranking
- Individual interviewing of graduates, case studies and photo-documentation
- Observation of workshop sites and training venues
- Where possible, observation of classroom teaching
- Self evaluation of training measures (with graduates and trainees) using scales
- Workshop sessions and informal discussion of results with partner

For structuring the data collection process, the consultants used a study checklist (see study tools, annex 3).

Results of focus groups discussions and self assessments and the complete results of the tracer studies were documented in the annex of the case study reports. The teams of consultants drafted their reports individually with inputs of the local/ regional consultants. Draft reports were sent to partners for comments. Some comments have still to be received (status 13th July, 2009).

## 1.4 Limitations and validity of the data collected

*This comparative study was not designed as a scientific impact study, which would require a different design, a longer time frame and subsequently more resources. Furthermore, any study designed to meet scientific standards would have to deal with the same common challenges on the ground such as mobility of graduates and missing baseline data.*

As said above, random selection for respondents of tracer studies and focus groups was hardly possible. This limits the validity of the quantitative data because:

- labour migrants are not equally covered (majority supposedly being male)
- in some cases selection by partners may have favoured the more successful cases

Other limiting factors:

- Lack of baseline information (four of the six partners do not keep records about the percentage of trainees who are/ have already been working and generating income before training) and lack of reliable regular tracer data (regular monitoring results) for cross checking and trend analysis
- Some of the questions may have been difficult to understand for the interviewer and/ or the respondent. In some cases interviewers were not properly introduced to the task so that some questions have been misunderstood
- Because of the time pressures to implement the tracer studies and the distances involved it was not feasible to test the interview guide in the field
- The short time available for every partner during the main study (3-4 days max.)

Several projects provided (or used to provide) incentives to graduates (tool kits, equipment subsidies), which may have influenced responses.

Results of the tracer study have been cross checked with results of focus groups discussions (FGD) and observations. In some cases (VTF, OICG and YOWDAST), results of this study could be cross-checked with tracer statistics conducted by the partner organisation. The cross checking made it possible to come up with fairly consolidated findings on effectiveness, in particular on the utilisation of skills learned and the actual employment status.

It has been more challenging to measure the outcomes and impacts on the “higher end” of the impact chain, i.e.:

- a. degree of change of income as a result of the skills training
- b. degree of coverage of basic needs with the income earned
- c. improved social status of an individual
- d. indirect impact of VT on communities
- e. indirect impact on gender roles
- f. indirect impact on peace and conflict



Findings from the tracer study on (a.) and (b.) are subjective and influenced by expectations of individuals, the ways questions were asked by the different interviewers and the analysis by partners. Wherever possible, results have been cross-checked with FGD, although the sample size of FGD was significantly lower than that of the tracer study.

Impacts (c.) to (e.) have been addressed by FGD and case studies. Respondents were beneficiaries and internal and external resource persons. Case studies and FGD results give information on changes in social status from the point of view of beneficiaries but again, results are influenced by subjectivity of the respondents. Information on (d.) to (f.) was additionally collected from interviews with internal and external resource persons with or without affiliation to the project. No systematic cross-checking of results was possible with community groups or parents (indirect beneficiaries). Unlike community development programmes (which deal with groups of people in one specific community), vocational training institutions and projects target individuals sometimes from a wide catchment area. Imagine assessing the impact of a VT programme on communities in a city of 1.5 Million or of a region covering more than 100.000 km<sup>2</sup> (example MTS), which may sound a bit like finding a drop of water in the ocean.

## 1.5 Team of consultants and coordination of the study

In total, five consultants were involved in the different stages of the study. James Yarsiah and his team of young Liberian consultants conducted the tracer study in Liberia. Rehab David carried out the two tracer studies in Nigeria together with MTS and YOWDAST. Both consultants took part in the main study. Adom Gharthey, a TVET consultant from Ghana, supported VTF in conceptualising the tracer study with their partner VTIs and facilitated two tracer study review workshops with OICG and VTF. Dr. Gisela Burckhardt (freelance consultant) and Ralf Lange (FAKT) were the international consultants. Matija Maturanec of FAKT coordinated the tracer study and compiled the tracer results. Overall coordination of the implementation of the study was the task of FAKT<sup>2</sup>. Hedwig Schlags of the evaluation desk of EED has been overseeing the study process on behalf of EED. The regional desks of the Africa 1 department of EED were closely involved in the design of the ToR, communication with partners, and discussion of and feedback to study results.

<sup>2</sup> FAKT is a non-profit consultancy firm affiliated with protestant church development work, based in Germany. FAKT has been engaged in the dialogue on VT with AG-KED partners in West Africa since the mid-nineties.



The case studies were carried out by the following teams:

Liberia Opportunities Industrialisation Centres (visit of 2 centres) Sierra Leone Opportunities Industrialisation Centres (visit of 2 centres) Vocational Training Programme for Females, Ghana (visit of 5 centres)	Dr. Gisela Burckhardt and James Yarsiah
Opportunity Industrialisation Centre Ghana, Livelihood Enhancement Project Kumasi	Ralf Lange and James Yarsiah
EYN Masons Technical School, Garkida Nigeria Youth and Women Development Association for Social Transformation, Ganye Nigeria	Ralf Lange and Rehab David

## 2 Context

### 2.1 Background of partners and VT projects/ programmes

*This section describes in brief the background of the EED partners studied, the VT approaches implemented and the project/ programme*

#### 2.1.1 Overview

For all six partners, Vocational Training is the main activity. For four partners, EED is the only donor, the other two (OICG and SLOIC) receive funding for their core operations from their respective governments. The table below provides an overview of the history of the partner-ship, the VT approaches implemented and the project/ programme outputs.

Table 2: Overview of partners

Name of Organisation	Date Established	Starting date of Funding by EED	VT Approach	Number of Graduates 2003-07
Liberia Opportunities Industrialization Centres (LOIC)	1977	1983	Non-formal vocational training	885/952
Masons Technical School (MTS)	1991	1999	Formal vocational education and training	290
Opportunities Industrialization Centres Ghana (OICG)	1971	2001	Improved apprenticeship scheme and business start up assistance	659
Sierra Leone Opportunities Industrialization Centres (SLOIC)	1977	1991	Non-formal vocational training	3031
Vocational Training for Females Programme (VTF)	1992	1992	VTF: networking, lobbying and capacity building VTF supported VTI: Formal vocational training	2129
Youth and Women Development Association for Social Transformation (YOWDAST)	1996	1999	Improved apprenticeship scheme	944

## 2.1.2 Liberia Opportunity Industrialisation Centres (LOIC)

LOIC was established in 1977. Its mission is to “assist with Liberia’s post-war recovery, re-construction and development through human capacity building, social service delivery and rehabilitation of war-affected individuals”<sup>3</sup> Since 1992 LOIC efforts were mainly concentrated on the rehabilitation and resettlement of war affected youth and ex-combatants. With progress made in rehabilitation and resettlement, this focus has now changed. Most of the former international donors have phased out their support since the end of the 90s. EED provides funding for non-formal vocational training in three satellite centres. All of these centres are situated in rural towns; two of them were visited by the evaluation team (Gbarnga, Sinje).

The training approach is centre-based, non-formal vocational training. Before the war, the training lasted 18 months. After the war, it was shortened to six months in order to cater for the immediate training needs of ex-combatants for demobilisation. Since last year, the training has been extended to nine months. Courses are offered in the following trade areas: carpentry, masonry, metal works, small engine repair, tailoring, tie dye, pastry and agriculture. At the end of each training cycle, the program offers a training package, referred to as ‘resettlement package’ which comprises tools, materials or supplies, depending on the particular trade area. At present, there are no internship programs and no job placements undertaken by LOIC.

## 2.1.3 Sierra Leone Opportunities Industrialization Centres (SLOIC)

SLOIC was established in 1977, the town of Bo became the first training site. SLOIC is focusing on underprivileged/ marginalized sectors of communities, mainly unskilled and unemployed youths, by providing life and vocational skills training to facilitate job creation for employment and self reliance for personal and community development.

SLOIC manages four training centres, namely Bo (BVTC 1976), Freetown/ Lungi (FVTC 1996; Lungi 2005), Makeni (MVTC 1990) and Mattru Jong (MJTC 1993); the Lungi centre was created after the centre in Freetown was closed down. There are satellite stations attached to some of the centres in Makeni and Mattru Jong which are catering to outlying communities. Major donors have been EED and USAID, the government of Sierra Leone provides subsidies to staff salaries. The evaluation team visited the centres Bo and Mattru Jong.

The training approach is centre-based, non-formal vocational training. In addition, SLOIC has facilities for small business training. Eight trade areas were initially started: electricity, carpentry, masonry, auto mechanics, metal works, agriculture, and home management. Except for the largest centre in Bo, not all courses were offered at each centre; courses were selected based on local needs. In Mattru Jong, boat making and weaving components were added. Originally the training course lasted 18 months. During and after the war the duration had to be shortened because there was a high need for semi-skilled workers. SLOIC has now

<sup>3</sup> Quote from OIC International Website.

decided to increase the duration again (12 months training and six months internship), which brings it close to the formal, school based training approach.

Over the years, SLOIC has developed among government and the larger society the credibility and recognition of being one of the leading institutions for vocational and technical training in the country.

## 2.1.4 Vocational Training for Females Programme (VTF), Ghana

VTF was started in 1992 by the Presbyterian Church of Ghana with support of EED, in response to the high unemployment rate among the youth and especially females. Its vision is to create '*females with employable skills having sustainable livelihoods*'. VTF facilitates employable skills training of non-governmental and governmental vocational training institutions (VTIs). Activities include promotion of female trainees to create and set up enterprises on a sustainable basis, provision of career counselling to help female trainees to find employment, strengthening of females socially and politically, networking with partners in VT, training of trainers and instructors of TVET institutions and advocacy for a positive TVET system.

a) VTF works with a total of 42 VTIs. Those 42 VTIs consist of 10 church-based VTIs, 24 VTIs under the Community Development Department of the Ministry of Local Government and 8 VTIs under the National Vocational Training Institute (NVTI) of the Ministry of Employment. The VTIs are situated in urban, semi urban and rural environments. The evaluation team split up and therefore could visit altogether five VTIs (Anglican Voc. Inst. at Teshie-Accra, St Mary VTI at Asamankese, PREVOC at Begoro ,CYO, Sovie, EPTTC, Alavanyo Volta region)

The VTIs supported by VTF all adopt a centre-based vocational training approach, working with graduates of primary and junior secondary schools and dropouts. Most of the VTIs train girls. The certification offered by VTIs is accredited by the GoG.

## 2.1.5 Masons Technical School, Garkida, North East Nigeria

Masons' Technical School (MTS) was established in 1991 by an American missionary. The aim, according to the MTS mission statement developed in 2008, is "to create job opportunities through the provision of vocational, technical, Christian and moral education capable of making the youth self-reliant, thereby reducing social vices in the society."<sup>4</sup> Legal owner is the EYN Church (Ekklesiar Yan'uwa). From 1992 to 1998, MTS received financial support from BftW, starting from 1999, EED became the principal donor.

MTS started small, with one automotive section and nine students (one female) who graduated in 1993. Today, MTS has five training departments (automotive, carpentry, tailoring, computer, electrical installation/ electronics). A sixth department (catering) is due to be opened after the school holidays in June/ July. New classrooms for computer and a workshop for tailoring are presently under construction.

The VT approach of MTS is formal vocational education except for two courses which are more practice oriented. Four of the six courses offered last two years. Students undertake industrial attachment, one month in the first year and three months in the second. The certification (MTS diploma) is not accredited by the government. Entry criterion is successful graduation of senior secondary education. The entry test focuses on English and Maths, the first year of training focuses on general education and trade theory. MTS is situated in a rural town. The catchment area is the North East of Nigeria, with the majority of trainees coming from the Adamawa and Borno State. MTS offers boarding facilities. The centre is not engaged in post training follow up services.

## 2.1.6 Opportunities Industrialization Centres Ghana (OICG), Livelihood Enhancement Project for Youth in the Kumasi Metropolis

The Opportunities Industrialisation Centre Ghana was established as an NGO in 1971. It was the first OIC affiliate in Africa, looking back on almost four decades of experience in providing vocational training. OICG operates three vocational training centres situated in Accra, Sekondi Takoradi and Kumasi. The Ministry of Employment and Social Welfare provides financial support to these centres.

In 1999, OICG started a pilot project of "improved informal apprenticeship" with EU funding in Sekondi-Takoradi. The EED funded project in Kumasi, subject of this case study, commenced in 2001. Its overall goal is to contribute towards the alleviation of poverty among Ghanaian youth, the project objective is to facilitate placement of Kumasi youth into employment and to assist project graduates owning a business to increase incomes. The project operates in an urban environment.

<sup>4</sup> Quote from strategic plan, 2008, p..9.

The approach applied is called “improved apprenticeship”. Youths selected by the project are placed into apprenticeships with master trainers on the basis of an agreement. All youth are school drop outs who have not reached senior secondary level. The project pays a training fee and provides training materials. It offers a number of additional inputs which aim at “adding value” to informal apprenticeship such as orientation seminars for master trainers and trainees before the training starts, training on entrepreneurship and life skills for trainees and upgrading for master trainers in instruction methodologies. OICG provides business and social counselling to trainees during and up to one year after training (in some cases longer) and provides loans for business start ups. The loan scheme is small scale and presently on hold.

### 2.1.7 Women Development Association for Social Transformation (YOWDAST), Ganye Nigeria

The Youth and Women Development Association for Social Transformation (YOWDAST) was founded in 1996 by the Lutheran Church of Christ of Nigeria. YOWDAST is a membership organisation that aims at combating poverty in one of the most backward and marginalised areas of Nigeria. In 1999, YOWDAST started the Youth and Women Skill Acquisition Project (YOWSAP) with funding from EED. The project objective is to provide youth and women with the necessary vocational skills which will alleviate them from poverty and make them self reliant. YOWSAP is the only project of YOWDAST, except for some small scale adult education initiatives. The project is operating in four local government units which cover the southern part of the Adamawa State out of which two were visited during the main study.

The vocational training approach used is informal apprenticeship. Most of the trainees come from rural communities. YOWDAST mobilises communities, involves communities in selection of trainees, provides orientation seminars to masters and trainees before the training starts and provides some follow up during the training phase. Workshops are organised once per year for trainees, graduates and masters respectively. They cover a range of topics, from entrepreneurship to civil rights and conflict prevention issues. YOWDAST, in collaboration with government institutes, also provides skill upgrading to trainees, graduates and masters once in a while.

Trainees select the master trainer themselves, preferably close to their homes. Most of the skill training is on-the-job. YOWDAST has been attaching trainees to enterprises in 17 different trade areas; the majority of trainees is female. The organisation pays a training fee (flat rate for all trades). The training is supposed to last one year, in practice it is often longer. YOWDAST is not paying for materials or transport. On graduation day graduates are given a piece of equipment and/ or tools of which YOWDAST has paid 50% of the costs, the rest has to be contributed by the trainee. In the past, the self contribution was 30%. YOWDAST does provide some limited follow up, but not regular.

## 2.2 Labour market context

The principal challenge for all African economies over the next decade is to create productive employment for 7 to 10 Million annual new entrants into the labour market<sup>5</sup>. Population growth rates in West Africa are amongst the highest in the world (on average between 2.5 – 2.7%). Although economic progress has been made in the region, economic growth and particularly growth of employment has been lower than population growth. The effects of the current financial and economic crises on the local economies in West Africa have yet to be seen. The decline in remittances from overseas migrant workers are an indirect threat to the local labour markets.

Comprehensive labour force data is not available in any of the four countries. Labour market and TVET studies as well as discussions with policy makers during this study show that even in Ghana, which has made modest economic progress in the past years (average GDP-growth rate of 6,2% in 2005-08)<sup>6</sup>, the growth of job opportunities in the formal sector of the economy is insignificant with respect to the whole economy. The best possibilities may exist in modern growth oriented industrial sectors such as ICT. On the whole, probably less than 5-10% of the entire work force earns a livelihood in the formal economic sectors, public sector included. In the war affected economies of Liberia and Sierra Leone this percentage is thought to be smaller. Agriculture and the informal sector (also called subsistence economy) is the major source of livelihood for the vast majority of young people leaving and graduating from school. Working conditions in the informal sector are often harsh and employment conditions are generally unstable. Workers have no security; payments are made on a daily basis and depend on the jobs available. Interviews with graduates show that the boundaries between wage and self employment are often blurred.

With the number of job-seekers increasing every day, labour absorption capacity of the informal sector is limited, with the result that competition in some sub-sectors is increasing and earnings are declining. This trend is particularly visible in economic sub-sectors where business entry barriers and skill requirements are low, where supply of labour is plentiful and job and thus income opportunities stagnate. In hair braiding, a common business for females in urban Ghana, earnings for starters are often just above the poverty level (about 1.5 US\$ a day). The small scale Batik industry has virtually collapsed because of imports of cheap textiles from the Far East.

In other sectors, especially those which have experienced growth in the past years and which have seen technological advancement that require workers with better skills, job and income opportunities do exist. Individual cases of graduates show that decent livelihoods are possible in sectors where well skilled workers are in need. One example is the construction industry. Skilled persons can even make a living in trades which are widely thought to be saturated such as carpentry and tailoring, given that a person has both, employable skills and determination to succeed in the market. New income opportunities arise with the increase in trading of cheap industrial goods, even in rural areas. In rural Nigeria the sales of cheap Chinese motorbikes has been sharply increasing in the past years, which in turn offered new income

<sup>5</sup> Skills development in Sub-Saharan Africa, World Bank, 2004.

<sup>6</sup> According to World Bank: World Development Indicators.



opportunities for traders of spare parts and motorbike mechanics alike. The import of second hand electronic goods of all sorts has increased in the entire region. This trend plus the widespread use of mobile phones is opening doors for new income opportunities for both sexes. The final quote comes from an Indian consultant on the subject of entrepreneurship who has been working in Africa: “where there are people there are business opportunities”.

## 2.3 Labour market challenges for TVET

TVET systems in Africa face a common challenge: they are rooted in the colonial history, are often geared towards formal sector employment and do not recognise the potential of traditional African systems of skill acquisition, namely informal or traditional apprenticeship. While informal enterprises venture into the era of new technologies (indeed, you can learn repairing a mobile phone or operating a business centre “on the job”), vocational training providers tend to stick to a set of conventional trades often without noticing that new market opportunities arise. The same applies to the national TVET systems where curricula often remained unchanged for several decades without any modifications, despite changes in technologies and markets.

Experiences from West Africa (Ghana) and East Africa (Kenya) show that TVET institutions lost ground in the past two decades. They commonly face three challenges: the challenge of access, the challenge of relevance and the challenge of costs. Two factors effectively exclude the poor from formal TVET: the costs of vocational training (if not subsidised by government) and senior secondary education as a selection criterion for formal TVET. As seen in Ghana today (and a decade before in Kenya), many young people are turning away from costly, school based vocational training and seek training opportunities in the informal economy which they believe give them better chances to get a job. The signs have been obvious: although the number of young job seekers is on the increase, the demand for vocational training in VTI has often declined.

Facing the crisis of youth unemployment, the promotion of self-employment is seen by many as the solution. But can self-employment be learned in a VTI or technical school? VTI trainees are trained and educated in a sheltered “school-like” environment. They often have no experience with the reality of the market unless they were exposed to it before the training (through the family, in the community) or sufficiently during the training (through well organised industrial attachments or internships). Studies carried out in other contexts showed that VTI graduates, although often being technologically more qualified than people trained on the job in the informal sector, faced greater difficulties in entering the market. Advantages of being trained on the job included:

- Learning the practical skills that are demanded in the market place
- Learning the unwritten social and business rules of the market
- Becoming connected to the right people and learning to network

These earlier findings amongst other issues raised in the ToR have been put to the test in this study.



## 2.4 TVET systems and actors in West Africa

A general feature of TVET systems in West Africa is their fragmentation. In Ghana, at least six ministries are involved in providing vocational skills development. Of the four countries covered by the study, Ghana has made the biggest move in the last decade towards reforming its TVET system. The Ministry of Education and Sports made TVET one of its strategic objectives. In 2004, a draft policy framework was developed for TVET, in 2007 the act was passed after which COTVET is supposed to be established as a council which oversees implementation of the TVET policy. NGOs shall have a seat in COTVET, the EED partner VTF is playing a vital role in this process. In Ghana the majority of TVET institutions are private, many of which are church based. Ghanaian non governmental VTI receive funding from the government, the same applies to SLOIC.

In Liberia and Sierra Leone, TVET institutions have substantially suffered during the long years of civil war. Facilities were destroyed or looted and over a long period of time there have been no input in developing the TVET systems and its human resources with the effect that most institutions operate below minimum requirements and teaching staff have a qualification level that is only little better than that of their trainees. In **Sierra Leone**, TVET is considered one of the strategies for poverty reduction. There are about 300 registered TVET institutions and plans to construct more, which is quite a significant number considering the small size of the country (total population: 4.076.871<sup>7</sup>. The percentage of the population holding a senior secondary school (SSS) certificate is 4.2% (207.228)<sup>8</sup>). Funding for Demobilisation, Disarmament and Reintegration programmes (DDR) in the early years after the war has contributed to the increase of TVET institutions. Presently, the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports is starting a process to develop a TVET policy. In **Liberia**, the end of the war is more recent, as are the efforts to revitalise TVET. Liberia has developed a Poverty Reduction Strategy which refers to TVET in two strategic priorities: (a) the development of middle level human resources and (b) the improvement of the situation of youth that has missed formal education for decades and is faced with the challenge of social and economic integration. In the absence of a regulatory system, many NGOs and CBOs have ventured into non-formal VT without any oversight by the government. In both countries there are no functioning systems of skill certification besides formal vocational education.

In Nigeria the government has neglected the educational sector including the formal TVET institutions under the Ministries of Education and Higher Education for many years. This is particularly evident in the periphery of the country like the North East where one state operated vocational and technical schools that are in a lamentable situation. Unlike in the neighbouring countries, NGOs and churches do not play a significant key role in school/centre based skills development. In many parts of Nigeria, particularly in the larger cities, the system of traditional apprenticeship is deeply rooted in the society. Even in formal industries, training on-the-job is the most common form of skills acquisition.

In all four countries there is no unified TVET system. Commonly four to six different ministries have a stake in vocational education and training. Usually there is little

<sup>7</sup> Republic of Sierra Leone, 2004 Population and Housing Census: Population Size, p.1.

<sup>8</sup> Republic of Sierra Leone, 2004 Population Census: Education and Literacy, p.53.

coordination between them. There is tendency is to create National Qualification Frameworks (NQF) which often uses the Australian system as a blueprint. Ghana is probably the most advanced of the four countries in this reform process. At the time of the main study there were plans on going in Sierra Leone and Liberia for national events for establishment of national structures or frameworks to coordinate all TVET activities in those countries. Nigeria, the biggest economy in the region, introduced NQF on paper but in practice still uses the British-style Trade Test system. One advantage of NQF is the certification of skills at different levels including the recognition of prior learning, which includes skills acquired in informal apprenticeships and in non-formal VT. Whether NQF systems can work well in the context of developing countries has yet to be seen.

## 2.5 Social demand<sup>9</sup> for Vocational Training

In all countries studied the youth population is growing.

Table 3: Number of youth (age 15 – 24) between 1980 and 2010<sup>10</sup>

	1980	1990	1995	2000	2005	2010*
<b>Ghana</b>	2082	2994	3747	3955	4469	4940
<b>Liberia</b>	389	404	361	553	658	812
<b>Nigeria</b>	13893	18087	21595	25310	28590	31712
<b>Sierra Leone</b>	581	773	793	863	1021	1120

\*estimated

Table 4: Percentage of youth (age 15 – 24) relative to total population

	1980	1990	1995	2000	2005	2010*
<b>Ghana</b>	18,9	20,0	20,1	20,2	20,4	20,3
<b>Liberia</b>	20,3	18,7	18,6	19,6	19,7	19,8
<b>Nigeria</b>	18,6	18,6	19,6	20,3	20,3	20,0
<b>Sierra Leone</b>	17,8	18,9	19,9	20,4	20,0	19,2

\*estimated

It could be assumed that social demand for vocational skills development is growing equal to the population growth. This is not the case as the results of this study show (see next chapter).

The following *external factors* may influence demand for Vocational Education and Training:

- Low image of TVET: educated youth prefers studies leading to “white collar” employment

<sup>9</sup> Economic demand generally means the level of demand that arises from the use value of a certain good or service. People ask for a good or service as they derive a certain use or pleasure from it. In general, it is assumed that economic demand arises whenever the benefit a person derives from a good or service is greater than its costs.

Social demand on the other hand refers to the range of expectations with respect to a certain good or service “that exceed economic or market considerations”. Whenever social demand exists, one can assume that the benefit people derive from this good or service goes beyond its actual use value.

<sup>10</sup> UN: World Population Prospects; <http://esa.un.org/unpp/>

- Increase in the number of VT providers (particularly Ghana)
- Informal apprenticeship being a low cost alternative to non-formal and formal institutional centre based skills training.

In several contexts a wide gap has been noticed between the social demand for a trade and the economic demand. Some examples come from this study:

- Hair braiding, OICG: The market appears saturated, still many women apply for this trade.
- Computer studies MTS: highest number of applications, highest number of students, and employment rate below average.

The educational institutions (e.g. junior and senior secondary schools) in most African countries do not provide adequate vocational orientation. Career counselling is often oriented to-wards higher education, which contributes to the “white collar mentality” among many youth.

## 3 Results of case studies

### 3.1 Relevance of VT projects and programmes

#### Relevance of project/programme objectives

The project and programme objectives of the six partners are relevant with regard to:

- The national poverty reduction strategies of the four countries in which youth employment plays an important role
- The significance of the problem of youth un- and underemployment in the region, i.e. the population growth and the requirement to integrate a growing number of out-of-school youth into the labour markets
- The mission statements of the partners
- EED's strategic priorities in West Africa

The project objectives spelled out in the funding proposals are often vague and not specific enough. They are not specified by measurable indicators.

#### Relevance of training offers to background and interests of target groups

The majority of the partners offer vocational skills training that is matching with the educational background and the interests of its target groups. This is an important positive finding:

- SLOIC introduced additional classes in literacy and numeracy skills after the war because the majority of the rural population is illiterate or semi-literate
- LOIC combined trade skills and specific skills in agriculture, as for most trainees agriculture is the main source of livelihood
- OICG is specifically targeting young people that dropped out of school and have no access to formal TVET institutions
- YOWDAST has a system of open entry regardless of educational background
- Both apprenticeship schemes offer practice oriented skills training and additional measures to facilitate trainees' access to the labour market. Measures for developing "soft skills" are not sufficient in both quantity and quality
- The formal VTIs are part of the TVET system and select students according to educational requirements. The entry requirements, the fees charged and the long duration of training are all potentially excluding factors for the poor. The low enrolment of VTIs in Ghana is a sign for decreasing demand of formal VT. MTS has kept the level of fees low but most of its training offers, including all new courses, require a senior secondary schools certificate

The direct target group of VTF are the management, teachers and administrative staff of VTIs. The training offered in school management, guidance and counselling, communication skills, methods of teaching, literacy and numeracy and educational skills training (EST) are relevant to improve the performance of VTI.

## 3.2 Relevance of teaching methods, trade selection and certification to labour market demand and interests of the target group

### Relevance of trade selection and certification

Most VTIs offer a standard set of conventional courses such as tailoring, carpentry, masonry and home management. The variety of courses/ training fields offered is insufficient in many cases and does often not reflect the actual market opportunities. In one case (MTS), progress has been made with regard to the diversification of trades. The apprenticeship schemes offer a larger variety of training options but the full extent of market and training possibilities is not utilised.

There are significantly less training possibilities for women than for men, the training options for women in the VTI and VTC are the following:

- SLOIC: tailoring and home management
- LOIC: catering and dress making
- VTF: supported VTI: catering, secretarial studies and tailoring
- MTS: computer and tailoring

Only the apprenticeship schemes offer a wider range of trades for women, but men, who are in minority, have more options. The majority of YOWDAST graduates were trained in tailoring, which poses a severe risk for the saturation of rural markets.

Formal VTIs in Ghana offer government recognised certification. Courses have been extended from three to four years; with the effect that certification allows access to further education and training. On the other hand the extended duration increases training costs. MTS is following the example of government vocational schools and offers a diploma certification, which the students are interested to obtain, but the certificate is not accredited and not recognised by employers. The labour market prefers labour with trade testing. MTS wants to introduce practice-oriented trade testing as a result of this study.

Certification systems are not yet functioning in Sierra Leone and Liberia. SLOIC is situated somewhere between formal and non-formal VT, its certificates are accredited. Two courses require formal schooling. The training offers of LOIC are non-formal. The apprenticeship schemes consider introducing government trade testing which is in the interest of the graduates but less relevant for work and income in the informal sector.

In all training centres the practical component of training needs to be strengthened. Weaknesses have been observed in:

- Insufficient exposure of students/ trainees to real “world of work” situations

- Insufficient link between theory content and practical application
- Too little group work and lack of modern teaching and instruction methods such as student projects

More emphasis should be given to acquisition of soft and entrepreneurial skills alongside practical training. Teaching methods need improvement as well as the linking to trade skills. One key obstacle is the lack of facilities for appropriate teacher/ instructor training in all countries. In Ghana, VTF is serving this need.

#### Gender relevance of approaches/ methods

Three of the six partners say that employment promotion of females is their priority (VTF, OICG livelihood enhancement project and YOWDAST). Two partners of the six have female leadership (VTF and YOWDAST). VTF has a majority of female staff. In YOWDAST, female and male employed staff is almost equal, the majority of external resource persons are male. In the three OICs the majority of management and staff are male. The same applies to MTS where only one teacher is female.

Females do not have the same variety of training opportunities like men (see more under 3.3. gender equality). Teaching methods and teaching approaches are generally not gender specific. There is too little emphasis on women empowerment, this aspect needs to be strengthened if female un- and underemployment shall be reduced.

Only one partner (LOIC) offers facilities for child care. The two apprenticeship schemes do not exclude mothers with young children but they expect that someone in the family takes care of the children. Most of the master trainers do not accept that mothers bring their children to the work place, but some handle the issue more flexible. In one case (female master trainer) trainees brought their babies along. Formal VTIs function like a school; they do not accept young mothers. SLOIC has no possibilities for child care.

#### Relevance in the context of peace and conflict

Peace and conflict issues apply particularly to LOIC and SLOIC. Both institutions are situated in countries that have experienced long periods of civil war. The partners in Nigeria are situated in areas which have experienced conflicts between Christians and Muslims and high rates of violent crime.

Both SLOIC and LOIC have contributed to reintegration of ex-combatants and war effected youth in the past years. Both institutions have developed specific offers for psycho-social counselling and mediation. YOWDAST has integrated elements of conflict prevention in the skills acquisition project and is taking measures to enrol Muslims and cooperates with Muslim communities. MTS is practically only enrolling Christians.

#### Relevance with regard to poverty alleviation

Vocational skills development has the potential to alleviate poverty if it is effective with regard to employment and income generation (see under effectiveness) and if the approaches used do not exclude the poor. Formal VTI (two partners) do not reach the very poor because of the costs and the educational entry requirements. The conditions of the other projects and

institutions are more conducive to the poor. The apprenticeship schemes are rather providing incentives than barriers; the only excluding factors in the case of YOWDAST may be the costs for travelling and accommodation, if someone is trained outside his/ her home community. YOWDAST has taken steps to bring the training options closer to the people. OICG is purposely targeting illiterates and semi-literates, but focusing on this group may cause stigmatisation, which might be a reason for the low demand.

Insufficient market orientation and quality of practical training are limiting factors for achieving greater impacts. Another limiting factor is the efficiency of most programmes, especially the relatively high costs of training per trainee, which limits outreach.

### 3.3 Selection and reaching of target groups

Criteria for assessing the selection and reaching of target groups were the following:

- Enrolment trends vs. growth of youth population
- Reaching of poor and marginalised groups
- Gender equality
- Obstacles to fair access such as fees, excluding elements in entrance requirements (e.g. education), religion, ethnicity
- Involvement of communities in selection
- Involvement of other stakeholders (private sector, collaborating organisations, MFIs) in selection

#### Enrolment trends

In all the four countries, the youth population has been increasing (see table 3). There is no uniform trend in enrolment among the six partners, but on the whole, enrolment has been rather stagnant than increasing. According to pre-study information compiled by partners:

- SLOIC number of trainees declined from 872 in 2003 to 601 in 2007 and increased to 690<sup>11</sup> in 2009 (overall decline approx. 20%).
- In the case of VTF, five of the seven VTI have experienced declining enrolment (two of the five significant decline), in one VTI, the enrolment was stagnant, in one it increased.
- The two partners in Nigeria experienced moderate growth in demand.

The case study VTF indicates that (1) the stigma of TVET and the aspiration for white collar jobs and (2) the competition of VTI with informal apprenticeship especially in the conventional trade areas are major reasons for declining enrolment. A third factor is the cost of the training. Incentives play a key role in influencing demand, especially in poor environments. In Sierra Leone, social demand in the past was influenced by incentives attached to training such as WFP food allowance packages and “resettlement kits” (tools and

<sup>11</sup> According to case study report.



equipment provided for free at the end of training). The decline of enrolment might be in relation to the phasing out of the incentives. In the case of OICG the cause for declining demand is more difficult to detect, it may be related to the stigmata caused by targeting a specific group (illiterate youth).

### Reaching of the poor

The majority of the partners say in their funding proposals that they target poor unemployed youth.

The following factors are thought to exclude the poor from VT:

- Senior secondary education as an entry requirement
- Fees charged, where there are no formal fees charged, requirements for uniforms, purchase of training materials
- The long duration of formal VT courses

Education as a selection criterion is particularly critical in countries where the majority of the youth population has no equal access to secondary schooling and where females have less access to education than men. The former is the case in war affected countries (Sierra Leone, Liberia) and in marginalised regions of some countries (e.g. the North East of Nigeria) while the latter is the case in most countries. SLOIC and LOIC offer non-formal VT programmes where education is no selection criterion except for some trades (electricians and agriculture (!) in Bo). The same applies to improved apprenticeship schemes (OICG, YOW-DAST). MTS in Nigeria is the only partner which targets graduates of senior secondary schools. The partners of VTF select graduates of junior secondary schools (nine years of school). It is assumed that a person who was able to attend nine to twelve years of school does not belong to the very poor unless he/she has received sponsorship.

School fees are the most significant factor that excludes the poor from education and vocational training. For church based VTI, self financing is a critical factor. In Ghana the VTF supported VTI charge from 140€ a year (without boarding) to 310€ a year (with boarding). For a family living below the poverty line of 2€ a day per person, such a fee is beyond means. The declining enrolment rate discussed above may be directly linked to the issue of costs. In the case of the non-formal providers, fees are not charged (LOIC) or the fees are relatively low (SLOIC). Both of the improved apprenticeship programmes do not charge fees. YOWDAST expects self-contributions (transport, rent in case the training place is not identical with the place of living); on the other hand both programmes offer financial incentives (fees for informal apprenticeship paid by project). MTS charges fees equal to the level of government secondary schools.

### Equality, reaching of marginalised groups

Equality means that all ethnic, religious and social groups living in the catchment area have equal access. Reaching marginalised groups means that VT projects/ programmes are open to include (or specifically target) disadvantaged ethnic or religious groups or groups of young people that are disadvantaged because of their educational or social background.

The only partner that is purposely targeting school drop outs and illiterates is OICG. This target group focus however carries the risk of stigmatisation which potentially effects demand.



YOWDAST has taken serious steps to include the Muslim population into the programme, although Christians make up for the majority. The EED sponsored programmes of SLOIC and LOIC are open to all, both institutions are church affiliated but not faith-based. Both took part in the effort to reintegrate ex-combatants. The policy of catering only to ex-combatants (as sponsored by EU and other donors) tended to create an atmosphere of mistrust. The approach followed with the EED sponsored projects was inspired by do-no-harm considerations of not making a distinction between ex-combatants and other war affected youth. MTS is a faith based institution with Christian religion being a compulsory subject. It can be assumed that the background of the institution (being founded by a missionary) and its Christian orientation prevents Muslims from enrolling.

### Gender equality

Three partners (VTF, OICG and YOWDAST) specifically target women (VTF), give clear preference to women (OICG) or have a majority of women enrolled (YOWDAST). In LOIC, SLOIC and MTS women are in the minority. LOIC and MTS have the lowest percentage of female trainees (approx. 30%).

The training options for women are not equal to those for men. First of all, few women enrol in typical male dominated trades, even if the option exists. Furthermore, the “female trades” often face market saturation, are traditionally less well paid and have thus less income opportunities. In OICG for instance women enrol in dress making, catering, hair braiding and palm oil production while men (who constitute only 20% of the trainees) have at least five trade options which offer far better income opportunities. At LOIC only tailoring and tie-dye are offered as typical women trades. The tracer study revealed that not even a single woman was self-employed. In Ghana many young women received training in catering. However, out of 468 women interviewed only 36% are wage employed in this field. The reason for the low effectiveness of this type of training is lack of employment opportunities and very low wages.

### Involvement of communities in selection

Except for YOWDAST none of the EED partners actively involve communities and other religious groups in the selection process. In LOIC and SLOIC, communities are represented in the Board of Governance, play some role in land distribution but are not involved in the selection process. Faith based institutions tend to advertise courses through their own church, which pre-determines the scope of selection. The community involvement practiced by YOWDAST is thought to be one of the success factors of this programme and its wide outreach. On the other hand, giving communities a free hand in selection without critically counter checking projects which provide incentives (e.g. the apprenticeship schemes) carries the risk of biased support and even misuse.

### Involvement of other stakeholders in selection

None of the partners involve other collaborating stakeholders in the selection. None of the projects/ programmes are closely cooperating with Micro Finance Institutions (MFIs).

### 3.4 Quality of VT programmes

This section of the report deals extensively with a range of quality issues. The issues addressed originate from the ToR but also from widely acknowledge “good practice”. For instance the practical orientation of vocational training, the linking of trade and soft skills as well as the cooperation of training providers with the private sector are quality criteria commonly accepted in TVET. The criteria used for assessment in this comparative study are the following:

1. Satisfaction of target group with the training provided
2. Drop out rate
3. Degree to which labour market demand is assessed, analysed and results are used for planning of training programmes (selection of trades and concepts)
4. Appropriateness of facilities
5. Standards applied in training:
  - Quality of curricula used, adherence with national standards
  - Practical orientation of the training
  - Integration of entrepreneurship training
  - Organisation and quality of industry/ private sector attachment or internship (only for centre based training)
  - Integration of “soft” or “life skills” in curricula
  - Counselling
6. Capacities of teachers/ instructors and quality of instruction, methodologies
7. Cooperation with community and parents as key stakeholders
8. Cooperation with private sector (micro and small enterprise) and interface with other actors
9. Post training measures for employment promotion
10. Systems and practices applied for quality management, monitoring and evaluation

#### Satisfaction with training provided

Satisfaction of trainees/ graduates with the training provided was assessed through the tracer studies and through Focus Group Discussions.

Table 5: Assessment of expectations met

	Fully met	Met by 75%	Met by 50%	Not met (training was poor)	Total
LOIC	69.5%	24.5%	6%	0%	100%
SLOIC	48%	28%	23%	1%	100%
VTF	45%	14.5%	38.5%	2%	100%
MTS	50%	8%	39%	3%	100%
OICG	34%	36%	30%	0%	100%
YOWDAST	36%	13%	50%	1%	100%
<b>Average</b>	<b>47%</b>	<b>21%</b>	<b>31%</b>	<b>1%</b>	<b>100%</b>

On average 47% of the graduates interviewed during the tracer study said that their expectation in the training course was fully met, 21% said mostly met (together 68%) and 31% said met by 50%. Only a very small minority (1%) said the training was poor. The results of the tracer study have been largely confirmed through the FGD where the majority of trainees and graduates were satisfied with the training quality and with the qualification of teachers and instructors.

No clear trends can be identified when comparing the different VT approaches. Results vary from one partner to the other, which may be attributed to subjectivity in the responses given. Approximately one third said “met by 50%”, which is an indication that the quality of training needs some improvement. In FGD, trainees in VTIs said that more focus should be given to practical training. Many trainees in apprenticeship schemes (which last up to 12 months) said that the training period is too short especially in the technical trades (e.g. automotive repair). Both in apprenticeship and in attachment, „making contacts“ was stated as an important benefit, sometime it was more important than the practical skills learned.

#### Satisfaction of employers with skills of graduates

Except in the case study of LOIC, it was not possible to interview employers. According to the few interviewed, major problems with new graduates from technical schools are the following:

- Weak trade (practical) skills
- “Don’t care attitude” towards work

These results are not representative.

#### Drop out rate

The drop out rate among VTF supported VTI is relatively high, mainly because of financial reasons (parents/ students not able to pay the fee). This is one reason why VTIs work below capacity. In MTS, where fees are substantially lower, (about 45€/ year) the drop out rate ranges from 24% (carpentry) to 6% (automotive). In SLOIC, the drop out rates were low until 2005 and, according to the aggregated pre-study information, increased since 2006 among female trainees (up to 20% in home management, in one tailoring course up to 50%)<sup>12</sup>. There might be a link between the phasing out of incentives and the drop outs. In LOIC, drop out rates vary between 17% and 25%. In Gbargna centre in tailoring (2006-08), the drop out rate

<sup>12</sup> Data collected in centres Bo and Matru did not confirm this drop out rate.

reached a peak with 33%, although women received a sewing machine as an incentive after training. The two apprenticeship schemes show a very low drop out rate. In OICG's case the rate varies between 2% and 5% per course. YOWDAST's records are contradictory. Some tables show no drop out at all (which would be rather unrealistic) others vary between 1% and 3%.

It is assumed that drop out rates depend on the costs of training, the incentives provided but also with the perspectives for income generation.

### Market analysis and trade selection

Most of the formal and non-formal training centres have not been conducting a systematic market analysis in the past years. OICG conducted a market survey with assistance of an external consultant and discussed introduction of new trades with entrepreneurs in the market. Three of the six partners (VTF supported VTIs, YOWDAST and OICG) conduct tracer studies which indirectly provide information on the labour market. OICG has a functioning system of follow-up and the staff and management is well aware about market developments and challenges. The VTF-supported VTIs regularly conduct tracer studies and document results. In the case of most partners, the tracer data is not sufficiently analysed and used for planning and review of training programmes.

The main criterion used by partners for selecting a trade is the social demand, i.e. the number and trend of applications received for an offered trade or course. The economic demand is far less taken into consideration. In those cases where market developments are considered, the decisions are made on the basis of "perceptions" rather than systematic analysis. For training providers it is more convenient to offer a trade that is demanded by the majority of people than one that offers economic potential but is not attractive for the target group (see gap between social and economic demand). Partners lack the methodological knowledge to conduct market assessments and they have no budgets to cater for the costs of conducting studies.

Another constraint is the lack of cooperation between the training providers and the private sector (see section below). None of the partners operating training centres have mechanisms for obtaining feedback from the business community on the relevance of their training programmes; none have involved the private sector in planning new courses. The apprenticeship schemes are in close contact with businesses in the communities they work. OICG has been contacting businesses when planning to introduce a new trade. YOWDAST is in contact with the communities but does not sufficiently discuss market issues. Field workers and some instructors of training centres have a good understanding of the market, but their experiences are often not sufficiently considered in management decisions and institutional planning.

Vocational training institutions are inflexible by nature. They have invested in training infrastructure and have employed teaching staff. These two facts are an impediment to the phasing out of old courses and the introduction of new ones. Apprenticeship schemes are more flexible in this regard. They do not operate (and do not have to utilise) their own infrastructure for technical skills training. This allows them to have a higher variety of trades offered (OICG: up to 14 trades; YOWDAST: up to 17 trades) and to phase out trades that have less potential. But still, the demand from applicants is considered the most important factor. OICG tried to phase out hair braiding as the market showed signs of saturation, but the demand was so significant that it was decided to reintroduce the trade. YOWDAST continued to train lots of

tailors with the risk of training too many in one location and thus affecting the existing businesses of its own graduates and others.

In particular, partners do not have knowledge of methods of market assessments. Such methods, be it rapid (external) or participatory market assessments, have been successfully applied in other contexts, EED partners included (example CAPA, Eastern Congo). The latter involves communities, the local businesses and their associations, and last but not least the target group.

### Facilities, tools and supply of training materials

Facilities for vocational skills training depend on the level of an institution. If training is geared towards the local market, it should meet this standard with regard to equipment and availability of tools. For labour mobility, formal training institutions should consider national standards. None of the studied institutions aim at regional and international labour markets which would need a higher level of sophistication. As most partners want to promote employment locally, the local standard in the market place is the basic benchmark for equipment and facilities.

Most VTIs visited in Ghana, unlike Sierra Leone and Liberia, were well equipped. However, the supply of consumable training material was sometimes insufficient or of insufficient quality. Similar reports came from Liberia, where the purchase of tools and materials to the satellite centres was often delayed. In SLOIC, tools were available, but not sufficiently utilised. MTS, which recently has received funding from EED for building new facilities, has now ample space for classrooms but far too little space and no appropriate tools for practical training in the new workshops (example: electrical/ electronic department). Other reports show cases where the quantity of provided tools is not sufficient.

Some facilities were in very poor condition. In general, more emphasis should be put on work-shop management and maintenance. Both, workshop organisation and maintenance, must be part of the training itself and instructors should provide a good example to their students/ trainees.

In the case of apprenticeship schemes, the training takes place right in the market. Appropriateness of training facilities is used by both partners as an important selection criterion. In the case of OICG where there is a wide choice of available places, the selection mostly seemed appropriate. In addition OICG has a well-established system to purchase training materials which involves the trainees in a monitoring function. YOWDAST does not provide training materials; they have to be bought by the trainees him-/ herself. If trainees are short in money, the training quality suffers.

For some masters in Kumasi/ Ghana training has become a business option, with the effect that they tend to recruit too many apprentices for the space available. This in turn affects the intensity of training. YOWDAST attached less trainees to one place, which makes their full integration in production possible. YOWDAST has changed its strategy a few years back and now allows trainees to select the master they prefer. The trainees do not always make a good choice. Especially in rural areas, some workshops are very rudimentary and just offer very basic facilities and skills to learn. The obvious advantage of the apprenticeship model is that trainees are exposed to the realities of the market. They learn to cope with the facilities and tools available. Some of the workshops are in such poor conditions that a graduate from a well equipped training centre would most probably refuse to work. Yet, this is the reality of the market place with which graduates have to cope if they want to earn an income. People

trained in the informal sector are acquainted to these conditions, which is their advantage over graduates from training institutes.

### Standards applied in training

#### Quality of curricula and teaching aids applied, adherence to national standards

In *formal vocational training*, curriculum development is the task of the Government. Training providers have to adhere to curriculum standards set by the TVET authorities or relevant ministries. Ghana has introduced a new curriculum for four years, which is said to be more theory based than the former 3-year syllabus. The new curricula include Maths and English with the aim of improving basic education levels of JSS graduates enrolling in formal TVET programmes. This move is thought to lead to declining demand for formal TVET especially in conventional trades that can also be learned in “wayside businesses”. In Nigeria, the NBTE curricula used in vocational education are in technical terms comprehensive and well designed, but they refer to training needs of the industry, are technically not up to date and do not sufficiently address the competences needed in informal sector enterprises. The internal curricula used by MTS are outdated and need revision.

In *non-formal VT*, the training provider is free to design and use its own curriculum, to use and adapt existing curricula or to use unstructured methods of instruction. The application of a basic curriculum framework, which determines the learning outcomes, is essential for quality management. Curricula for non-formal VT should respond to local market needs and to specific training needs of the target group. LOIC uses the curriculum of the government. The centres have the syllabus of the trades but teaching materials are lacking. As many trainees are illiterate, books are not necessary but teachers should have reference material.

The curricula in Sierra Leone, Liberia and Nigeria are mostly outdated and not appropriate for the target groups and the economic demand. VTF has designed quite some supporting material, especially in functional/ consumer arithmetic and for EST. VTF also designed a competency based syllabus for EST. The different training institutions could learn very much from VTF, some of the material might be applicable in the other countries.

In *apprenticeship schemes*, unstructured, informal learning is the main method for skill acquisition. Training is largely taking place on the job. To shorten and intensify the training period, masters are supposed to provide initial training sessions and guided instruction. OICG, in collaboration with the masters, designed curriculum frameworks which spell out objectives and content of the apprenticeship training. The objectives include the items a trainee is expected to produce during the training period. Description of content is useful, but the time tables may not always be practical as the masters have to follow the incoming orders. The frameworks are used for follow ups by the training coordinator. The masters seem not to use the frameworks frequently. YOWDAST does not use curriculum frameworks. There is no document which spells out the training content in any detail.

All curricula seen during the missions lack references to “soft skills”. They are not designed in a holistic way, i.e. linking acquisition of trade skills with entrepreneurial skills and “core competences” such as the ability to organise, to work in a team or to communicate (see more under teaching methodologies).

Curricula and teaching material used for entrepreneurship are, with the exception for VTF, too theoretical, lack reference to participatory methods and are not adapted to the needs of young people. In most cases, entrepreneurial skills are taught without direct link to the trade but rather in an abstract manner. Entrepreneurial skills training is a separate subject taught by



a different teacher than the technical trade teacher. What is lacking is a direct application of the entrepreneurial aspects to a specific trade. In addition, teaching methodology is still very much teacher-oriented. Group work in a class room is not much known. Apprentices watch and copy, but do seldom explore themselves. Teaching aids are rare.

Weaknesses in curriculum development and modification to local needs are particularly obvious in those cases where partners work in isolation, government support is virtually absent and networks among VT providers do not exist. This is the case in the Manu River countries as well as in Nigeria. With the exception of the Ghanaian partners, all others lack competences in development of curriculum frameworks and curriculum revision and adaptation.

### **Practical orientation of the training provided**

The consultants looked at the ratio of theory to practical lessons, the type of exercises conducted and the quality of items produced in training. This section is not dealing with the industry attachment. The main method used was observation and group discussion. Practical training was a topic in self administered questionnaires used by one team during the main study.

In *centre based training* practical sessions are either conducted through exercises (e.g. tailors producing items made of paper so as to save material costs) or through “training by production”. The quality of practical training mainly depends on:

- Practical competences of instructors (see under human resources)
- Appropriateness of facilities and availability of tools as well as availability of training materials (see above)
- Involvement of trainees in “training on the job” e.g. in production units

In LOIC, no attachments are provided. Students only gain experience during the training in the centre which is limited because of the low quality of the training in terms of material, equipment and experience of teachers. In SLOIC, many teachers are previous trainees. They often lack own practical experience somewhere in the private industry. VTIs are well equipped and provide rather practical training, for example in catering.

MTS compares itself with other government institutions and says it is far more practice oriented. On the other hand, MTS is focusing on theoretical teaching in the first year of training of a two year course. Since the institution is situated in a small rural town, it also faces difficulties in organising training by production. Trainees in the automotive department are able to dismantle and fix a demonstration engine, but they rarely work on a car. The practical training takes place under lab conditions, the 3-months attachment period is not sufficient to fill this gap.

The strength of *improved apprenticeship* schemes is the practical orientation of the training. Trainees are taught on the job by a master who is experienced in his/ her field. Thus, trainees learn exactly what is needed in the market, provided that the selection of the master trainer is appropriate and the business is busy. In the case of OICG, where training materials are provided, gaps without jobs can be meaningfully bridged. In the case of YOWDAST, if there are no jobs, no training takes place. If a trainee is attached to a rural enterprise and the master has to take care of his farm, again, there is no training. The other impediment is the limitation of apprenticeships to 12 months. In some trades (e.g. automotive or electrical installation), this period is too short to learn the trade sufficiently. YOWDAST has been dealing with this issue and allows trainees to extend the training period. In other trades (basic carpentry and

roofing, hair braiding, palm oil extraction, just to name a few), 12 months and even less (e.g. flower decoration) may just be sufficient. The consultants have seen cases where trainees in carpentry were able to produce good quality coffee tables after only six months of training (example OICG)!

### **Integration of entrepreneurship training** (*see also under curriculum*)

All partners highlight the importance of self employment in their project proposals. All provide entrepreneurial skills training (EST) as part of their VT courses and projects. In Ghana, EST was first introduced by VTF through teachers training courses for VTI and later nation wide. MTS has introduced entrepreneurship training by its own initiative, it is not a compulsory element in the national curriculum. OIC International in its guidelines for OIC affiliates, highlights the importance of entrepreneurship training already since the 80s.

The two apprenticeship schemes offer entrepreneurship training in the form of seminars. OICG has employed two staff as business development officers. They are responsible for conducting business training sessions to trainees and business counselling for graduates who want to start their own businesses or have already done so. YOWDAST invites external resource persons to carry out the business training to trainees and graduates. The business training is part of larger seminars which address different topics. It is questionable to what extent trainees are able to absorb if seminars are overloaded with too many topics. In the case of YOWDAST, interviewees said that they learn most of the business skills from their masters, either through observation or by asking them for advice during and after training. The nature of the relationship between the master and the trainee and the ability and motivation of the trainee for “self-learning” is a key for acquisition of business skills in this model. The smarter trainees naturally learn faster and benefit more.

### **On-the-job training or attachment (centre based training only)**

With the initial effort and support of VTF, attachment has been introduced not only in all VTF supported VTIs in Ghana but to offer attachments has become a policy of the government itself. In Nigeria, attachments are a requirement for accredited TVET institutions. MTS is organising the attachment in two phases, one month in the first year, three months in the second. In most cases, students select the place, follow up is limited because of the distances involved.

On the job training (OJT) is a very important component of SLOIC and helps a lot in finding employment. OJT lasts three months. The consultants say it should be incorporated in the regular curriculum (leading to a cooperative approach of training if possible) or at least, attachments should be more frequent and not only one at the end of the training. LOIC is the only institution that does not organise attachment.

For effectiveness the follow up of attachments by the training provider is important. The rural location of some training centres (MTS, satellite centres of LOIC and SLOIC) is an impediment to organise follow up. In the case of MTS, 80% of the students find the place on their own. Follow up through instructors is not very frequent because of the long distances, the shortage of personnel (SLOIC) and the costs of travelling involved. VTF staff visits the trainees during their attachment and has also designed a monitoring paper for the employer. VTF finances, through the help of EED, 70% of the costs of attachments in the VTIs (mainly travelling costs), the remaining 30% is paid by the Parent Teacher Association.

The results of this study confirm that attachments are important (a) to improve the practical skills of trainees, (b) to expose trainees to market realities, and (c) to facilitate market integration. In interviews, a number of graduates reported that they found employment at the



place of attachment or at least a place of further learning (apprenticeship) after graduation. Important issues are the selection of appropriate places and the period of attachment. Experiences show that attachments should not be shorter than three months and should take place at the end of each scholastic year.

### **Integration of “soft” or “life skills” in the curriculum**

The integration of soft or life skills is another innovative element of TVET projects/programmes<sup>13</sup>. It aims at sensitisation, preparation of youth for the challenges of life and facilitation of social and economic integration. This includes awareness creation for health aspects (e.g. reproductive health, HIV/AIDS), personality development for self reliance and value education and labour market related skills such as job finding techniques and work place behaviour. In conflict affected environments, the acquisition of life skills is often connected with psychosocial counselling (see below) and peace education.

Most EED partners address life skill issues through group and individual counselling (see below). The importance of life skill aspects in VT have been confirmed in FGD. In the case of OICG, graduates said that the life skill training and the counselling helped them to protect themselves from unwanted pregnancies, raised awareness on reproductive health issues and helped them to develop their self esteem (see more under effectiveness).

SLOIC organises a so called “feeder programme”, of which life skills acquisition such as job finding techniques, counselling and information of HIV/AIDS are part. In LOIC, life skills are addressed through counselling (see below). MTS practices a religion-based form of teaching which involves some elements of personality building in the theological context of EYN. The subject is taught by a pastor who is not a staff of MTS. Other topics are not part of the curriculum. Information on labour market and behaviour at workplaces are informally taught by some instructors in their respective trades or classes, there are no teaching manuals or guidelines for such topics.

OICG and YOWDAST organise orientation seminars with the objective to prepare trainees for the apprenticeship. These seminars include sensitisation on work place behaviour and values. In addition OICG organises specific sessions, e.g. on HIV/AIDS and reproductive health, organised by a specialised NGO.

None of the partners use “peer to peer” methods for life skill training. Furthermore, “soft skills” such as communication and teamwork are not systematically addressed in practical training. Most instructors lack the relevant methodological know-how.

### **Counselling**

This section deals with different aspects of counselling and advice to trainees and graduates. It may be psycho-social counselling of war affected youth as conducted by LOIC during conflict and directly after conflict, a combination of business and social counselling (OICG, SLOIC, VTF), or simply informal advice.

Counselling is provided in both forms, informally and systematically. LOIC provided psycho-social counselling of war affected youth. Each centre had two counsellors which were initially trained by a psychologist. In SLOIC centre Bo, counselling is the task of the OJT officer, who has probably too many students to accompany for playing this role effectively. VTF has

<sup>13</sup> Also called “holistic integrated” VT approaches.

trained teachers of VTI in guidance & counselling techniques. MTS has no staff with this specific task, counselling is provided informally by the teachers, the boarding masters and the principal. For group counselling, OICG uses a part time counsellor employed by the OICG Kumasi vocational training centre. The business development officers employed by the OICG apprenticeship scheme provide follow up services to graduates which involve both, business and social counselling, depending on the situation and needs. YOWDAST provides follow up during and after training but this can not be called counselling. In general, many counsellors lack specific methodological knowledge and do not have opportunities for further training and coaching. Peer to peer counselling methods are not often applied.

There is a general lack of vocational orientation and counselling. Many applicants of VT projects/ programmes lack a good understanding of the labour market (see gap between social and economic demand) and often know too little about the requirements of a trade. All partners do interviews for selection. Some partners test the motivation of applicants, which entails elements of vocational orientation but systematic procedures of vocational counselling are not applied.

#### Capacity of teachers/ instructors and master trainers

Criteria used for assessment:

- (Formal) qualification of teachers/ instructors
- Practical competences
- Methodological competences

The formal qualification of teachers/ instructors is a system requirement in formal TVET. Teachers are supposed to have a higher formal qualification than the certification offered by the institution they are employed with. In VTF sponsored VTIs, many teachers hold certificates and advanced diploma, some few have graduated from Polytechnics, but several have graduated from the VTIs themselves. In MTS, several instructors were graduates of this institution, but most have been working in the private sector before becoming a teacher. Many teachers of LOIC and SLOIC have been graduates of these institutions as well, but without getting exposure to the private sector (including small business). The civil war had an effect on the competence of staff in all TVET institutions in both countries as opportunities for teachers training and exposure to work in the private sector did not exist for many years.

The lack of opportunities for training of technical teachers and instructors in all countries is a serious obstacle for development of the TVET sector. Teaching is often “teacher-centred” instead of “trainee/ student-centred”. Modern methods such as student projects are not known or not applied. Training opportunities in teaching methodologies are lacking with the effect that most teachers and instructors even lack basic teaching methodologies.

Most master trainers interviewed in the cities appeared well qualified in their trades, less so their colleagues in the rural areas. The critical questions:

- Availability of the master: If a master is not present, the “chief apprentice” is in charge. He/ she is less qualified to instruct
- Willingness of the master to share his/ her knowledge: seems problematic in the technical trades, e.g. automotive

- Lacking instruction skills: a good master does not automatically pose a good teacher, both OICG and YOWDAST organise orientation seminars, OICG has organised methodological training.

#### Cooperation with communities and parents as key stakeholders

Criteria used for assessment was the degree to which the partner is cooperating with communities in the planning and implementation of the VT project/programme, e.g. involvement of communities in trade selection, selection of trainees and post training support.

YOWDAST is the only partner with a strong community linkage. The community is involved in the mobilisation of youth and women, in the selection of trainees, in the follow up of training and informally in post training support. It remains an open question to what degree the community in a village is equally involved or whether high-ranking community members can influence decisions. If the selection process is left unchecked there is a potential for misuse. Still, the community linkage of YOWDAST is seen as a key success factor for effectiveness of this project (see more under chapter effectiveness). OICG is not working with and through community structures.

VTF supported VTIs have no community link. LOIC und SLOIC involve communities in the board (see under selection).

#### Cooperation with private sector (micro and small enterprise) and interface with other actors

Criteria used for assessment:

- The degree to which the partner is cooperating with the private sector (small and medium enterprises, trade associations) in planning and implementation of the VT programme/ project
- Interface with other actors in implementation of the project/ programme, e.g. other training providers, public institutions and other church based organisations and NGOs

**Cooperation with private sector** is widely seen as a key criterion for labour market oriented TVET. Collaboration can have different forms:

- Regular consultations with local businesses for obtaining information on labour market trends
- Involving trade specialists from private sector (including small enterprise!) in curriculum review and development
- Collaborating with businesses for student/ trainee attachment (see above)
- Training providers providing services, e.g. skill upgrading, to local businesses

The two apprenticeship schemes cooperate with master trainers for organisation of the training, all of them being business owners. Both partners organise orientation seminars before attaching a trainee. OICG conducted seminars for master trainers in instruction methodologies, YOWDAST organises skill upgrading courses for master trainers and graduates with government training institutes.

VTF and SLOIC cooperate with the business sector with respect to attachments. Some business people are also in the boards of SLOIC and LOIC but the private sector is not

involved in curriculum design nor is it consulted in a systematic way for gaining insight in market trends. In no case, including the apprenticeship schemes, a partner is collaborating with a trade association. In the case of rural training centres or projects (at least half of the centres/ projects) the location is an impediment for private sector cooperation.

The purpose of **collaboration with other actors** is for instance:

- To reach specific target groups, e.g. for advertisement of courses, recruitment of trainees
- To benefit from special expertise, e.g. entrepreneurship or life skill training
- Networking for exchange, resource sharing and lobbying
- Linking graduates to post training support services, e.g. Micro Finance Institutions

Most partners cooperate with other organisations for advertisement of courses. MTS advertises courses through other protestant churches and has been trying to collaborate with the Industrial Training Fund (ITF) in the organisation and funding of attachment without achieving much (the ITF attachment scheme, according to literature, is not functional).

OICG is collaborating with the National Youth Council for recruitment of trainees and involves a specialised NGO in facilitation of seminars on health issues. YOWDAST mobilises communities through churches, community councils, local schools and mosques. YOWDAST works with a small team of core staff and thus intensively uses the capacities of collaborators. It works with government training providers and the ITF for organisation of skills upgrading courses and facilitation of training seminars, and uses technical resource persons from government departments for vocational counselling of applicants. This approach is cost efficient but has its drawbacks. It is recommended that YOWDAST develops own capacities in core functions such as entrepreneurship training and business counselling.

The OICs are part of an international OIC network. In reality, there has been little exchange and benefit of the affiliation in the past ten years. The partners in Nigeria, due to their isolated locations, work in relative isolation with no interaction with VT actors in other parts of the country. An exposure of the, by then, MTS management with YOWDAST was organised in 2001, but no effects of this interaction were visible. MTS is working with resource persons from public Polytechnics but has no interaction with other non-governmental vocational training centres such as those operated by the YMCA.

Lack of access to credit has been stated to be the most important hindrance for graduates to earn an income. None of the partners has established collaboration with Micro Finance Institutions and none of the graduates who participated in FGD had received a loan from an MFI or knew about MFI offers. OICG made some efforts to link up with MFIs for managing their small scale credit portfolio, but the MFI, according to OICG, did not offer favourable conditions. None of the VTF supported VTIs covered by this study has taken steps to link graduates with credit/ savings schemes, despite the presence of many MFIs in Ghana. The same is true for SLOIC and LOIC. In North Eastern Nigeria, the possibilities of collaboration with MFIs appeared to be limited. Instead, it was recommended that YOWDAST facilitates the formation of saving and credit groups in one village cluster on a pilot level.

The linking of graduates to micro finance services is generally an unresolved critical issue, as young business starters are considered to be a high risk group by MFIs. Trainees should get access to information on savings/ credit schemes. First an introduction into saving schemes would be helpful which might later lead to credit possibilities.

### Post training measures for employment promotion

The aim of “post training support” is to facilitate graduates’ integration in the labour market and back into society in the case of displacement. Post training support may include:

- Job placement support
- Business start up services including:
  - Advisory services for starting business/ self employment
  - Provision of subsidised tools and equipment (as grants)
  - Provision of micro credits or facilitating access to credit
  - Post training or “business shelter” facility
- Post training counselling for reintegration, mediation and resettlement assistance (e.g. facilitating access to land) in post conflict situations

During and after the civil war, LOIC has been engaged in resettlement activities of displaced youth and in reintegration of ex-combatants. These activities, which, besides training, included the distribution of “resettlement kits” (e.g. agricultural tools, seeds), the (rather unsuccessful) attempt to distribute land and follow up through field workers including mediation), have not been subject of this study<sup>14</sup>. The practice of distributing tool kits has been continued. After training, each graduate receives a tool kit of a value of approximately 65 US\$.

SLOIC distributed tools to better motivate graduates but stopped this practice. SLOIC has been planning for some time to construct “post training centres”, where graduates who did not find (self-) employment can work for a year in order to get some practice and to earn an in-come. They would provide graduates with an opportunity to practice business, manage the workshops under guidance and with less risk than in the open market. These centres are not yet functional (the centre at Mattru Jong is under construction) and the management concepts are not very clear yet.

VTF offers specific courses in EST to some female graduates and provides also equipment (sewing machines or tools for hairdressing). VTIs do not provide any further post-training support after the attachment period.

MTS does not provide post training services. The idea of a micro credit facility has been discussed in the past but its feasibility would be very questionable, given that MTS has no expertise and no accreditation of handling loans and little means of recovering credits considering the wide catchment area. MTS is advising its graduates to seek opportunities for apprenticeships, in case they do not find a job, but there are no activities for facilitation of job placement. Again, the rural location (long distances, wide catchment area) is a hindrance for facilitating job placement and self employment.

OICG, in line with the philosophy of OIC International, considers employment promotion an integral part of the “livelihood enhancement project” as the apprenticeship scheme is called. One to two months before graduation, a so called bridging phase starts where the business development officers (BDOs) start with individual counselling. This activity is meant to initiate a process where trainees start to think what to do after training. The BDOs follow up after training and a record is kept of each graduate. The BDOs provide individual counselling,

<sup>14</sup> See EED-FAKT study “promoting livelihood and employment in post conflict situations”, final report 2007.



there is no group counselling and no application of peer to peer methods. Graduates are clustered into three groups: (a) those who work for somebody (employed or as apprentices), (b) self-employed or (c) unemployed. Most attention is paid to the unemployed. Follow up is provided up to one year, in some cases longer. OICG also operates a small credit facility but has put loan distributing on hold because of two reasons: (a) the poor repayment rate, and (b) the low utilisation of the facility by graduates. The latter is a contradiction to the finding of the tracer study, where a majority of respondents said that lack of credit is the main hindrance for earning an income. OICG wants to further investigate this critical issue.

YOWDAST provides an essential piece of equipment to a subsidised rate on the graduation day. For instance a tailor receives a sewing machine, a graduate who opens a business centre a computer, and an automotive mechanic a complete set of tools. YOWDAST is purchasing the item, the graduate has to pay 50% of the costs (in the past, the YOWDAST subsidy was 70%). This subsidy is a strong incentive to enrol in the scheme but it is also a key supporting factor for graduates to succeed in setting up the business. The international consultant recommended increasing the self-contribution to 60% so as to reinforce the self-contribution and self-motivation of graduates. YOWDAST is organising workshops and skill upgrading for graduates and plans to intensify these activities. The follow up is rather sporadic. There is no systematic business counselling service. As there are no records six months after graduation, YOWDAST has no information on the business survival rates.

### Systems and practices for monitoring and evaluation

The objectives stated in the funding proposals are either very unspecific and refer to overall development goals (e.g. reducing unemployment and poverty) or describe the project outputs (to provide training...). A description of the measurable outcomes in the funding proposal is in most cases missing. Three out of the six partners conduct tracer studies. They collect information on the employment status, but there is no systematic analysis. Usually no information is given in the narrative reports on the percentage of graduates employed and the percentage who work in the field of training.

Monitoring systems are developed to very different degrees. OICG for instance has established an elaborated system for monitoring the quality of the apprenticeship scheme, carries out regular follow ups and documents the results (e.g. the income a graduate earns per months, challenges he/she faces). There are plans (curriculum frameworks) for each trade, which entail learning objectives (although some are not very specific). A monitoring group has been established in every workshop that consists of two trainees and the master. This group is monitoring the purchase of training materials and the process of learning. Primary monitoring is executed by the training officer who visits every workshop twice, at least once a month. Besides monitoring, these visits have the purpose to motivate trainees and to solve any arising issue between the master and the trainees. For YOWDAST monitoring of the apprenticeship scheme is more challenging at the geographic area is very wide and some areas are difficult to access. The outreach system (monitoring through field advisors) is not working very well, monitoring visits are not frequent enough. The situation may well be exploited by the master trainers. Monitoring is a concern of the management. It is thought that the weaknesses in follow up have affected the quality of the apprenticeship training.

The VTI supported by VTF have developed good documentation systems with assistance of VTF. In most other cases record keeping and data documentation is a problem. SLOIC keeps gender disaggregated student records, and has a monitoring tool called Project Performance Tracking (PPT). Instructors develop Weekly Lesson Plans and monthly Operational Work

Plans (OWPs). In LOIC the record keeping is generally weak. In most cases there were no records with the contact data of graduates at the time of their graduation, which is a precondition for providing any follow up. MTS monitors the attendance of students and regularly tests students' performance in theory and practice. The government curricula are used as a basis for testing. The management is starting to pay special attention to the monitoring of the financial performance of the production units.

Three of the six partners (VTF, OICG and YOWDAST) conduct tracer studies. In the case of OICG the study is conducted once in every three year funding phase. OICG received training on tracer studies from an external consultant. VTF has initiated tracer studies in the VTI. YOWDAST is conducting a tracer study six months after graduation. At this time, graduates have just received their tools/ equipment and start to practice. The tracer study only covers the most basic issues; i.e. whether a person is employed. MTS conducted the last tracer study in 1999/2000, but did not analyse the results. Since there are no follow-up mechanisms, there were no records available of the whereabouts and the employment status of graduates since then. Instructors in LOIC and SLOIC sometimes seem to know what their trainees are doing but the results are not documented.

All partners have weaknesses in the analysis of tracer study data and the utilisation for institutional management, possibly with the exception of OICG. In the skills enhancement project the monitoring information is shared regularly in staff meetings and actions are planned accordingly. In the case of the VTI it appears that once the data is collected and reports are prepared no conclusions are drawn from the results. The centres continue to give the same type of training since many years, regardless whether the employment rate is satisfactory or not. Whenever conclusions are drawn, as in the case of this study, the VTIs appear not to have the institutional mechanisms to implement the required changes and no substantial modifications of training programmes are made. YOWDAST has more informal ways of discussing results but again, the tracer study data is collected but not analysed (and not even used in narrative reports). The three other partners do not conduct tracer studies.

All partners have been evaluated in the past years, in few cases with international evaluators. Some evaluations looked at effectiveness and impact (OICG) but most did not. MTS for instance was evaluated twice since 2006. The evaluators said MTS has had a significant impact on the needs of "school drop outs and illiterates" (remark: both groups are not the prime target group of MTS) without showing how the impact was measured.

None of the partners ask students/ trainees to evaluate the training. Participatory monitoring methods are not sufficiently or not at all applied.

### 3.5 Effectiveness

The main criteria for assessing effectiveness were:

- Perception whether choice of the field of training was right
- Utilisation of skills learned for income generation and
- Employment of graduates in field of training and quality of employment
- Income earned, coverage of basic needs by income earned and increase of income compared with the situation before training

- Effectiveness of the different measures provided (skills training, counselling, etc.)
- Achievement of project objectives

Direct and indirect effects on communities are dealt with under chapter impact

Information and data on effectiveness comes from the following resources:

- Results of the comprehensive tracer study
- Focus group discussions
- Case studies

For comments on the validity of the quantitative data see section methodologies.

### 3.5.1 Quantitative analysis

#### Overall employment and skill utilisation rate

The vast majority of graduates interviewed in the tracer study think that the **choice of training** was right.

Table 6: Assessment of the choice of training

	<b>Choice of Training was right</b>	<b>No, it was not right</b>	<b>I don't know</b>	<b>Total</b>
<b>LOIC</b>	98%	0,5%	1,5%	100%
<b>SLOIC</b>	98%	1,8%	0,2%	100%
<b>VTF</b>	93%	5%	2%	100%
<b>MTS</b>	99%	1%	0%	100%
<b>OICG</b>	100%	0%	0%	100%
<b>YOWDAST</b>	96%	4%	0%	100%
<b>Average</b>	<b>97%</b>	<b>2%</b>	<b>1%</b>	<b>100%</b>

According to the tracer study 70% of all graduates traced are employed and earn an income. This percentage includes graduates working in their field of training and in any other field not related to training.

Table 7: Total employment rate of graduates

	<b>Employed (wage/ self)</b>	<b>Unemployed</b>	<b>Further education and training</b>	<b>Apprenticeship</b>	<b>Total</b>
<b>LOIC</b>	87%	10%	2%	1%	100%
<b>SLOIC</b>	60%	26%	5%	8%	100%
<b>VTF</b>	61%	19%	15%	5%	100%
<b>MTS</b>	56%	32%	4%	8%	100%
<b>OICG</b>	63%	23%	14%	0%	100%
<b>YOWDAST</b>	91%	4%	1%	4%	100%
<b>Average</b>	<b>70%</b>	<b>19%</b>	<b>7%</b>	<b>4%</b>	<b>100%</b>



Table 8: Status of employed graduates, base value: total number of employed graduates

	<b>Wage</b>	<b>Self</b>	<b>Total</b>
<b>LOIC</b>	17%	83%	100%
<b>SLOIC</b>	28%	72%	100%
<b>VTF</b>	65%	35%	100%
<b>MTS</b>	41%	59%	100%
<b>OICG</b>	27%	73%	100%
<b>YOWDAST</b>	9%	91%	100%
<b>Average</b>	<b>31%</b>	<b>69%</b>	<b>100%</b>

The highest employment rate (91%) has been recorded for the YOWDAST apprenticeship scheme, the lowest for MTS as a formal vocational school (56%). Both institutions/ projects are situated in the rural North East of Nigeria, the same consultant collected the data. The highest rate of unemployment has been recorded for MTS (32%) and SLOIC (26%), the lowest for YOWDAST (4%) and LOIC (10%).

Approximately 31% of the employed graduates are wage employed and approximately 69% are self-employed. The highest rate for wage employment has been recorded by VTF supported VTI. The highest rates for self-employment were documented for YOWDAST (91%) and LOIC (83%).

The employment records have to be seen in the context of each country and each location. The following **(external) factors** are thought to influence the unemployment and employment rates:

- The situation of the local labour market and market fluctuations
- The personal motivation of a graduate
- The educational background and prior skills of the trainees
- The economic and social background of the graduate and his/ her family
  - Economic factor: People in absolute poverty can not be unemployed. They have to generate income for survival!
  - Age factor: the older graduates are the higher the economic pressures for “self reliance” will be. According to case studies and interviews, many of the younger graduates below the age of 25 still live with their families and are supported by their families.
  - Gender factor: marriage and pregnancies/ child care need to be taken in consideration when assessing the employment rate of women
- Livelihood patterns: in rural communities, the vast majority of the population is engaged in agriculture. Young people, particularly young men, do this rather by necessity than by choice, as rural livelihood does often not match with their aspirations

The table below lists external supportive and hindering factors observed in urban and rural locations:

Location	Rural/semi urban/urban	Supportive factor for employment	Hindering factors, limits for employment
Kumasi, Ghana	Urban	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Many options in the market to learn skills</li> <li>- Growing middle class increased need for qualified labour in services (e.g. repair of second hand electronic items) and in the construction related industries</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Many market niches already occupied, difficult to start a business because of costs e.g. for renting a shop</li> <li>- Women have fewer choices for skills acquisition in the market, in the “conventional” trades markets show saturation</li> <li>- Traditional gender roles are an obstacle for women to work in traditional “men’s trades”</li> </ul>
Adamawa state, Nigeria	Rural, rural towns (semi-urban)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- In rural areas skilled craftspeople are lacking and new services are in demand (e.g. motorcycle repair in villages)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Low purchasing power of the rural population, only basic services are needed</li> <li>- Rural markets have a limited size, training too many people and equipping them with tools will affect existing businesses or motivate migration</li> <li>- Few wage employment opportunities except public services and military</li> </ul>
Bo, Sierra Leone	Urban and semi urban	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- electrification and construction industry providing some job opportunities, masonry and electricity seem to offer best chances for employment</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- no new emerging industries, training</li> <li>- market saturation in those trade areas offered by most providers (carpentry, tailoring, etc.)</li> </ul>
Matru Jong, Sierra Leone	Rural	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- boat making provides some opportunities;</li> <li>- agriculture skills applicable for self employment</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- poor possibility to utilise other skills acquired such as carpentry, masonry; many graduates have to move out to gain employment in big towns.</li> </ul>
Sinje, Liberia	Rural	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- location on the main road provides some incentives for self employable skills such as metal works; commuters buy produce; communities reconstructing homes.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- lack of local market and employment agencies; departure of UN and NGOs results into less employment opportunities.</li> </ul>
Gbarnga, Liberia	Rural and semi-urban	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- knowledge gained from small enterprise development training;</li> <li>- Low start up costs in some trades (masonry graduates did not need to set up shops);</li> <li>- backyard agriculture</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- lack of credit facilities;</li> <li>- space for setting up carpentry shops difficult / expensive to get.</li> </ul>

More than half of the training locations are rural or semi-rural in character, where the majority of the population earns a livelihood through agriculture.

**Work in the field of training:** 59% of the graduates interviewed say they are working in the field of training. This is a positive result.

Table 9: Number and percentage of **employed graduates** working in field of training

	Total number employed <sup>15</sup>	Number working in field of training	Male	Female
<b>LOIC</b>	198 (112m/86m)	142 (72%)	78 (70%)	64 (74%)
<b>SLOIC</b>	258 (187m/71f)	224 (87%)	162 (87%)	62 (87%)
<b>VTF</b>	686 (166m/520f)	572 (83%)	127 (77%)	445 (86%)
<b>MTS</b>	65 (29m/36f)	42 (65%)	20 (68%)	22 (61%)
<b>OICG</b>	127 (38m/89f)	100 (79%)	38 (100%)	62 (70%)
<b>YOWDAST</b>	145 (62m/83f)	142 (98%)	60 (97%)	82 (99%)
<b>Average</b>		<b>81%</b>	<b>83%</b>	<b>80%</b>

Table 10: Estimated number and percentage of interviewed graduates working in field of training<sup>16</sup>

	Total number traced and interviewed	Number working in field of training <sup>17</sup>	Male	Female
<b>LOIC</b>	198* (112m/86f)	142 (72%)	78 (70%)	64 (74%)
<b>SLOIC</b>	470 (308m/162f)	224 (48%)**	162 (53%)**	62 (38%)**
<b>VTF</b>	1043 (221m/822f)	572 (55%)	127 (57%)	445 (54%)
<b>MTS</b>	110 (60m/50f)	42 (38%)	20 (33%)	22 (44%)
<b>OICG</b>	202 (46m/156f)	100 (49%)	38 (83%)	62 (40%)
<b>YOWDAST</b>	158 (63m/95f)	142 (90%)	60 (95%)	82 (86%)
<b>Average</b>		<b>59%</b>	<b>65%</b>	<b>56%</b>

\* in the case of LOIC this question was answered by graduates of all categories

\*\* validity of number in question as many responses were invalid

As said repeatedly, the quantitative analysis has some limitations. For instance it does not differentiate between full time employment and doing a job once in a while. Self-employment may mean that a tailor is running his/ her own business in the market place or working from home and doing sewing mainly for family members. Factors that may have influenced the employment rate in some cases:

- Provision of tools and equipment for free (LOIC) or to a subsidised rate (YOWDAST)
- Practice of combining training in agriculture and trade skills (LOIC) as a high percentage of graduates earns an income in agriculture and thus is utilising the skill
- Selecting persons with a background of prior learning (amongst others) such as graduates of technical colleges (YOWDAST). Expectedly, such persons have a better chance to succeed in the market

<sup>15</sup> Number of persons that answered the question "Is your work related to your field of training?"

<sup>16</sup> The question Q10 "work related to training" was answered by persons employed (w/s) and in apprenticeship. It is assumed that all other categories do not work in the field of training. There might be a small percentage of persons in further education who work in their field of training besides going to school/college. This group is not considered in the analysis

<sup>17</sup> Includes both categories: "working" and "working just a bit"

## Quantitative analysis per gender

The **employment rates per gender** are the following:

Table 11: Employment Status of Female Graduates 2003-2008

	Employed	Unemployed	Further education	Apprenticeship	Total
<b>LOIC</b>	88%	8%	3%	1%	100%
<b>SLOIC</b>	63%	26%	7%	4%	100%
<b>VTF</b>	58%	22%	15%	5%	100%
<b>MTS</b>	54%	40%	0%	6%	100%
<b>OICG</b>	58%	29%	13%	0%	100%
<b>YOWDAST</b>	90%	5%	1%	3%	100%
<b>Average</b>	<b>69%</b>	<b>22%</b>	<b>6%</b>	<b>3%</b>	<b>100%</b>

Table 12: Employment Status of Male Graduates 2003-2008

	Employed	Unemployed	Further education	Apprenticeship	Total
<b>LOIC</b>	86%	12%	1%	1%	100%
<b>SLOIC</b>	58%	27%	5%	10%	100%
<b>VTF</b>	70%	9%	17%	4%	100%
<b>MTS</b>	57%	25%	8%	10%	100%
<b>OICG</b>	80%	4%	15%	0%	100%
<b>YOWDAST</b>	90%	2%	2%	6%	100%
<b>Average</b>	<b>74%</b>	<b>13%</b>	<b>8%</b>	<b>5%</b>	<b>100%</b>

The average employment rate of males is about 1.07 times higher than for females. The average unemployment rate for females is about 1.4 times higher than for males. This includes females who became pregnant after training and who take care of small children.

Table 13: Status of employed female graduates

	Wage	Self	Total
<b>LOIC</b>	11%	89%	100%
<b>SLOIC</b>	24%	76%	100%
<b>VTF</b>	64%	36%	100%
<b>MTS</b>	48%	52%	100%
<b>OICG</b>	17%	83%	100%
<b>YOWDAST</b>	3%	97%	100%
<b>Average</b>	<b>28%</b>	<b>72%</b>	<b>100%</b>

Table 14: Status of employed male graduates

	Wage	Self	Total
<b>LOIC</b>	22%	78%	100%
<b>SLOIC</b>	31%	69%	100%
<b>VTF</b>	67%	33%	100%
<b>MTS</b>	35%	65%	100%
<b>OICG</b>	51%	49%	100%
<b>YOWDAST</b>	16%	84%	100%
<b>Average</b>	<b>37%</b>	<b>63%</b>	<b>100%</b>

Differences also occur when comparing the employment status of male and female employed graduates. The overall percentage of wage employed males is 1.3 times higher than for females. In the case of apprenticeship schemes, the differences are significant. This is an indication for substantially better wage employment opportunities for males, especially in the urban informal sector. This finding from the tracer study was confirmed in focus group discussions

and through market observations. Women for instance have fewer opportunities extending their apprenticeships and working for someone else (see case studies OICG and YOWDAST).

An estimated 65% of all male graduates traced are thought to work in the field of training (see table 10). The estimated percentage of females is 56%. On average, the employment rate in the field of training is approximately 1.2 times higher for males. In one case (OICG), the difference between men and women is significant. In this case only 40% of the women are thought to work in the field of training while the rate of men lies at 83%.

### 3.5.2 Qualitative analysis of employment and income

The quality of employment has been assessed through FGD, case studies and the tracer study. Main indicators used are:

- the place of business (working from home or owning a business)
- the increase of income, coverage of basic needs, in some cases actual income earned
- whether graduates are supported by parents or provide support

#### Place of business

Table 15: Working place of graduates in case of self-employment

	<b>Total number</b>	<b>Working from home</b>	<b>Running a business</b>
<b>LOIC</b>	161 (82m/79f)	12% M: 15% F: 10%	88% M: 85% F: 90%
<b>SLOIC</b>	223 (143m/80f)	77% M: 76% F: 79%	23% M: 24% F: 21%
<b>VTF</b>	203 (47m/156f)	67% M: 70% F: 65%	33% M: 30% F: 35%
<b>MTS</b>	36 (25m/11f)	78% M: 80% F: 73%	22% M: 20% F: 27%
<b>OICG</b>	93 (18m/75f)	58% M: 17% F: 68%	42% M: 83% F: 32%
<b>YOWDAST</b>	128 (51m/77f)	55% M: 27% F: 73%	45% M: 73% F: 27%
<b>Average</b>		<b>58%</b> <b>M: 48%</b> <b>F: 61%</b>	<b>42%</b> <b>M: 52%</b> <b>F: 39%</b>

According to the data above a slight majority of the self-employed graduates works from home (58%). In the case of LOIC, the tracer study data on place of business may not be sufficiently valid (see different figures in case study report LOIC). Without consideration of LOIC data, 67% of the self-employed work from home. This is a clear majority and an indication that many of the self-employed rather work on “survival mode”. Case studies also

show that the boundaries between self-employment and wage employment are fluid. A mason working as a daily labourer (contracted and paid on a daily basis) may say he is self-employed but in reality he is working for the same contractor. The percentage of self-employed women running a business on their own is relatively low. This result is supported by FGD where usually less than 20% of the participating women have established a business outside their home. This rate is even lower in urban contexts as business start-up costs (e.g. renting a shop) and the risks of business failures are substantially higher.

### Income, coverage of basic needs

The effectiveness of project interventions on changes in the income situation and coverage of basic needs has been assessed quantitatively through the tracer study and qualitatively through FGD. Indicators used were:

- the increase of income in % since graduation
- the coverage of basic needs in % through income generated in trade
- whether graduates are supported by parents or provide support

Responses of graduates on increase of income and income coverage are by nature very subjective and strongly depend on the expectations of an individual. Some contradictions appeared in the analysis. In the case of OICG, the income coverage was rated very high (51% said their income covers 100% of basic needs), but FGD revealed a far less positive situation. In Ganye (YOWDAST), the FGD gathered some young, quite successful entrepreneurs, all trained in the apprenticeship scheme of YOWDAST. None of them had rated the income coverage more than 75% as they expected their businesses to grow and to become more profitable.

The raw data of MTS and YOWDAST was checked during the main study, results were found largely logical. The income coverage of persons running a business outside the home and employing others was usually above 50% while home businesses ranked below 50%.

Table 16: Coverage of basic needs by graduates' income<sup>18</sup>

	0%	25%	50%	75%	100%	Total
LOIC	2%	36%	32%	18%	12%	100%
SLOIC	1%	39%	36%	24%	1%	100%
VTF	4%	27%	31%	29%	8%	100%
MTS	5%	63%	20%	12%	0%	100%
OICG	0%	6%	20%	23%	51%	100%
YOWDAST	2%	29%	37%	32%	0%	100%
Average	2%	33%	29%	23%	12%	100%
Average without OICG	3%	39%	31%	23%	4%	100%

Table 17: Change of income after graduation

	0%	25%	50%	75%	100%	Total
LOIC	27%	27%	31%	12%	3%	100%
SLOIC	1%	29%	49%	20%	0%	100%
VTF	6%	21%	33%	30%	10%	100%
MTS	12%	53%	20%	15%	0%	100%
OICG	2%	10%	19%	32%	37%	100%
YOWDAST	2%	31%	43%	24%	0%	100%
Average	8%	28%	32%	22%	8%	100%
Average without OICG	10%	32%	35%	20%	3%	100%

Table 18a: Change of income after graduation (males)

	0%	25%	50%	75%	100%	Total
LOIC	33%	12%	34%	15%	6%	100%
SLOIC	1%	30%	50%	19%	0%	100%
VTF	5%	18%	29%	30%	19%	100%
MTS	9%	56%	12%	24%	0%	100%
OICG	0%	8%	16%	37%	39%	100%
YOWDAST	2%	35%	37%	26%	0%	100%
Average	8%	26%	30%	25%	11%	100%
Average without OICG	10%	30%	32%	23%	5%	100%

Table 18b: Change of income after graduation (females)

	0%	25%	50%	75%	100%	Total
LOIC	20%	44%	28%	8%	0%	100%
SLOIC	2%	29%	46%	22%	1%	100%
VTF	7%	22%	35%	29%	7%	100%
MTS	16%	50%	28%	6%	0%	100%
OICG	3%	10%	21%	30%	36%	100%
YOWDAST	3%	27%	47%	23%	0%	100%
Average	9%	30%	34%	20%	7%	100%
Average without OICG	9%	34%	37%	18%	2%	100%

<sup>18</sup> Please note: determination of basic needs is based on graduates' subjective opinion.



A key finding of this study is that a majority of graduates interviewed and found working can not make a living from the trade alone. According to the tracer study 64% of the graduates (without OICG 73%) earn an income that covers their basic needs by 50% and below. Only 35% (without OICG 27%) cover their basic needs by 75% and above. One explanation is that a substantial number of graduates may still be in a learning situation (e.g. working as low paid apprentice or semi-skilled labour).

Another indicator used is the perceived change of income since graduation. 36% said their increase of income is 25% and below, 32% said their income increased by 50% and 30% said 75% and above. Differences are visible between men and women. While only 27% (without OICG 20%) of women assess their increase 75% and above the rate of men is 36% (without OICG 28%).

A high percentage of graduates either gets support from the family or needs to have another source of income. Considering that 67% of all graduates interviewed are between 20 and 29, this is not a totally surprising result. In industrialised countries, youth unemployment is almost twice the rate of people above 29<sup>19</sup>. Young people face more insecure employment situations and earn less.

FGD showed that women are more often affected by underemployment than men. If income levels are too low some women opted to learn another trade, often in apprenticeship (see text box below). Many underemployed women living in urban contexts compensate their low income with petty trade. Men do this for instance with unskilled contract work, e.g. on construction sites. Trading in the informal sector is sometimes a lucrative alternative to working in a trade with low income (cases with income-coverage of 75%). Graduates holding a senior secondary school (SSS) certificate often have aspirations that are difficult to meet with work in the informal sector. Some girls rather opt staying at home and trying to study something else (e.g. teaching). In general SSS graduates, typically enrolled in formal VTI, do have more career options than a school drop out. Some men gave up working in their trade as the payment was too low and tried to get into the military service or enrolled at another technical college in order to advance their certificates and enter the formal labour market (case MTS).

The tracer study and FGD showed that the vast majority of graduates living in rural areas compensate their income with agriculture. For many, this is a normal practice in rural livelihoods. FGD in Nigeria showed that almost 80% of the participants still earn their livelihood in agriculture, some by choice others by necessity. However, there are reported cases (e.g. Matru Jong) where scarcity of land is forcing young males to seek alternative sources of livelihood. If they can not earn a living with their trade, they are forced to migrate. As said above, too little is known about the living situation of those who migrated. Sometimes migration can trigger a success story. A woman from Ghana who graduated in catering migrated to Accra and worked for someone there. She returned with some saved money and now successfully runs her own business (VFT supported VTI).

<sup>19</sup> Source OECD, unemployment statistics EU 19; 2009: Age group 20-29: 11.15% Age group 25-64: 6%.



**Case 1: Graduates of computer class MTS, Garkida, Nigeria**

Elisabeth worked in a business centre in her home town after graduation in 2008. The income she received was very small and she felt cheated by the employer so she gave up the job. She has opted to work in tailoring from her home. The income is still small and irregular but she can earn something with her own hands. Elisabeth is living with her parents and helps her parents on the farm.

Blessing studied computer in 2005. She did not work in the field but started education at a teachers college in computer and physics. She says the computer studies in the vocational school help her in her studies.

**Case 2: Female tailor from Koma village, YOWDAST graduate**

Mary was trained in tailoring. She dropped out of Junior Secondary School because of the costs of her education. Her mother could not afford to pay the school and examination fees. With the skills she had learned she started working on a self-employed basis in the shop of someone else. She had to pay little rent and had her own clients. During festivity seasons, the income became bigger. With the savings she has made, she paid the school and examination fee and succeeded in the examination. From the next income, she started animal husbandry at small scale and thus diversified her income. She says that her expectations are met, although the income she makes with tailoring today is below 50% of her family's financial needs. But the most important aspect is the fact that she has become the bread winner, earning income for her old mother and her sister.

How to determine a "success rate" for income coverage? Is an income coverage of 50% a failure or a success? Possibly, a look at efficiency helps in discussing this topic. If a centre-based training course lasts three to four years, it may be expected that the investments made are finally materialising in jobs that offer decent income potentials at least in the medium term. Non-formal short term courses on the other hand are just a "trade introduction". The graduate must continue learning, most likely on-the-job, with little earnings in the beginning.

### 3.5.3 Effectiveness of the measures provided and assessment of hindering factors

Measures specifically assessed are:

- the training in trade skills
- entrepreneurial skills training
- different types of counselling (psycho-social counselling, business counselling) and life skill training

Table 19: Factors that helped graduates to generate an income\*

	Skills learned before training	Trade skills learned during training	Moving to another place	Micro-Finance schemes	Business skills/ knowledge	Guidance and counselling	Practical experience in attachment	People met on attachment
LOIC	1,44	2,32	0,62	0,48	2,50	2,76	1,71	1,56
SLOIC	0,82	2,75	1,01	0,35	2,00	2,88	2,01	1,83
VTF	1,37	2,66	1,44	0,72	1,97	2,41	2,62	2,43
MTS	1,30	1,33	0,80	1,17	1,41	1,63	1,39	1,37
OICG	0,49	2,49	0,58	0,69	2,38	2,70	NA	1,19
YOWDAST	1,29	1,45	1,02	0,78	1,59	1,68	1,56	1,64
<b>Average</b>	<b>1,12</b>	<b>2,17</b>	<b>0,91</b>	<b>0,70</b>	<b>1,98</b>	<b>2,34</b>	<b>1,86</b>	<b>1,67</b>

\*Calculation: [(1 x Number of persons that rated factor as '1 = didn't help/ helped very little) + (2 x Number of persons that rated factor as '2 = helped a bit') + (3 x Number of persons that rated factor as '3 = helped me most')] / Total number of persons that answered the question

Please note, validity of some figures is in question because of different methods and explanations used by different interviewers

According to the quantitative analysis the most supporting factors for generating income are:

- Guidance and counselling or “advice given”
- Trade Skills learned
- Business knowledge acquired in training and on attachment)
- Practical experiences learned on attachment

The FGD confirmed “trade skills learned” as the most important benefit. Only those graduates not working in the field of training rated trade skills lower.

The benefit of guidance, counselling and life skill training was confirmed through FGD, but it was noted that counselling, in most cases, is offered as a rather informal advice by teachers or persons engaged in follow up. The case study OICG provides some concrete examples for the effectiveness of life skill training:

- Follow up and advice boost our morale
- I can manage my personal income better
- I know how to apply for a job
- I improved the way how I communicate with people

Business skills are rated third highest. In the case of OICG, both business training and business counselling were given a high priority. In the case of YOWDAST, participants said they learn the business skills by observation and by being exposed to customers but the EST sessions conducted by external resource persons seem not to be very effective. In the case of VTF supported VTI, business skills were not rated high, possibly because a substantial number of graduates are not self-employed.

Moving to another place was rated low. Considering that only a minority of labour migrants could be traced this rating may not show the real situation. Skills acquired before training play a minor role, but FGD in Ghana and Nigeria showed that 15 – 25% of trainees interviewed had learned another skill or graduated from another institution before joining a course or programme (except for agriculture). Microfinance plays the least role. The reason is that

hardly any graduate interviewed knew about MFI services. Some importance was given to “getting to know people on attachment or apprenticeship”, but the consultants had expected that this aspect would be rated higher.

In FGD graduates emphasised the importance of certification. For wage employment in the formal sector, a formal TVET certificate is often a condition to get a job. In the case of MTS, the institution is not (yet) accredited. The tracer study showed that the internal MTS diploma was of little use for the graduates when applying for a job in public administration or in the military<sup>20</sup>. The importance of certificates was even stressed in the case of apprenticeship schemes but it was difficult to get an explanation on the actual benefits. For work in the informal sector, a certificate is rarely demanded by an employer (sometimes it is even a disadvantage). What counts are rather skills, loyalty, honesty and willingness to learn. It seems that the certificate is more of personal use (boosting self-esteem) than of material benefit. In some instances, a certificate may be needed to obtain a business license.

In the case of YOWDAST and possibly in the case of LOIC as well (no confirmation), the subsidy for tools and equipment was rated high as a supportive factor, but in FGD, participants gave more value to the trade and business skills learned on the job.

Table 20: Factors that hindered graduates to generate an income\*

	Lack of employment opportunities	Lack of business opportunities	Lack of practical experience	Training course not good enough	Did not know people	Family responsibilities	Lack of business skills/knowledge	Lack of credit possibilities
<b>LOIC</b>	2,45	2,28	0,99	0,86	1,51	1,16	0,98	2,31
<b>SLOIC</b>	2,46	1,97	0,78	0,57	0,88	1,77	0,91	2,12
<b>VTF</b>	1,94	1,87	1,15	0,92	1,20	1,27	1,22	1,64
<b>MTS</b>	1,61	1,37	0,60	0,94	1,11	1,20	0,88	1,42
<b>OICG</b>	0,47	0,74	0,53	0,29	0,50	0,41	0,58	1,93
<b>YOWDAST</b>	1,09	0,75	0,50	0,56	0,63	0,58	0,46	0,76
<b>Average</b>	<b>1,67</b>	<b>1,50</b>	<b>0,76</b>	<b>0,69</b>	<b>0,97</b>	<b>1,07</b>	<b>0,84</b>	<b>1,70</b>

\*Calculation: [(1 x Number of persons that rated factor as '1 = didn't hinder me at all) + (2 x Number of persons that rated factor as '2 = hindered me a bit') + (3 x Number of persons that rated factor as '3 = hindered me most')] / Total number of persons that answered the question

According to the quantitative analysis, the following factors are most hindering:

- Lack of credit possibilities
- Lack of employment possibilities
- Lack of business opportunities

Lack of employment and business possibilities are closely related, they are the most hindering factor. This finding underlines the necessity to offer vocational skills that are demanded in the market. Family responsibilities and lack of business knowledge was rated of medium importance. Low rating was given to “lack of practical experiences” and “training course not good enough”.

In general, FGD confirmed the quantitative results. Some statements:

- Do not have capital to start (all)

<sup>20</sup> For many young men in Nigeria a career in the military is highly desired.

- Not enough work, irregularity of work and payment, income too low (all)
- Scarcity of places to start a business (in towns) (OICG)
- Unfair business practices, customers do not pay (OICG, YOWDAST)
- Do not have a diploma, do not know the right people for getting a job, lack of employment possibilities (MTS)

### 3.5.4 Overall achievement of project objectives

An overarching project objective of the six VT programmes/ projects is to train young people to become self-reliant. The direct objective is that graduates become wage or self-employed.

The issue of self-reliance is closely connected with the employment status of a person and the income earned. The analysis above shows that approx. 70% of all graduates of the years 2003 – 07 are employed and earn an income and approx. 60% earn an income in the trade learned. This is a positive overall achievement, however only 35% say that they earn a decent income that covers 75% of their basic needs and above. On the lower end, 35% of the graduates interviewed have sporadic earnings which cover not more than 25% of their needs.

Women earn less than men with the trade skills they have learned. The majority of graduates participating in FGD are still supported by their parents, but at the same time it has to be considered that the majority of interviewed graduates fall in the age group of 20-29. With this information it can be concluded that **the skills learned improve livelihood perspectives for the majority of the beneficiaries.**

The results on income mentioned above indicate that the **objective of promoting self-reliance is about “half way” achieved.** This of course is a disputable conclusion. An achievement above 60% may not even be feasible considering the employment situation in most countries. The external factors that strongly influence this outcome are the overall labour market and economic situation in the four countries and the absolute growth of the youth population.

## 3.6 Impact

Impact was defined as:

- Direct impact on social status of beneficiaries in their communities (e.g. sustainability of the employment, positive change in social status)
- Direct impact on families (e.g. providing financial support to families, sending children to school)
- Indirect impact on communities (e.g. creation of jobs, apprentices trained, availability of services)
- Indirect impact on gender roles
- Other unintended positive or negative impacts

Information on impact was obtained from case studies, FGD and field observations.

### 3.6.1 Impact on social status of individuals

Consultants and partners collected a number of success cases, but it is difficult to quantify the results. In FGD, graduates stated improved self esteem and improved social position in the family and community as the two most important changes. The perceived improvement of the social status is closely connected with the change of the economic situation of a graduate. On a scale of positive social change, those graduates who have established a business on their own outside their home usually ranked highest. Yet, the FGD showed that even graduates who earn relatively little also gave accounts about their improved social status in the family and community:

- ‘I am more independent, I earn money and can pay the rent of my room’
- ‘Before, I was nobody, now people show me more respect because I have a skill’ (several responses in different locations)
- ‘I get more respect from my husband because I have a skill and can earn some income’ (several responses in four different locations)
- ‘People in the village call me an engineer, this is rare for a women’
- ‘I can dress nicely, before I was wearing rugged cloth’ (two responses from two different locations, both men and women)
- ‘I am now invited to community functions’
- ‘I do not have a job as a mechanic but I can help other people repair their generators or cars and they help me in return’

The statements have one thing in common: having learned a skill and getting the feeling of being “needed” and “respected” helps **young people to develop self esteem**, even if the income is small. If expectations raised through the training do not materialise over a longer period of time, the hope may well turn into frustration.

### 3.6.2 Sustainability of employment

Sustainability of employment is influenced by the economic situation of a country and region and by market developments. According to the tracer study, 69% of graduates are self-employed. Only a minority of the wage employed have permanent contracts, many graduates work as daily workers. It can be concluded that the majority of graduates works in unstable employment situations as typical for work and income in the informal sector. Very few graduates found permanent formal sector employment.

Case studies show that integration in the “informal” labour market is a process. The most successful cases are graduates who accepted to work for a small income after graduation and later, after having gained experiences, started their own business.

In the rural areas (but also in the context of urban informal markets) one can not speak of “employment” in the conventional way. For rural people trade skills may provide an additional income either in casual work during low farm season or as a “side-business” which provides additional cash income.

### 3.6.3 Direct impact on families and communities

Graduates working and earning an income reported mainly about three direct benefits for their families:

- Being able to contribute to family income
- Being able to pay school fees for children
- Becoming a bread winner (several women)

FGD in MTS and YOWDAST (sample of 41 graduates) showed that:

- 51% are financially still dependent on their families
- 28% provide and get support or are independent
- 21% give more support to their parents/ relatives

Examples of benefits given in the “most significant change” exercises conducted in Nigeria:

- ‘bought land from the income made’
- ‘Can feed my family’
- ‘Build a house’
- ‘No need for support from relatives, I am independent’

It is concluded that in most cases the income does not cover the family needs but it is reducing the economic vulnerability of families.

The majority of graduates interviewed are below the age of 30 and earn less than 50% of the basic needs, majority is still depending on parents, thus the direct economic impact on communities is supposed to be limited. But resource persons interviewed in communities high-lighted benefits such as:

- ‘youth being less dependent on families’,
- ‘youth being less idle’,
- ‘having less trouble makers in the community’
- ‘self-employed youth becoming positive role models’
- ‘youth participating in reconstruction’ (Liberia)

The most visible impact for communities is the creation of jobs and opportunities for training by graduates. According to the tracer study, 24% of the self-employed graduates run a business and employ others. Considering the total sample 2% of the graduates are employing others.

Table 21: Estimated percentage of graduates employing others

	Percentage of self-employed graduates employing others*	Estimated percentage of graduates employing others**
LOIC	33% (53 out of 161)	6% (53 out of 885)
SLOIC	24% (42 out of 178)	1% (42 out of 3031)
VTF	17% (34 out of 198)	2% (34 out of 2129)
MTS	31% (11 out of 35)	10% (11 out of 110)
OICG	15% (14 out of 93)	2% (14 out of 659)
YOWDAST	31% (39 out of 125)	4% (39 out of 944)
<b>Average</b>	<b>24% (193 out of 790)</b>	<b>2% (193 out of 7758)</b>

\*base value: number of self employed graduates answering Q12c, tracer study Q12c

\*\* base value: total number of graduates traced

Further examples of impacts stated in rural contexts:

- A trainee repairing a generator in the local hospital even before graduation and graduates taking part in the rehabilitation of the county administrative buildings (LOIC)
- A graduate of the computer course opening the first shop in town to service mobile phones (MTS)
- Communities getting better quality products and services from the graduates and having services locally available (e.g. welding, motorcycle repair; LOIC, YOWDAST)
- Masters employing better skilled workers (SLOIC)

Some positive impacts mentioned may have a potential for negative side effects:

- Communities paying lower rates for services (SLOIC),
- Communities no longer have to employ people from other regions (rural village Ganye, Nigeria)

As said above, cases have been identified where **graduates became respected members of their communities and role models** for other youth because of their individual achievements<sup>21</sup>. Some exemplary cases:

- A tailor from a rural village, trained by YOWDAST in Ganye in 2003 started a business in 2005 and has since bought two more machines from the earned income and trains two apprentices
- A welder in Ganye who was one of the first YOWDAST graduates established a well-functioning workshop in the market, presently trains five apprentices and produces steel doors of good quality
- A woman in Kumasi who was trained in catering received a loan from OICG and bought a mobile food stall. Her younger brother and sister work with her in the shop and she became the bread winner of the family

<sup>21</sup> Please note: no case studies are available of SLOIC and VTF supported VTI.



### 3.6.4 Indirect impact on gender roles and relations

The change of gender roles and relations is not an explicit objective of vocational training. Projects that explicitly or implicitly aim at improving female employment (VTF, OICG) have addressed gender issues mainly through life skill training and counselling. OICG has employed a female counsellor and a female business development officer.

A general weakness is the insufficient variety of skill training options for women. On average, women are earning less than men, but the means to influence this situation through vocational skills trainings alone are limited. Several respondents said: 'women who have a skill have a better chance to marry'. Female graduates were saying: 'since graduation I am more respected in my family/ by my husband'. The focus groups showed, as a result of vocational skills training, both skills and income as enhance the self-esteem of young women and men. The improved economic situation of a woman, as said above, may lead to improved status in the community, but not in all cases. Women working in palm oil extraction accomplish a very hard and dirty work and earn an income well above the level of other "female" trades. They said 'people may not respect us when they see us working but we do not care as long as we have a good income'. They also said 'what matters most for us is sending our children to school'. Cases showed that women who earn their own income

- can achieve a higher level of independence and have a better chance to influence financial decisions in the family
- were able to advance their education and thus gain a higher status in the family and among peers in the community

Projects have, except for a few examples, not succeeded in integrating women in "men-dominated trades" and do far too little to identify new market opportunities for women. Examples of success cases:

- A female tractor mechanic in a village close to Ganye who is very proud to work in a typical "men's trade" and is respected in the community
- The first female owner of a business centre in Ganye town (both cases YOWDAST)
- A reported case of a female auto mechanic employed in a garage in Jos (MTS), women trainees in automotive repair who took part in skills competition in public
- A female went to learn tailoring and was encouraged to join masonry. She utilises this skill working with a team of 4, including 3 male colleagues in Gbarnga, Liberia.
- A female graduate, observed by the consultants in Bo, Sierra Leone, working on an electrical line, employed by the Kenema Bo Power Supply. Other electricity female graduates are also on standby for possible employment

The educational level, but even more the personality of the young women, plays an important role. In the case of OICG, many of the women dropped out of school and are still of young age. Some are not serious about the training, others do not feel strong enough to take up the risk of establishing a business. In the case of OICG, life skill sessions touch gender issues. Positive effects are the sensitisation of men and women on reproductive health issues (but more women than men stated this as a benefit). Women highlighted that they can better protect themselves from unwanted pregnancies.

No information was obtained on the impact on gender roles on male graduates. This area needs to be studied further. Independent from the project interventions, resource persons reported about the social changes in communities that affect young men and their families:

- Increasing mobility, young men moving away from home without consensus of parents
- Young men being involved in crime and violent acts as a result of economic marginalisation/ underemployment,
- Young men migrating and leaving behind women with children.

There are cases where young males became positive role models in their communities. Graduates of the apprenticeship schemes were proud of having learned a skill and being accepted in the community. For males vocational skills training can have an important impact on their personality development, provided they find a job and/or income in their trade.

The potential impact on migration is discussed below. Men are more mobile in the search for jobs but also women migrate (examples from Ghana). The latter may be an unintended impact on gender roles (hypothesis).

### 3.6.5 Unexpected and unintended impacts

#### Impacts on migration

According to the tracer study, 79% of the graduates live at the same place as before the training.

Table 22: Percentage of graduates living at the same place/ sending money

	Percentage still living in community	Percentage still living with family	Percentage sending money*	
			regularly	sometimes
LOIC	85%	65%	2%	25%
SLOIC	87%	38%	5%	51%
VTF	64%	27%	11%	49%
MTS	84%	33%	2%	33%
OICG	74%	65%	2%	33%
YOWDAST	no data			
<b>Average</b>	<b>79%</b>	<b>46%</b>	<b>4%</b>	<b>38%</b>

\*high number of invalid responses

The validity of the findings of the tracer study is limited as only those who were reached could be interviewed. In some cases, the results are contradictory. In the case of YOWDAST, the vast majority of graduates say they are living in the place of training but at the same time 60 respondents say moving to another place has helped to generate income.

In the case of SLOIC, it was found that mostly men and especially masons migrate to cities for contract work. The results of the tracer study on money sent back to families is not valid, as the question was mostly answered by people who have not migrated. It became obvious through FGD and interviews with resource persons that migrants often face hard competition for jobs in the cities. Furthermore, life in the city is more expensive. The consultants heard of

cases where graduates found a decently paid job (e.g. MTS and VFT supported VTI graduates who work as secretaries) but no precise information was available to what extent their families in the village actually benefit from the income they earn. If the earned income does not cover basic needs, it is assumed that home communities' benefit is marginal (hypothesis).

#### Risk of market saturation and market distortion especially in rural areas

If too many people are trained in one trade in the same location, either through a rural training centre (example Mattru Jong (S.L.) and Sinje (Liberia) or rural apprenticeship schemes (YOWDAST), markets can quickly saturate. The impacts may be negative, e.g.:

- Prices for specific services and products drop
- Income of existing businesses declines
- Graduates have to migrate

#### Impact on peace building and conflict prevention

Because of the short time span and the complexity of this topic it was beyond the means of the team to assess the impact on conflict and (re-)integration in greater depth.<sup>22</sup>

Both SLOIC and LOIC have been training ex-combatants and contributed to their reintegration. In the case of SLOIC, the last ex-combatant graduated before 2006, in LOIC in 2007. In the case of SLOIC, reports were given in earlier evaluations that ex-combatants have changed their behaviour, gained self esteem through the training and esteem within the community (statements not verified by the team). Earlier case studies of one of the consultants in the region (including case studies of SLOIC and LOIC) showed both, positive effects and failures. LOIC's attempts to reintegrate ex-combatants and to resettle war-affected youth during the years of conflict (1999 - 2005) have repeatedly failed because of re-recruitments through armed fractions and repeated displacements. Since the end of armed conflict, the conditions have improved significantly, which facilitated the return of many ex-combatants and IDPs to peaceful life. It is assumed that skills training has contributed to the resettlement, but the work of many NGOs in the fields of trauma healing, reconciliation and community rehabilitation have an equal share in the success. Case studies conducted by other actors in both countries showed that those combatants that were engaged in atrocities did often not return to their rural home villages out of fear of revenge but instead opted to settle in the cities.

In the case of YOWDAST, it was reported that youth in the villages are less idling and the rate of petty crime has been reduced. It was also reported that migration of unskilled men from rural villages in the project region to the South East of Nigeria, a region known for unrest and high levels of crime, has become less. These statements were made by different persons interviewed but no means were available to verify the statements.

<sup>22</sup> For further reading on this topic see "case studies, promoting livelihood and employment in post conflict", EED/FAKT and the resource CD of this project containing studies of other actors.

### Other unintended impacts

Apprenticeship schemes interfere with traditional systems of apprenticeship as practiced since hundreds of years. In some cases, master trainers stopped recruiting other regular ap-prentices because the fees they get paid by the project are a secure income. In other cases, masters consider training to be a profitable business, but mostly without influence of the project (most of their trainees are not financed by the project). To what extent the projects have changed the practice of charging fees is difficult to determine. There may be instances, especially in rural areas, where masters did not charge a fee before coming into contact with the project. Another aspect is the relation between traditional apprentices (who have to pay a fee) and project supported apprentices (which get benefits). Earlier reports (evaluation OICG) reported about jealousy because the projects create “two classes” of apprentices, but the teams did not learn about arising conflicts. A critical element is the selection of trainees: who benefits and who does not? In the case of YOWDAST, the criteria for selection was diffuse, some people have benefited that would not fall under the category of “poor”.

The teams could not detect any unexpected impacts in case of projects where the majority of beneficiaries were female.

As said before, tool kits and equipment provide an incentive to enrol in a VT programme. In Liberia, some ex-combatants have enrolled in several schemes in order to get the benefits (example from EU funded projects). The EED funding helped LOIC to offer training to communities so as to balance services to all conflict affected groups.

## 3.7 Efficiency

Efficiency is assessed by using the following criteria:

- Outreach of the project (number persons trained vis-à-vis demand)
- Costs for training one person
- Cost benefit (costs in relation to project effectiveness)

According to the pre-study information, the direct partners of EED (except VTF supported VTI) have trained 5809 persons. The outreach per institution or project is higher for apprenticeship schemes and non-formal training programmes as the duration of the training is shorter (up to one year) compared to formal TVET (2 – 4 years).

Table 23: Total number trained

Organisation	Total trained 2003- 07
LOIC	885
SLOIC	3031
<i>VTF supported VTI (10 institutions)</i>	<i>2129 On average 212 per institution</i>
MTS	290
OICG	659
YOWDAST	944
<b>Total</b>	<b>7938</b>

The table below shows the costs of training per trainee per annum. The information is not complete as no reliable data was available from LOIC. The data of VTF supported VTI can not be directly used for comparison as the costs do not include teacher's salaries<sup>23</sup>.

Table 24: The costs of training per person (average 2005 – 2007) according to pre-study information and case study reports<sup>24</sup>

Organisation	Average total costs* per trainee p.a. in EURO	Average direct costs per trainee in EURO**
LOIC	NA	NA
SLOIC	298	NA
MTS	624	385
VTI Ghana	N/A	56-87 excluding salaries of teachers! Estimated costs including personnel: 168-261€
OICG	557	203
YOWDAST	402	192

NA: no information or no reliable information available

\* including all administrative costs

\*\* including teachers' salaries, consumable training materials and other direct programme costs (exposure trips, organisation of seminars etc.)

To assess efficiency, it helps to compare costs with TVET programmes in other parts of Africa and the World:

- According to other evaluations conducted by the author in East Africa costs range from 150 € (public TVET centres) to 300 € (NGO) per annum
- According to international studies the average costs of training per trainee p.a. range from 216€ (Mali) to 500€ (Cote D'Ivoire)
- On average 60 - 80% of the costs of centre based training are staff salaries
- Vocational training is at least double as expensive as academic education

The total costs of training of the EED partners are generally on the higher side, compared to actors elsewhere. The direct costs of the EED supported apprenticeship schemes reach about half to two third of the costs of formal, centre based training. If one deducts the costs for post training support (which the training centres hardly provide), the apprenticeship schemes are (potentially) more efficient.

All programmes, across the models and countries, have high costs for infrastructure (buildings, automobiles) and relatively high administrative costs. These costs constitute a substantial portion of the budget. The percentage of administrative and investment costs to direct training costs ranges from 60% (OICG) to 40% (MTS)<sup>25</sup>.

<sup>23</sup> An estimation was made on the assumption that 2/3 of the costs are salaries.

<sup>24</sup> Please note: it is assumed that the calculation base for direct costs of training vary from partner to partner.

<sup>25</sup> No figures available for SLOIC and LOIC.

The other significant factor is the number of persons trained and graduated per annum vis-à-vis the programme costs. While administrative costs remain the same, the number of trainees is fluctuating, as are the costs per trainee. In several cases the number of students/ trainees has been declining in the past years while costs have been increasing. This actually means that, for most studies partners, efficiency is declining.

VTIs have students 9 months a year, about 6 hours a day and 3 months break. During afternoons and the long breaks, facilities are not utilised.

The cost-benefit-analysis compares unit costs and effectiveness. The table below is an attempt to compare the two aspects.

Table 25: employment rate and unit costs

	Employed (wage/self)	Duration of training	Estimated unit costs (Costs for graduating p. person)
LOIC	87%	9 months	Na
SLOIC	60%	1 year	Na
VTF	61%	4 years	Approx.-858
MTS	56%	2 years (2 courses 1 year)	670 – 770
OICG	63%	6 – 12 months	101 – 203
YOWDAST	91%	12 months	192

According to this calculation, it costs two to four times to graduate one student in a formal TVET institution compared to an apprenticeship scheme. No cost comparison was possible between formal and non-formal training. The employment rates of the three approaches do not differ significantly but non-formal training and apprenticeship schemes show a slightly higher effectiveness.

The findings of this study do not support the thesis that long term, formal TVET programmes provide their graduates with better labour market opportunities. The main reason is the lack of employment opportunities in the formal industrial sector in most locations visited. Apprenticeship schemes and non-formal vocational training in the context of West African labour markets may have a higher “direct” cost benefit than long term formal TVET programmes, provided that the training offered is responsive to local market demands.

## 4 Summary of conclusions

### 4.1 Comparative analysis of the three VT approaches

Initially it was thought that the six case studies can be clustered into three distinctive vocational skills development approaches.

- Formal centre based training of long duration
- Non-formal skills development
- Apprenticeship schemes

In reality it was found that approaches overlap. Examples:

- SLOIC is situated between formal and non-formal VT, as it has formal entry requirements for some courses and not for others and the certification is accredited
- MTS implements a concept of formal vocational education but the certification is not accredited
- Some master trainers in Kumasi (OICG) turning their businesses into low cost- non-formal training centres training more than 20 people at a time
- VTF supported formal VTI has extended attachment periods and is thus approaching some form of cooperative training model which entails a substantial period of on-the-job training in the private sector

**Centre based formal** technical vocational education and training (TVET) is integrated in the education and training system. It has a higher theory focus compared to the other models and graduates often lack sufficient exposure to real jobs. Teaching is often focused on passing theory biased examinations rather than performing work tasks. This is considered the core problem. In the case of VTF supported VTIs, the disadvantage of formal schooling is partly compensated by relatively long periods of attachments (three months) after each year (till now three attachments). A well organised attachment period of at least three months a year is an important success factor.

An advantage of formal TVET is that graduates obtain government recognised certification and thus have better changes of advancing their technical training and/ or gain entry into formal, educational programs combined with technical education, as with the multilateral schools (BWI) in Liberia and in Government Technical Institutes in Sierra Leone. In reality, however, only a small percentage of the graduates covered by the tracer study are continuing higher education.

Formal VT does not reach the poorest of the poor. The two most excluding factors are (a) costs and duration of training and (b) secondary education as an entry requirement. Secondary school graduates enrolling in formal VTI have aspirations. Often they do not accept



low paid jobs or poor working conditions in the informal sector unless they have no other choice and rather prefer further education.

The costs for graduating one person are the highest in the case of long term courses lasting more than two years. Tracer study results did not indicate a higher employment rate and a better quality of employment compared to the other training models.

Especially in rural areas formal centre based training lacks relevance. Rural labour markets are almost entirely informal and graduates are either forced to migrate or have to seek other income opportunities not related to their fields of training. Training providers situated in rural areas have little possibilities of cooperating with industries.

**Centre based non-formal vocational skills development** is usually more practice oriented than formal TVET as it does not (or less) contain academic/ theory content. The courses are usually shorter. Education is no entry requirement, the course is open for all. This is important especially in contexts where target groups have no or insufficient access to formal schooling (e.g. post war Sierra Leone and Liberia, neglected rural areas, depressed urban communities). In the case of SLOIC, the training approach is more formal. LOIC did offer courses of six (now nine) months which combined acquisition of trade and agricultural skills. It appears that this approach was quite successful as it gave the graduate more than one opportunity for income generation, although the training period was possibly too short. Most significant limitations for greater effectiveness are the poor quality of skills training and little variety of trades offered. All centres have been offering basic courses but no advanced skills. None of the training providers offered short term courses in specific skill areas as practiced elsewhere. None of the courses were offered in a modular approach (basic/ advanced/specialised) and none of the training providers (except the apprenticeship schemes) involved communities. Community based training using group models as practiced in parts of East Africa and in Asia is not known.

**Improved apprenticeship schemes** are practice oriented. Learning takes place informally on the job. The quality stands and falls with the appropriate selection of masters and the regularity of the follow-up. Critical factors are the actual exposure and involvement of the trainee in the work process, i.e. the readiness of the master to involve trainees in the production process, the availability and frequency of work and the qualification of the master. If the apprenticeship model turns into low-cost non formal training (too many trainees trained in one place without sufficient integration of trainees in the work processes), there is a risk of poor quality training. With regard to cost-effectiveness, the improved apprenticeship schemes seem to have an advantage. They are more flexible in the selection of trades and can offer a wider variety, as they do not have to invest in training infrastructure. They can also cover wider geographic areas and reach out to marginalised communities. The impact in some cases has been remarkable. Skill upgrading of master trainers is an important measure to improve sustainability and outreach.

**The improved apprenticeship schemes** are not suitable for all trades. Centre based training has the advantage of offering a structured learning process. Combining the two models is particularly recommendable in technical fields such as automotive repair and services in modern technologies (e.g. electronics) where trainees need a good theoretical basis. Cooperative models have the advantage of combining structured learning in a centre with a long period of workplace training. Pre-condition for implementing such a model is collaboration between training providers and the local private sector, which few of the partners are practising.

### Adequacy of the three approaches for different contexts

In Sierra Leone and Liberia, the majority of young people have dropped out of school because of the war and female illiteracy is generally high. In both countries non-formal VT programmes with no educational entry requirements are far more appropriate than formal VTI. With the improvement of the education system in both countries, this situation may change.

In Ghana and Nigeria, formal VTIs should concentrate on trades where they have an advantage in comparison to informal apprenticeship. Because of the high costs, formal technical training should remain a task of government institutions which have better access to state funding. It is not adequate to operate formal VTI in rural areas because of efficiency limitations and lacking relevance to rural markets unless there is a clearly identified lack of formal vocational training in a region.

In all the four countries, improved apprenticeship schemes are applicable. The most viable way of improving apprenticeships is to upgrade the skills of master trainers. VTF wants to embark on this strategy, the two apprenticeship schemes would have to extend partnerships with other actors as they can not provide this service by themselves. The other partners do not have the capacity to work in this field.

### Summary

**The most decisive factor for effectiveness is the market orientation and the quality of training, not the training model.** The advantage of improved apprenticeship schemes is their flexibility and their outreach. It appears that apprenticeship schemes provide slightly better opportunities for men than for women, as men have better opportunities for integration in the informal labour market.

Demand depends more on attractiveness of a trade than on the training model. Long term courses seem to lose relevance because of their lower cost-effectiveness while non-formal training and apprenticeship which does not provide certification may not be valued by youth with formal schooling. The drop out rate depends on the costs of training and on the training quality. Grants (start up tools/ equipment) are an incentive to enrol and stay in a course despite the quality.

## 4.2 Further conclusions

### Reaching out to the poor

Four out of the six EED sponsored partners target and reach out to poor unemployed youth. This is achieved (1) by offering VT courses with low entry requirements where education is mostly no selection criterion (this applies especially to Sierra Leone, Liberia and Nigeria) and (2) by charging fees affordable to the target group.

Demand for training in most case studies has been stagnating despite the growth of the youth population. An external factor may be the increase in the number of VT providers. Especially in Ghana, “way side training” has become a low cost alternative for skills acquisition. Small enterprises increasingly discover vocational skills training as a business opportunity. The poor face barriers for enrolling in a long term training course (e.g. the four year courses offered by VTI in Ghana) for which they have to pay a fee. Flexible, modular non-formal skills training and improved apprenticeship schemes are more appropriate for reaching out to the poorest of the poor.

In three of the six EED sponsored projects/ programmes, female trainees are in the majority, but the variety of training options for females are insufficient. There is no case known to the consultants where specific ethnic groups have been marginalised. Church affiliated institutions tend to enrol Christians, which can be a conflict sensitive issue in regions where the relationship between Christians and Moslems is not at peace (e.g. the middle belt of Nigeria).

#### Analysis of effectiveness per trade

No general conclusions can be made per trade area as the labour market situation varies from one place to the other. For details see case studies.

Traditional trades such as tailoring/ dress making, carpentry or hair dressing can be effectively learned on-the job. The demand for labour in these conventional trade areas depends on the state of development of the local markets and traditional customs. In Nigeria for instance tailoring can still be a viable trade while in Sierra Leone the market seems saturated.

As mentioned several times, the training options for females are far less as for males, which are affecting their employability. In technical trades (e.g. electronics, automotive repair), centre based training has advantages as it follows a more systematic learning process. But centre based training, if not linked to markets, has a comparative disadvantage over market based skill acquisition. Thus in the technical trades, cooperative training models, where part of the skill acquisition takes place in the market and on the job, are most promising. Cooperative training models may not be feasible in rural areas.

#### Labour market orientation

The primary criterion used by training providers for selecting a trade is the social demand, i.e. the number of applications received for trade or a course. This practice has led to stereotype centre based training programmes over many years. Labour market considerations play a secondary role in trade selection.

Labour markets in all the four countries offer potential which are not yet addressed by the training providers. Value addition to agricultural products is one example, only one partner is offering palm oil processing quite successfully as a trade. The growing middle class in Ghanaian and Nigerian cities is probably providing new opportunities for skills development and employment promotion. But also rural markets change, as experienced in Nigeria, where bicycles are slowly replaced by cheap Chinese motorbikes.

The apprenticeship schemes showed more flexibility in trade selection and the project staff is closer to the market, but the diversity the market offers is not yet fully reflected by these programmes. Training too many people in one skill area in the same location and providing

them with start up tools and equipment may even lead to negative effects such as market saturation and market distortion.

All partners lack methodologies for conducting market surveys in their localities and developing training offers accordingly. The public TVET systems do not provide guidance in this aspect.

### Quality of training

Quality is an important factor for the effectiveness of vocational skills training, across the training models studied. The quality is particularly influenced by:

- The trade and methodological competences of instructors and master trainers
- Exposure of trainees/ students to practical work
- The integration of soft skills and entrepreneurial skills in the curriculum

The methodological knowledge of instructors and teachers, in some cases also the practical skills, were often not sufficient to provide good quality training. There is a lack of training of trainers (TOT) in all countries. In Ghana, VTF is addressing this gap. Because of the effects of the war, teachers training did not take place for many years and the TVET systems are not yet fully functional in Sierra Leone and Liberia. In Nigeria, both EED partners work in a remote part of the country in relative isolation to other actors. An additional challenge is that working in a VTI is not very attractive for young qualified personnel and older staff goes on retirement. Staff development is remaining a crucial but cost intensive and thus unresolved issue.

### Gender orientation of the VT programmes

Women face a number of disadvantages in the West African labour markets. They have less training and employment options and usually earn less. Progress has been made as the number of women in VT has increased. Three of the six partners enrol more women than men, both partners in Ghana have a clear focus on women (VTF, OICG). No progress has been made with respect to the integration of women in men dominated trades. The variety of training options for women is largely insufficient. Male instructors are still in the majority and in four of the six partners, females are not adequately represented in management. A pre-condition for successfully promoting female employment is a greater focus on personality building and empowerment. About 50% of the partners are teaching life skill subjects but usually not in a gender specific manner. More research is needed to address male specific topics in life skill courses.

The disadvantage faced by women in the West African labour markets has to do with some cultural beliefs and practices on expectations of particular jobs and roles for women. Therefore, all six programmes should deliberately include advocacy and awareness raising in their programmes an advocacy aspect tailored towards encouraging females to begin to explore male dominated trades and new market opportunities as this will help reduce the saturation of trades like tailoring and knitting mostly dominated by females. This is in addition to exploring more training options for women as well as engaging more female instructors and more women in management.

### Acquisition of entrepreneurial and life skills

It is good practice to integrate entrepreneurial and life skills in the curriculum of self-employment oriented training programmes. Achievements have been made in this regard. All partners teach entrepreneurship but often in the way of classroom teaching. Both topics need to be taught in an integrated manner for which many teachers lack methodological know how.

The integration of entrepreneurial and life skills in the curriculum of self-employment oriented training programmes should be done from a gender perspective. There is need for a deliberate focus on female entrepreneurial skills as well as demystifying the myths against male dominated trades.

### Quality control, monitoring and evaluation

Three of the six partners conduct tracer studies, the partners in Ghana have good systems of documentation. OICG has developed a well functioning management system for the apprenticeship scheme which can serve as a model to others. The other partners have very weak systems of monitoring and documentation. A general weakness is the use of the monitoring information to steer the projects. Tracer study results are not or not sufficiently used for project/ programme planning. Documentation should be disaggregated by gender.

### Conclusion on the indirect impact of vocational training on poverty reduction

It is challenging to attribute one development intervention to the far reaching objective of poverty alleviation. It is even more difficult in the case of VT as it usually targets individuals who come from many places (unless a project targets specific communities such as YOWDAST). In the case of several development actors working in one locality, the impact assessment is further complicated.

Two indirect criteria can be used to assess the indirect impact of VT on poverty reduction:

- the outreach of VT to the poor
- the effect of VT on the income situation of individuals and the communities

The majority of the VT projects studied reach out to the poor, and the majority of graduates are earning an income with the skills learned. Both are achievements considering the extent of youth underemployment and the labour market situation in the four countries studied. The quantitative outputs (“outreach”) of the 2 non-formal and one of the two apprenticeship schemes have been sufficient, less so for the formal VTI and the other apprenticeship scheme, which are working below capacity.

The study indicates that the net income which the majority of the younger graduates earn, but especially of the females, is not above the poverty level of 2 US\$ a day, thus the indirect impact on poverty alleviation on the home communities is limited. However, if thinking in longer term dimensions, as case studies of older graduates showed, vocational skills training is laying a foundation for many to gain a livelihood.

Though the employment rate of women after training is less than as compared to men, the majority of the women employed contribute greatly to their family upkeep and in the community. This therefore means that if female employment can be promoted through

vocational skills development, there will be visible poverty reduction in families and the communities.

There have been reports from resource persons that poverty has been reduced as an effect of the project interventions (see case study YOWDAST). It was beyond the means of this study to verify these claims, but the teams identified cases where several young people trained from one village improved their economic situation visibly, thus contributing to poverty reduction in their community.

## 4.3 Lessons learned

### Factors for success

Good quality vocational skill training provides graduates with an advantage over other competitors in the labour market. But quality alone is not the most decisive factor. Market relevance and market linkage, i.e. learning the skills demanded in the market and being exposed to market realities are the most decisive factors for employment. The case of YOWDAST shows that even basic level training can be successful, provided that the skills are marketable and the learner has the ability and possibilities to advance his/ her skills.

Exposure of trainees to the world of work during the training facilitates their integration in the labour market. Well organised attachment to small enterprises is compensating weaknesses of centre based training and often provides opportunities for further learning (apprenticeship) and access to jobs.

The involvement of communities in the training process, beginning with trade selection, selection of trainees and post training support facilitates both, social and economic integration. It also strengthens local ownership of VT projects/ programmes.

Collaboration with businesses enables VT projects/ programmes to better understand markets, to enhance market relevance of curricula and to improve attachment and employment opportunities.

Personality building is very important to prepare trainees for self employment. This applies especially to girls who face many challenges in the labour market.

Vocational skill training is reaching out to youth at a critical age. Especially young men in the urban centres but also young women are exposed to social challenges such as crime and violence, drug abuse and HIV/ Aids. Holistic VT programmes which integrate life skills into the training can address these challenges.

Counselling, even if provided in informal ways, is providing needed moral support to students/ trainees and adds value to vocational skills training programmes as it addresses challenges which young people are facing in a fast changing world.

The effectiveness of improved apprenticeship schemes depends (besides market relevant trade selection) on a close collaboration of the project with enterprises, good selection of master trainers, a joint understanding of the training content and frequent follow-ups.

Although not originally a key focus area of vocational skills development, literacy and numeracy at beginners' level is providing additional skills to trainees who come to the training



illiterate; this has brought added value to graduates in terms of their personal dignity and self confidence.

There are various comparative advantages and experiences which the different EED funded programmes/ projects could learn from, e. g. child care (Liberia); tracer study (Ghana); internship / attachments (Sierra Leone and Ghana), community involvement (Nigeria).

### Challenges and unresolved issues

Self-employment in many cases means underemployment, i.e. the graduate can not have a livelihood from the trade income alone. What is gainful and what is acceptable employment for young people in urban and in rural contexts? Their expectations need to be considered when planning VT projects.

Social demand for training and the actual labour market opportunities often do not match. This applies to both developing and developed labour markets. More inputs are needed to advise applying trainees on market opportunities and trade selection. The challenge is that the VT providers themselves are often not sufficiently informed about labour market demands.

Besides trade skills, graduates need determination, self-initiative, creativity, a sense for responsibility and the ability to tolerate frustration in order to be successful in the market. Developing these core competences needs good trainers. TOT is expensive and the local capacities (with the exception of VTF) do not exist.

The limited or in most cases absence of post training support mechanisms from the TVET institutions for graduates limits the full utilisation of their potential, e. g. especially female graduates underpaid at work places accept their fate and have no voice to speak for them.

Graduates' access to micro credit remains a largely unresolved issue. MFIs hesitate to give loans to young business starters unless they have securities, which the vast majority has not. One option is to initiate saving schemes of graduates, but this is only possible if a VT project closely works with communities.

How important is the counselling in reality? Despite the findings, opinions differ on this issue. Should training providers invest resources in individual counselling? Or should counselling be an integrated task of teachers and instructors? What about female counsellors and methodological training? Depending on which option (individual or group counselling) a more professional approach to counselling could be of greater benefit to trainees.

There is a debate whether vocational training programmes should include or even focus on married women, as they often have a better idea and motivation to learn and work in a trade. According to interviews with female graduates, one of the benefits of skills development seems to lie in their improved chances for marriage. Local experts and resource persons see this as a respectable expectation and viable benefit. Africa is a marriage society: No matter the level a woman attains if she is not married she may not be respected. She may be able to survive it if she is educated or has some form of empowerment to boost her self esteem. For the target group of VT (girls who have dropped out of school/ graduated from the secondary education system) with no form of empowerment marriage is the traditional way towards livelihood security. It is also a condition for girls to be regarded in society. So if this programme improves their chances for marriage, then this should be encouraged.

The alternative is to consider married women in (non-formal) training programmes as an additional target group in order to achieve a greater impact – as for instance practiced by YOW-DAST. This organisation has extended the maximum age for women to 40 years.



## 5 Recommendations

### 5.1 Strategic recommendations

Before making strategic recommendations, the results of this study need to be discussed further with the partners. Partners should make strategic decisions on which target group(s) to focus. A key question for consideration is the appropriateness of the VT models for the different contexts.

If VT is to emphasise on poverty reduction, non-formal VT and improved apprenticeship schemes are more appropriate. VT programmes should continue to place emphasis on females but they should address the employment problems of females in a more integrated and holistic manner. Measures should include gender specific personality building, measures for labour market integration (placement services) and lobbying at the level of employers. Pre-condition is that VT providers cooperate more with the private sector. This recommendation is based on the assumption that males have more training opportunities and better access to on-the-job learning in the informal sector. This may not be the case in some contexts (e.g. in the case of marginalised/ stigmatised male youth, e.g. school drop outs).

Low-cost, community based training solutions are needed to increase the outreach of VT programmes to neglected communities. YOWDAST is an example for a skills training approach suitable for reaching out to remote rural areas. This approach can also be applied by integrated rural development programmes.

### 5.2 Specific recommendations

#### Labour market orientation and selection of trades

Partners need to develop their capacities for conducting simple market surveys and to plan and design training programmes in accordance with labour market demands. Collaboration with private sector should be intensified, as entrepreneurs know best what is needed in the market. Methods should also be developed to involve communities and target groups in the identification of market opportunities.

In many programmes observed it became clear that certain trade areas did not have either the demand or the job relevance, but these trade areas are continuously been taught (e. g. tailoring in Liberia; carpentry in Bo Sierra Leone, etc.). Program managers or their Boards should be able to make decisive choices on trade areas, if the program will continue to maintain its relevance. Tracer studies (see below) should be used as a management tool to monitor the relevance of the training offers.

Partners should expand or broaden building trade areas such that graduates have options to do multiple skills (masonry, carpentry, joinery, electricity, plumbing, etc.) and are therefore not only reliant on a single trade. Single trade as proven in this report, although generating income and employment/ self employment, does not provide a sustainable and adequate in-

come for families. This is also due to the changing needs of the job market, which is predominantly in the informal sector.

Trade diversification is especially important for females. Alongside integration of females in male dominated trade areas (which faces many obstacles in market integration) training providers should place more emphasis on finding new skills areas that are feasible for female employment and income generation. Value addition to agricultural produce is one field that received too little attention. Another is modern fields such as repair of electrical and electronic items including computer maintenance.

### **Integrating agriculture topics in vocational skills development in rural areas**

Agriculture is the main source of livelihood in rural areas. The majority of graduates of rural training centres continue to work in agriculture, often rather by necessity than by choice. Knowing about the limitations of centre based agricultural training the team does not “per se” recommend the revival of agriculture courses, but agriculture related topics could be optional or compulsory “add-ons”. The LOIC experience (Sinje) showed the usefulness of offering special agricultural topics alongside trade skill training which were in demand by the target group (e.g. life stock keeping, vegetable gardening using organic methods etc.). Most important is that such sessions add value to existing knowledge learned in the community and family. Rural training programmes should also include general environmental topics which are of relevance for a specific region (e.g. soil degradation/ conservation, etc.).

### **Vocational orientation and counselling**

More emphasis should be placed on vocational orientation and counselling before an applicant selects a trade. Options are for instance:

- Orientation seminars conducted in schools
- Involvement of youth/communities in market surveying before selecting a trade (see under trade selection)
- Orientation periods prior to skills training where applicants are exposed to different trades (feasible in apprenticeship schemes or larger scale centre based programmes)

Job counselling should be intensified during training (see example OICG)

### **Improving practical orientation and quality of practical training**

Quality and duration of training were two other important factors that stood out for attention. Training was offered in trades that lacked the basic equipment and adequately trained staff. Another critical issue was the adequacy of the duration of courses. Some non-formal courses were shortened so as to meet demand (Sierra Leone, Liberia) but the duration was not sufficient for trainees to adequately learn a trade. To mitigate these shortcomings:

- Course duration should be adequate to the trade/ skill requirements in the labour market
- Courses may be modularised (basic, advanced, specialised)
- National curricula may be used if found adequate

- Existing curricula may have to be revised with the aim of improving practice content and structure in line with findings of market surveys – training providers may need external support for this activity
- Upgrading of instructors in methodologies and practical skills wherever possible

Experience of the VTF supported VTI show that all centre based programmes should have an attachment period of at least 3 months a year at the end of each scholastic year.

### Orientation towards self employment

The majority of graduates are working self-employed either with daily contracts or by running a business. Vocational training thus needs to be more oriented towards self-employment with measures such as:

- Trainees to learn about saving and handling of money in general
- Information about MF possibilities and requirements to access loans
- Stronger focus on personality building,
- Better integration of entrepreneurship training (EST) in practical training (be taught as an integrated subject in each trade)

Apprenticeship schemes which are by nature more oriented towards self-employment should invest more resources and efforts in personality development of women.

Training materials for EST need to be more tailor-made for young business starters. Training content needs to be more context relevant (micro and small business), teaching methods should be more participatory. VTF can be a valuable resource in the region for updating EST materials in collaboration with other specialised national and international institutions and consultants.

### Holistic vocational skills development

Holistic vocational skills training aims at developing the core competences of a person alongside technical/ trade skills (see also the issue of personality development above). Such training programmes are particularly relevant in contexts where young people faced obstacles to access education (war affected countries, poorest of the poor). Thus in some of the programmes literacy and numeracy were introduced as the target groups were including illiterate and semi literate youths and adults. This has been a very relevant measure but there is a need for review of both the content and methodology so that literacy, numeracy curricula are better elaborated and integrated into the vocational skills training.

### Post training support

Post training support for graduates organized by training providers has the potential of increasing the impact of the programme on trainees. This would be in the form of providing job placement, post training guidance and counselling and lobbying for employment promotion with government and private sector. Such support would be of special help in assisting female graduates, many of them very young and lack the experience to stand up to the competitive spirit of the job market, thus making them vulnerable to being exploited by employers.

### Quality management, monitoring and evaluation

Quality assurance of training delivery needs improvement in several institutions/ projects visited. Managers of VT institutions and projects should become more quality conscious and should place more emphasis on monitoring the quality of training delivery.

Tracer studies as a means of outcome monitoring should become a compulsory activity of every vocational training institution or project. The follow up should not be once but sequenced and it should be integrated in the management system of the institution/ project. Tracer studies are only useful if the results are utilised for programme/ project planning and review. Graduates should be aware about tracer studies when leaving the institution. They should leave their contacts for follow up (for further information see manual “tracer studies” in reference list.

Evaluations should include as a compulsory element the assessment of effectiveness and impact. However, this can only be done meaningfully if the institution/ project conducts tracer studies and analyses and documents the results. The boards need to be sensitised on the need to orient VT programmes towards effectiveness and impact.

Partners should be encouraged to do participatory monitoring and evaluation from a gender perspective. Case studies and success stories should be traced and documented properly for reference.

### Networking and collaboration

All partners studied need to intensify their collaboration with the private sector, i.e. with small enterprises for:

- Planning/ review of training programmes
- Organisation of attachments
- Labour market integration, job placement

Another weak point is the collaboration of VT institutions/ projects with Micro Finance Institutions (MFI). As said above, young business starters usually find the doors of MFIs closed. The issue of access to MFI needs to be addressed through lobbying and consultations with the MFI sector.

The OICG experience shows the usefulness of collaboration between a VT project and institutions specialised on health and life skill issues. VT projects and institutions often have shortcomings in recruiting specialised personnel. Systematic collaboration with other agencies is one way to improve quality and relevance of VT programmes and to work in a cost-efficient manner at the same time.

### General recommendations

An over-riding aim of the TVET is to reduce poverty and accordingly target the poor. While it is important to have trainees pay part of their fees, yet it would be good to review the costs to trainees given the economic and social context in each area. The inability to pay fees was a major cause of drop out in a number of programmes.

Partners should seek ways to enhance the involvement of and collaboration with communities.

Formal VTIs follow the scholastic year of educational institutions (9 months training, 3 months break), but the investment in infrastructure is far higher. For better utilisation these institutions should think about adding short term courses and evening courses wherever possible.

Centre based formal VT should focus on urban centres, it is not effective operating formal VTI in rural areas.

VTI and VT projects operating in conflict sensitive environments should proactively take measures to facilitate access of all ethnic and religious groups living in one region. Christian institutions should seek to include Muslims youth (see example YOWDAST).

# Annex

# Annex 1

## Terms of Reference

### Comparative Study and 'Outcome and Impact' Analysis Of Six Vocational Training Projects in West Africa

#### 1 Background of the study

EED evaluation unit in cooperation with the regional desks commissions every year a number of studies on cross cutting issues. The topics may refer to a certain region (group of countries) as well as to certain sectors. The aims of those studies are to find answers to questions that have come up in these projects in the passed years of cooperation and to give orientation for the coming cooperation – for EED as well as for the partner organisations. In some of the studies – like in this one – there is a special focus on finding out about the 'outcome and impact' with the purpose of learning about best practices.

Vocational Training activities form a prominent part of EED's portfolio in West Africa. Those activities are funded in different frameworks: they may be components of larger development programmes of the Churches, they may be embedded into programmes for the reintegration of young people into civil life (after a period of war or conflict), and there are projects that deal with traditional approaches to vocational training in connection with innovative income generation measures with the objective to directly increase the income of the households.

EED has been funding this vocational training work for several decades. The projects have been evaluated individually from time to time. Some of them have maintained tracer records on a permanent or episodic basis. In addition there were several impact studies which were related to vocational training however not addressing it directly (see study on microfinance in 2001, study on education in 2006, and study on peace and conflict related work in 2007). However, none of these initiatives have analysed the outcome and impact of the projects of this sector comprehensively nor have the different approaches been evaluated and compared in a systematic manner. This study is meant for filling the gap.

#### 2 Objective and subject of the study

There are 10 projects in West Africa being funded by the Africa I Desk of EED in the sector of Vocational Training. A rough classification shows that they basically follow one of three main approaches in their work:

1. Formal, school-based vocational education with courses of rather long duration
2. Centre based trainings with short term courses with lots of practical exercise
3. Improved traditional apprenticeship schemes linked with modern need based training inputs for the craftsmen



Along those approaches the following six projects have been requested to participate in the evaluative process:

- Project No 20060208 G/ 2006.7420.0, Ghana, PCG/ VTF, Vocational training for females programme.(1)
- Project No 20070297 G / 2007.7508.0, Ghana, OICG, Livelihood enhancement for youth in the Kumasi metropolis through non-formal training.(3)
- Project No 20050292 G / 2005.7504.3, Nigeria, LCCN/YOWDAST, Non-formal vocational training for females and youth.(3)
- Project No 20060210 G / 2006.7422.6, Nigeria, EYN/MTS, Vocational training for young people in North Eastern Nigeria.(1)
- Project No 20070335 G / 2007.7546.0 KED-EK 51/2007, Sierra Leone, SLOIC, Vocational training and support for young adults in the peace consolidation phase.(2)
- Project No 20070333 G / 2007.7544.5 KED-EK 52/2007, Liberia, LOIC, Non-formal vocational skills training, rehabilitation and resettlement programme.(2)

The study aims at an assessment of the approaches to vocational training in their respective context. The assessment should address common evaluation criteria such as relevance, effectiveness (outcome), efficiency, impact, selection and reaching of target groups. It is expected that the findings of the study will reveal knowledge on the following key questions:

- What happened to the graduates (males/ females) of the vocational training courses? Are there any recognisable trends on how many of them (males/ females) find jobs or regular income through self employment?
- What are the factors that have a key influence on the results of vocational training? Which approaches are adequate for which context and circumstances?
- What can be learned from the indirect effects – intended or unintended - of the vocational training measures and how can the lessons learnt become guiding for future projects?

### 3 Main topics and areas of the study (For each project /approach)

#### 3.1 Context

- Description of the approach of the vocational training project or program and its context
- Situation and problem to which the project responds (labour market, social situation)
- Government policy with regard to vocational training / education
- Concepts of other important players in the country on vocational education

#### 3.2 Relevance

- Objectives of the project/program valid and appropriate?
- Are the selected professional trades relevant? Do they correspond to respective needs?
- Are the needs of males and females adequately considered?

- Do the trades respond to labour market demands?
- Concept of poverty alleviation behind the approach
- Concept of overcoming trauma and violence behind the approach
- Can they have a model function for creating change, e.g. in gender relations, peace building, environmental protection?

### 3.3 Effectiveness (outcome)

- Does the project/ program reach its objectives?
- Do the people who graduated from courses find adequate (self-) employment? What kind of employment? (quantitative analysis)
- Do males and females benefit differently and how? (quantitative analysis)
- Do graduates use their knowledge for generating income? Has the level of income increased?
- Which are the furthering / hindering factors for the generation of income after the completion of training?
- Do the communities of the trainees directly benefit from the project/ program?
- Are there any unexpected effects?
- Is the PME system sufficiently developed for assessing outcome?

### 3.4 Efficiency

- Are the costs of the project/ program appropriate compared to the benefits?
- Does cost consciousness play a part when choosing the approach?
- Is the duration of the courses appropriate /justifiable in the light of its benefits?
- Is the quantity of the trainings offered corresponding with the demands?
- What is the cost of a training measure per person?
- How much is the training fee compared to the overall cost of the course?
- When compared to other initiatives working with a similar approach are the costs higher or lower?

### 3.5 Selection and reaching of target groups

- Who has access to the training program?
- What are the criteria for the selection of participants (a.o. gender, age, refugee status)?
- Does the training reach the poorest or – for some reasons – the less poor?
- Are handicapped people and people faced with HIV/Aids infection specially considered?
- How does the project deal with participants getting pregnant during the duration of the training?

- Do “do-no-harm” considerations play a part in the selection of the target group?
- Do communities participate in the development of selection criteria?
- Which other groups have a say in defining the criteria of selection?

### 3.6 Quality

- Does the project/ program make use of contacts with the local economy?
- Does the project/ program systematically analyse the labour market and does it make use of that information?
- Do the curricula adhere to the national Vocational Education system?
- Are there interfaces to other services in the country such as microfinance schemes, employment schemes, job placement?
- Are women and men equally represented among the trainers? Does gender balance with the staff selection form quality criteria?
- How are the trainers qualified (technically, pedagogically, business wise)?

### 3.7 Impact

- Is the benefit for the target groups sustainable?
- Do other people but the participants benefit indirectly from the project/ program?
- Are there – positive or negative – changes with regard to gender relations due to the vocational training activities?
- Are there changes towards peace and reconciliation due to the vocational training activities?
- What other changes can be observed in the environment (economy, society) of the project/ program and in how far can they be attributed to the vocational training activities?
- Has the project/ program contributed to poverty reduction in the region?
- Has the project/ program enhanced gender justice in its environment?
- Is the PME system of the partner organisation sufficiently developed for assessing impact?

## 4 Comparative analysis of the approaches

How do the three main approaches to vocational training – formal, non-formal, and improved traditional apprenticeship – differ from each other with regard to

- demand from trainees
- satisfaction of trainees
- drop out rates
- effectiveness (in terms of employment and income generation)

- efficiency (cost-benefit-ratio)
- long-term change?

Which conclusions can be drawn from this?

## 5 Time plan

### August 2008

- Drafting of ToR and receiving feedback from EED colleagues and partners
- Application for the financing of the study within EED

### September 2008

- After approval: Team meeting in EED for discussion of the ToR and adjustments if needed
- Contracting the evaluators

### October 2008

- Desk studies
- Identification of need for tracer studies
- Inception Report
- Starting of tracer studies and self evaluation (pre- assessments) with the partner organisations

### November 2008

- Tracer studies and self evaluation with the partner organisations

### December 2008

- Analysis of the results of the pre-assessments
- Building of hypotheses for the study
- Coordination meeting of the evaluation team

### January 2009

- Studies at the project places with involvement of the partner organisations

### February 2009

- Individual reports; receiving feedback from partner organisations involved
- Acceptance of the reports by EED evaluation unit

### March 2009

- Submission of synthesis report to EED

## 6 Products / Reports

The evaluators are expected to produce the following:

- **Inception Report / Design of the Evaluation**

The inception report (2 to 4 pages) reflects on how the evaluation team intends to fulfil the ToR. It informs about the methodology, working plan and division of tasks within the team. It points out problems and risks also that might jeopardize the achievement of the objectives of the study. In case the inception report suggests changes to the ToR they need prior consent by the EED evaluation unit.

- **Individual Reports**

Individual reports should be submitted to EED for each partner organisation. Language should be English. They should cover the items 3.1 to 3.7 of the ToR and comprise approx. 20 pages. Before finalization the reports will be sent to the partner organisations for comments and consent.

- **Synthesis Report**

The final report synthesizes the results of the individual reports and puts them in the context of common key topics. Focus areas of the report are: comparison of the different approaches to Vocational Training and 'outcome and impact' ('Wirkungen' in German).

The report should be submitted in English and not exceed 40 to 50 pages; reference documents should be put as annexes. The evaluators are asked to put a structure of contents, a list of abbreviations, a summary (approx. four pages) that contains the most important findings and recommendations and can be used as a separate document.

The report may be structured along the questions of the ToR but also differ from it. However, the results of the study should comprise the complete set of questions in the ToR. The evaluators are requested to value the results and draw conclusions from them. The recommendations should be based on those conclusions.

- **Presentation and finalization of the synthesis report**

At the draft stage the synthesis report (basic findings, conclusions and recommendations) is submitted to a technical audience in EED for feedback and learning purposes. After that an in depth discussion of the report takes place with the involved staff in EED. On the basis of the comments and suggestions the report will be finalized and submitted to EED.

## 7 Profile of the evaluators

- Experience from evaluations in similar contexts
- Experience from consultancies
- Gender competence
- Special knowledge of Vocational Training
- Special knowledge on outcome and impact assessment
- Understanding for the development work of the Churches and Church based organisations

# Annex 2

## Study Itinerary

<b>Date</b>	<b>Activity</b>
September 2008	Review of Terms of Reference with pre-selected consultants
October 2008	Commissioning of the study by EED Contacts made with partners Review of reports Decision on tracer study Preparation of tracer study guideline and tools
November 2008	Selection of national consultants Communication with partners and consultants on tracer study, review of tools
December 2008	Tracer study conducted in LOIC, OICG and VTF, postponement of tracer studies in Nigeria because of insecurity, postponement of main study to 2 <sup>nd</sup> quarter 2009
January –Feb. 2009	Tracer study conducted by MTS, YOWDAST and SLOIC Data compilation at FAKT
March 2009	Discussion of preliminary tracer study results at EED Tracer study review workshops in Ghana (VTF, OICG)
Mid April – Mid June 2009	Main study (for itinerary see case study reports)
Mid June – Mid July 2009	Analysis of case study results and drafting of case study reports
Mid July –Mid August 2009	Drafting of synthesis report

## Annex 3

### Resources and internet links

Six case studies of the comparative study:

- Liberia Opportunities Industrialisation Centres Sinje and Gbanga
- Sierra Leone Opportunities Industrialisation Centres Bo and Matru Jong
- Opportunities Industrialisation Centre Ghana, Livelihood Enhancement Project for Youth in the Kumasi Metropolis
- Vocational Training Programme for Females, Ghana
- Mason Technical School, Garkida, Nigeria
- Youth and Women Development Association for Social Transformation (YOWDAST), Ganye, Nigeria

Promoting livelihood and employment in post conflict situations, FAKT/EED, 2007.

Skills Development in Sub-Saharan Africa, World Bank, 2004.

ADEA, Technical and vocational skills development in Africa, Workshop paper 2008

<http://www.adeanet.org/adeaPortal/adea/Biennale%202008/Documentation/Papers%20for%200presentation/02.%20Session%202/Final%20PDF%20documents/Session%202%20Doc%204%20OECD%20AfDB%20ENG.pdf>

OECD Economic Development in Africa, 2008

<http://www.oecd.org/dataoecd/14/35/40573969.pdf>

Manual Tracer Studies, FAKT 2001

<http://www.fakt-consult.de>

**OIC International** with information of its affiliates LOIC, SLOIC and OICG

<http://www.oicinternational.org/index.php?page=liberia-oic>

**UN World Population Prospects**

<http://esa.un.org/unpp/>



**Republic of Sierra Leone Population Census:**

<http://www.statistics.sl/2004%20Pop.%20&%20Hou.%20Census%20Analytical%20Reports/2004%20Census%20Report%20on%20Population%20Size%20Age%20and%20Sex%20Structure.pdf>

<http://www.statistics.sl/2004%20Pop.%20&%20Hou.%20Census%20Analytical%20Reports/2004%20Population%20and%20Housing%20Census%20Report%20on%20Education%20and%20Literacy.pdf>









Evangelischer Entwicklungsdienst e.V. (EED)  
Ulrich-von-Hassell-Str. 76  
53123 Bonn

Telefon: +49 (0)228 8101-0  
E-Mail: [eed@eed.de](mailto:eed@eed.de)  
[www.eed.de](http://www.eed.de)